

# Journal of the Canadian Historical Association Revue de la Société historique du Canada



## Science and Sentiment: Social Service and Gender at the University of Toronto, 1888-1910

Sara Z. Burke

Volume 4, numéro 1, 1993

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/031057ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/031057ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

### Éditeur(s)

The Canadian Historical Association/La Société historique du Canada

### ISSN

0847-4478 (imprimé)

1712-6274 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

### Citer cet article

Burke, S. Z. (1993). Science and Sentiment: Social Service and Gender at the University of Toronto, 1888-1910. *Journal of the Canadian Historical Association / Revue de la Société historique du Canada*, 4(1), 75–93.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/031057ar>

### Résumé de l'article

À partir d'une étude des formes de la pensée sociale des membres de l'Université de Toronto entre 1888 et 1910, cet article montre que, face à la pauvreté urbaine, la réponse initiale de l'Université fut modelée par des préjugés provenant de l'idéalisme et de l'empirisme britanniques. En dépit du fait que plusieurs femmes de l'institution partageaient le nouvel intérêt pour le travail social professionnel, les valeurs dominantes de l'Université continuèrent de charrier l'idée que la responsabilité du travail social moderne incomrait aux jeunes hommes instruits, leur sexe et leur classe les habilitant, croyait-on, à régler les problèmes de la ville. La présente étude avance qu'au cours de cette période, la construction des rapports sociaux de sexe au sein du service social s'effectua de manière à séparer les activités réformistes des hommes et des femmes si bien que, dès 1910, les femmes inscrites premier cycle universitaire ne purent participer à la création de l'*University Settlement*, l'agence sociale officiellement sanctionnée par l'institution.

# Science and Sentiment: Social Service and Gender at the University of Toronto, 1888-1910

SARA Z. BURKE

## Résumé

*By examining forms of social thought articulated by members of the University of Toronto between 1888 and 1910, this paper argues that the University's first response to urban poverty was shaped by a combination of assumptions derived from British idealism and empiricism. Although many women at Toronto were pursuing a new interest in professional social work, the University's dominant assumptions conveyed the view that social service was the particular responsibility of educated young men, who were believed to be uniquely suited by their gender and class to address the problems of the city. This study maintains that during this period the construction of gender roles in social service segregated the reform activities of men and women on campus, and, by 1910, had the effect of excluding female undergraduates from participating in the creation of University Settlement, the social agency officially sanctioned by their University.*

\* \* \* \*

*À partir d'une étude des formes de la pensée sociale des membres de l'Université de Toronto entre 1888 et 1910, cet article montre que, face à le pauvreté urbaine, la réponse initiale de l'Université fut modelée par des préjugés provenant de l'idéalisme et de l'empirisme britanniques. En dépit du fait que plusieurs femmes de l'institution partageaient le nouvel intérêt pour le travail social professionnel, les valeurs dominantes de l'Université continuèrent de charrier l'idée que la responsabilité du travail social moderne incombait aux jeunes hommes instruits, leur sexe et leur classe les habilitant, croyait-on, à régler les problèmes de la ville. La présente étude avance qu'au cours de cette période, la construction des rapports sociaux de sexe au sein du service social s'effectua de manière à séparer les activités réformistes des hommes et des femmes si bien que, dès 1910, les femmes inscrites premier cycle universitaire ne purent participer à la création de l'University Settlement, l'agence sociale officiellement sanctionnée par l'institution.*

The establishment of University Settlement in the summer of 1910, in one of Toronto's impoverished manufacturing districts, was the University of Toronto's first official response to the social problems of the city beyond its grounds. James Mavor, head of the

---

I wish to thank A.B. McKillop and Deborah Gorham for their comments on earlier drafts of this paper, and would like to acknowledge the financial support of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

Department of Political Economy at the University, had completed a survey among wage earners in Toronto four years before, and had concluded at that time that many of these families lived on the very edge of poverty. That there was widespread destitution in parts of Toronto, however, was not forced into public consciousness until the winter of 1907-08, when the city underwent a severe unemployment crisis which its system of private charities could not alleviate.<sup>1</sup>

Further investigations following the crisis confirmed and supplemented Mavor's findings. In 1909 the Methodist Church sent a group of Victoria College students to make a door-to-door survey of the downtown wards, and the extreme conditions which they found were reported subsequently by an alarmed *Christian Guardian*. In 1911 a Civic Guild Committee on working-class housing was formed, chaired by another Toronto faculty member, E. J. Kylie, and in the same year a bleakly comprehensive study of the city's slums was released by the Medical Health Officer, Charles J. Hastings.<sup>2</sup> In the years before the outbreak of the First World War, then, a new awareness of urban poverty had sparked a flurry of reform activity, and for this reason historians have credited the period with accelerating the growth of Toronto's public welfare structure and the development of professional social work in the city.<sup>3</sup>

While the creation of University Settlement can be seen in the broader context of the city's welfare history, this study is concerned with the way in which particular currents of social thought became dominant among faculty, students, and alumni between 1888 and 1910, and how these ideas ultimately determined the University of Toronto's first formal reaction to the problems of urban poverty. Furthermore, the fact that the University decided to take social action in the manner it did raises several questions concerning gender which are central to this paper. For University Settlement initially opened as an entirely masculine enterprise operated by a male resident staff (which included a Methodist minister, a medical student, and an undergraduate football star) and was intended to provide male students from the University with a forum for volunteer social service. Its activities, moreover, consisted mainly of football and gymnasium classes conducted by popular Varsity athletes, and were designed to exert a manly influence on the large number of neighbourhood boys who, it was assumed, would otherwise be amusing themselves in the streets. "The influence of a leader in good clean sport . . .

- 
1. Michael J. Piva, *The Condition of the Working Class in Toronto, 1900-1921* (Ottawa, 1979), 72-73.
  2. Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library, James Mavor Papers, MS. COLL. 119, box 70, special subjects: living conditions in Toronto, 1897-1906; "In the Slums of 'Toronto the Good,'" *The Christian Guardian* LXXX, No. 21 (26 May 1909): 3; University of Toronto Archives (UTA), Department of Graduate Records, A73-0026/212(15), Edward Joseph Kylie; City of Toronto Archives, Reports, RG 001, box 002, *Report of the Medical Health Officer Dealing with the Recent Investigation of Slum Conditions in Toronto*, 1911.
  3. James Pitsula, "The Emergence of Social Work in Toronto," and Paul Adolphus Bator, "'The Struggle to Raise the Lower Classes': Public Health Reform and the Problem of Poverty in Toronto, 1910 to 1921," both in *Journal of Canadian Studies* XIV, No. 1 (Spring 1979): 35-49.

contributed quite perceptibly to the moral upbuilding of these boys' lives," the alumni magazine, *University of Toronto Monthly*, noted approvingly in 1911; "It is remarkable what an inspiration such a college man really is to them."<sup>4</sup> During the first year of the Settlement's program women from the University were given no opportunity to participate either as resident staff members or as volunteers, and no classes were organized for the girls or women from the district — an exclusion that seems puzzling in light of the fact that by 1910 settlement houses in Britain and the United States had become closely identified with the new and female-dominated profession of social work.<sup>5</sup> Moreover, women's organizations at the University of Toronto were aware of developments in American social work, and had been showing a growing interest in the settlement movement since the turn of the century. Why, then, as it turned to help the community, was the University's first response to create a social service agency requiring the participation of male undergraduates but which ignored the concerns of female students? Why did social service become defined as a masculine venture at the University of Toronto at precisely the same time that social work was gaining momentum in Canada as a distinctly female profession?

It is the central assertion of this paper that between 1888 and 1910 gender roles in social service at the University were in an ongoing process of ideological construction, and that two competing interpretations of service developed which segregated and placed in contention the reform interests of men and women.<sup>6</sup> Although the University did not deliberately restrict women from taking part, by 1910 a powerful section of the academic community had adopted a view which portrayed social service as an activity best suited to university-educated men who, it was believed, possessed skills in research and civic leadership that were uniquely masculine.

Indeed, this study will argue that from the establishment of the first Chair of Political Economy in 1888, empirical research at Toronto was linked to the moral values of ethical idealism; and the resulting mixture of assumptions gradually shaped a dominant interpretation of social service in direct conflict with the idea of professional social work that had begun to attract University women. The growing strength of the idealist and empirical approach in the University will be traced in the writings and public speeches

- 
4. National Archives of Canada (NA), John Joseph Kelso Papers, MG 30, C 97, vol. 6, file: Social Settlements, pamphlet: *The University Settlement, 1910-1911: Telling of the Opening up of the Settlement with Plans for the Winter Sessions*; "The University Settlement," *University of Toronto Monthly (UTM)* XI, No. 4 (February 1911): 115.
  5. Martha Vicinus, "Settlement Houses: A Community Ideal for the Poor," in *Independent Women: Work and Community for Single Women, 1850-1920* (Chicago, 1985), 211-46; James Leiby, *A History of Social Welfare and Social Work in the United States* (New York, 1978), 127-35.
  6. For discussions of the representation of gender as a continually negotiated or contested social construction, see Mary Poovey, *Uneven Developments: The Ideological Work of Gender in Mid-Victorian England* (Chicago, 1988), 1-23; and Joan Wallach Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York, 1988), 1-11.

of a group of like-minded male faculty members who shared an inherently masculine vision of social reform and specifically encouraged male undergraduates to turn their attention to the problems of the city.

Their efforts were reinforced by the new University President after 1907, Robert A. Falconer, who played a crucial role in the process of translating ideology into social action. His public lectures preached a popularized form of idealist and empirical beliefs, presenting the settlement idea as the perfect outlet for both scientific training and humanitarian feeling — or “science and sentiment” as he reportedly told students at Victoria College in 1910<sup>7</sup> — and it was his compelling exhortation to seek the “highest good” through service which finally united male students behind the support of University Settlement.

By the end of the nineteenth century, women at Toronto were showing an interest in forms of social service which went beyond the strictly evangelical focus of the University’s previous involvement in charitable work. Until this time, the philanthropic efforts of both male and female students had been largely confined to the city mission work of the University Young Men’s and Young Women’s Christian Associations. Although the YMCA had existed on campus since 1873, it branched out into mission work only in the late 1880s, but had limited its endeavours to weekly visits to the Newsboys’ Home and the General Hospital. This work reflected the evangelical perspective of the Association’s membership, and as a result the program had stressed the need for spiritual upliftment and entertainment rather than attempts to ease the physical conditions of poverty.<sup>8</sup>

The student YWCA, formed on campus in 1887, was similarly preoccupied with “developing Christian character among its members,” and while it gradually began to undertake extension work in the city its members also tended to direct their attention toward questions of individual sin and redemption.<sup>9</sup> After 1900, however, other University women’s groups began to seek a more direct approach to the solution of social problems than that offered by the YWCA, and during the following decade they became increasingly influenced by the goals of the American settlement movement; goals which elevated the social needs of a neighbourhood over the spiritual welfare of its individual

---

7. UTA, Office of the Registrar, A73-0051/244(06), file: Settlement Work 1910-1942, clipping: *Toronto Mail*, 22 March 1910.

8. UTA, Student Christian Movement, B79-0059/002, YMCA Executive Minutes, 1871-1891; UTA, Pamphlets: *University of Toronto YMCA, Annual Report, 1890-1891*; UTA, Student Christian Movement, B79-0059/008, YMCA Annual Reports, 1907-1910.

9. *Torontonensis*, IV (1902): 205; United Church/Victoria University Archives (UCA), YWCA, 90.135V, box 1, file 1, Victoria College YWCA Minutes, 1895-1905. For a study of the Canadian student YWCAs and social service, see Diana Pedersen, “‘The Call to Service’: The YWCA and the Canadian College Woman, 1886-1920,” in *Youth, University and Canadian Society: Essays in the Social History of Higher Education*, ed. Paul Axelrod and John G. Reid (Kingston, Ontario, 1989), 200.

inhabitants and, more importantly, gave priority to the work of the committed professional over that of the casual volunteer.

The American movement was then undergoing a period of rapid growth, expanding from six settlements in 1891 to over one hundred by the turn of the century. Residential life in a settlement house proved to be particularly appealing to many female college graduates who sought an independent life away from home, but who wished at the same time to preserve the sense of community they had experienced at university. The role of the settlement worker, as articulated by such pioneers as Jane Addams and Lillian D. Wald, was to act as a mediator in the process of democracy, both by educating the residents of a neighbourhood in democratic principles, and by defending the rights of those residents as citizens in the larger political process.<sup>10</sup>

“So far as a Settlement can discern and bring to local consciousness neighborhood needs which are common needs, and can give vigorous help to the municipal measures through which such needs shall be met,” Jane Addams wrote in *Twenty Years at Hull-House*, “it fulfils its most valuable function.” As a neighbourhood centre, a settlement was meant to facilitate contact between its educated middle-class residents and the predominantly “foreign” population of its district, and by doing so, to break down the barriers thrown up by class and ethnicity. For Addams and Wald, the key aspect of a settlement’s program was the organization of self-governing social clubs, in which a worker could gain an immediate knowledge of the concerns of the neighbourhood, while at the same time communicating to new Americans the ideals of democracy.<sup>11</sup>

The first references to the settlement movement in University of Toronto publications appeared in the late 1890s. In sharp contrast to those written after 1908, they discussed American rather than British settlement houses, and emphasized the work of women as well as that of men. In October 1897, for example, the Victoria College students’ journal, *Acta Victoriana*, published a short unsigned article reporting on the involvement of “many women undergraduates and alumnae” in college-affiliated settlements in the larger cities of the United States. University settlements, the article claimed, “partake of the nature of club-rooms, and are equipped with reading-rooms and other facilities for the working-classes to improve the intellectual part of their being and to broaden their ideas of life.”<sup>12</sup> Two years later, *Acta Victoriana* printed another, and longer, article on the American movement in which Canadian social reformer and

- 
10. Allen F. Davis, *Spearheads for Reform: the Social Settlements and the Progressive Movement, 1890-1914* (New York, 1967), 12; Ellen Fitzpatrick, *Endless Crusade: Women Social Scientists and Progressive Reform* (New York, 1990), 10; Mary Jo Deegan, *Jane Addams and the Men of the Chicago School, 1892-1918* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1988), 33-54. For a recent revisionist study, see Ruth Hutchinson Crocker, *Social Work and Social Order: The Settlement Movement in Two Industrial Cities, 1889-1930* (Chicago, 1992).
  11. Jane Addams, *Twenty Years At Hull-House* (New York, 1910; 1951), 225, 239-56; Lillian D. Wald, *The House on Henry Street* (New York, 1915), v-vi, 179-83.
  12. “University Settlement Movement,” *Acta Victoriana* (AV) XXI, No. 1 (October 1897): 4-5.

feminist Alice Chown expressed her reservations about the suitability of settlement houses for Canadian conditions but nevertheless offered up an approving description of American settlement work that was essentially faithful to the teachings of Jane Addams. Chown explained that settlement workers took up residence in congested districts of large cities in order to create “a social centre for the neighborhood.” “Their residence becomes the meeting-place,” she wrote, “where neighbors learn to know each other, and are encouraged to co-operate in establishing clubs and classes for their own culture, or for the betterment of the community.”<sup>13</sup>

Based on their knowledge of the American movement, and under the leadership of the University College Alumnae Association, during the early 1900s Toronto women themselves explored the possibility of undertaking settlement work in the city. From the time of its inception in November 1898, one of the primary concerns of the Alumnae Association was to help female graduates find suitable jobs, and the organization’s initial interest in settlement work seems to have been sparked by this consideration. An Occupations Committee was immediately set up to inquire into careers which might be open to university-educated women and, by 1900, the Committee was collecting information on those jobs it considered to be better paid and “more congenial” alternatives to teaching.

The Executive of the Alumnae Association first decided to gather details on settlements in June 1900, when it appointed two members to join a sub-committee organized by the Local Council of Women to investigate settlement work among “factory girls.” The subject was again explored thoroughly at the Alumnae Association’s next annual meeting, held in April 1901, at which the speaker gave an address that, like Alice Chown’s article, portrayed American settlement houses as residential neighbourhood centres designed to promote social contact. “[T]he work is going on in many large cities,” the minutes recorded, “and largely with the same leading principle through all, that of being neighborly and leading the poor and ignorant to better things not by trying to preach doctrines but by living a life that is higher than theirs but among them[.]” In an enthusiastic discussion after the address, members contemplated starting settlement work in Toronto, and suggested asking the Ontario Medical College for Women to join them.<sup>14</sup>

Although this plan did not materialize, women at the University were soon given a genuine opportunity for social service when Toronto’s first settlement, Evangelia House, was opened in 1902 by an American settlement worker, Sara Libby Carson. Located in the eastern part of the city, Evangelia House originally functioned as a centre for the young factory women of its neighbourhood, and in its early years was known informally as the “Young Women’s Settlement.” It gradually began to organize more activities for

---

13. Alice A. Chown, “The Social Settlement Movement,” *AV XXIII*, No. 3 (December 1899): 208.

14. UTA, University College, A69-0011/013, Alumnae Association of University College, Annual Minutes, 1898-1928, (20 April 1900 and 12 April 1901); UTA, University College, A69-0011/014, Alumnae Association of University College, General and Executive Minutes, 1898-1927, (20 April and 2 June 1900).

children, however, and later became the first agency in Toronto to provide a supervised playground and nursery school.

Few records of Evangelia House remain, yet it seems that Sara Libby Carson modeled her first Canadian settlement on such established American institutions as Jane Addams' Hull-House in Chicago, or Lillian Wald's Henry Street Settlement in New York.<sup>15</sup> Carson had attended Wellesley College in Massachusetts, and later exhibited the commitment to social activism that was characteristic of her fellow graduates. In 1897 she founded a settlement, Christadora House, in a section of New York largely populated by recent immigrants, and this experience, together with her college affiliation, connected her to a network of active social workers and reformers in the United States.<sup>16</sup> Thus, although Carson also had links to evangelical groups — she held positions in the National YWCA in both America and Canada, and after 1912 was employed by the Board of Social Service and Evangelism of the Presbyterian Church in Canada — she approached her work from the perspective of the American social settlement movement and, like Addams and Wald, valued self-governing social clubs both as training in democracy and as the settlement worker's primary opportunity for contact and instruction. Under her influence, Evangelia's program was structured around the formation of clubs guided by residents and volunteers, and by 1913 the settlement was conducting a variety of daytime and evening self-governing clubs for both children and mothers.<sup>17</sup>

In the years after 1902 Carson recruited support for Evangelia House by addressing female organizations on campus, including the Victoria College YWCA and the University College Alumnae Association. In December 1904, for example, a wide appeal for volunteers was made to undergraduate women through the student newspaper, *The Varsity*, which devoted one of its "College Girl" columns to a description of the work of Evangelia House. (The extent to which social service at this point had become defined as a women's field is indicated by the fact that *The Varsity* article assumed a settlement was by its very nature a female institution, operated by and for women.) That same year the staff of Evangelia House proposed that closer contacts be made with University women by forming chapters of the settlement which would contribute financially, elect members to sit on its Council, and send junior members into short-term residence. By 1910, chapters of Evangelia House had been set up by the Alumnae Association, the

- 
15. "The College Girl," *The Varsity* XXIV, No. 8 (1 December 1904): 131; Metropolitan Toronto Central Library, Baldwin Room, S54, Mary Jennison, "A History of Canadian Settlements," TMs [photocopy], 1965.
  16. Patricia A. Palmieri, "Here was Fellowship: A Social Portrait of Academic Women at Wellesley College, 1895-1920," in *Women Who Taught: Perspectives on the History of Women and Teaching*, ed. Alison Prentice and Marjorie R. Theobald (Toronto, 1991), 246; "Sara Libby Carson," *Social Welfare*, XI, No. 5 (February 1929): 113.
  17. UTA, Dorothy W. Eddis, B76-1037, University of Toronto, Department of Social Service, Annual Examination in Community Work, by Sara Libby Carson, 1916; UTA, Office of the President (Falconer), A67-0007/028, file: Evangelia Settlement 1913, "Summary of Ten Months Work from 1st January to 1st November, 1913.



Women's Literary Society, the women of Victoria College, and the female undergraduates of Trinity housed at St. Hilda's College.<sup>18</sup>

Carson herself had meanwhile turned her attention to other projects, and the settlement had been placed under the direction of a graduate of Trinity College, Edith C. Elwood. In an interview years later, one former St. Hilda's resident remembered Evangelia House as an integral part of college life during this period, a time when, through Elwood's influence, it became a "college custom" for St. Hilda's students to go to the settlement once a week to help with its clubs.<sup>19</sup> Although positions for women in settlement work remained limited until the expansion of the movement throughout Toronto after 1911, the Alumnae Association's original interest in its employment potential was justified at least to some extent. By 1904, two of the five permanent staff at Evangelia House were graduates of the University, and in 1906 the Alumnae Association included these statistics on settlement work (along with those on such other occupations as journalism, business, and the civil service) in its annual report on jobs taken by women graduates.<sup>20</sup>

When the male-oriented University Settlement was founded at the end of the decade, therefore, Evangelia House had already contracted a working relationship with the University of Toronto through several women's colleges and societies on campus. But unlike University Settlement, Evangelia was at no point officially connected to the University, and the volunteer settlement work of female students and graduates received little publicity or support from the wider academic community — largely because, this paper argues, they challenged an interpretation of social service which had gained increasing authority at the University after 1907.

As we have seen, the settlement work undertaken by University women at Evangelia House was defined by the priorities of the American settlement movement, and was associated with the emerging field of professional social work. By contrast, the view of social service which acquired most popularity in University circles had its origins in the British idealist ethic which emanated from Oxford's Balliol College in the late-nineteenth century. This ethic projected a vision of service which was socially elite, voluntaristic, and masculine — a vision which, in 1884, had inspired the creation of the original university settlement in London's East End, Toynbee Hall. At the University of Toronto,

- 
18. UCA, YWCA, 90.135V, box 1, file 1, Victoria College YWCA Minutes, 1895-1905, (13 March 1902); UTA, University College, A69-0011/014, Alumnae Association of University College, General and Executive Minutes, 1898-1927, (29 November 1902, 5 November 1904 and 11 February 1905); "The College Girl," *The Varsity* XXIV, No. 8 (1 December 1904): 131; Metropolitan Toronto Central Library, Baldwin Room, S54, Mary Jennison, "A History of Canadian Settlements," TMs [photocopy], 1965.
19. UTA, Mossie May Waddington Kirkwood, B74-0020, interview by Elizabeth Wilson, 27 March 1973, transcript, University of Toronto Oral History Project, 56-58.
20. UTA, Waddell Family, B73-0028/001, pamphlet: *Eighth Annual Report of the Alumnae Association of University College, Toronto, 1905-1906*, 6.

the extensive acceptance of idealist beliefs, combined with confidence in the empirical method, determined that once the University decided to take social action it would do so by emulating the then famous efforts of Oxford University. In short, the establishment of Toronto's University Settlement in 1910 was a belated attempt to imitate Toynbee Hall, and as such implied a rejection of female-dominated social work.

Toynbee Hall's roots lay in the strong tradition of public service which had developed at Oxford by the late 1870s, and was epitomized by the earnest high-minded young men coming out of Balliol College. The appearance of a distinct Balliol ethos was mainly due to the influence of the College's Master, Benjamin Jowett, and to the teaching of its prominent tutor, the idealist philosopher T. H. Green. For Jowett and Green, the purpose of a university was to instil into undergraduates a sense of duty and purpose and, by doing so, to train them to take a leading role in the future of their country. At a time when the evangelical faith of many students was being challenged by scientific research and biblical criticism, Green offered an alternative Christian theology, based on idealist metaphysics, which stressed the importance of an outward demonstration of good works over an inner search for salvation. He taught that it was every man's primary obligation to foster his "higher self" through service to others, and that the reintegration of community could only be brought about by the formation of bonds of personal connection between those who were advantaged in society and those in need. Only by realizing this higher self could a man communicate with God, the God which, Green believed, was immanent within all men. Through both his teaching and his personal example, he asserted the importance of citizenship in maintaining an integrated community, and the necessity for men of the educated classes to combat such disintegrating forces as poverty and ignorance.<sup>21</sup>

The Balliol ethic was directed ultimately at social and political reformation, and the principal intellectuals of the College — Jowett, Green, and the historical economist Arnold Toynbee — were all preoccupied, in the words of one contemporary, "with the need of leading 'a useful life.'"<sup>22</sup> As one of Green's students at Balliol, and later as a College tutor and a public lecturer, Toynbee was best able to articulate the complex mixture of moral certitude and self-negation which lay at the centre of the Balliol ethic and the reform movement it produced. "We students, we would help you if we could," he told a working-class London audience shortly before his early death in 1883. "We are willing to give up the life we care for, the life with books and with those we love."<sup>23</sup> The founding of the first settlement, Toynbee Hall, in the London slum district of Whitechapel in 1884 was in the most direct sense an effort to put the idealist impulse into practice.

- 
21. Standish Meacham, *Toynbee Hall and Social Reform, 1880-1914: The Search for Community* (New Haven, 1987), 1-23; Melvin Richter, *The Politics of Conscience: T.H. Green and His Age* (London, 1964), 19-30; Andrew Vincent and Raymond Plant, *Philosophy, Politics and Citizenship: The Life and Thought of the British Idealists* (Oxford, 1984), 94.
  22. Mrs. Humphry Ward, *A Writer's Recollections* (London, 1918), 133.
  23. Arnold Toynbee, "'Progress and Poverty': a Criticism of Mr. Henry George," quoted in Beatrice Webb, *My Apprenticeship* (New York, 1926), 177.

The founding of Toynbee Hall also marked a break with the past. Since the 1860s, charitable work in London's East End had been carried out mainly by middle-class women, volunteering their time to act as rent collectors for the housing reformer Octavia Hill, or as visitors for the Charity Organization Society.<sup>24</sup> The Balliol ethic, however, conveyed a definition of masculinity in which active citizenship and service became the highest expressions of manliness, and it assumed that the future of Britain depended on the unselfish dedication of educated, middle-class men who, by virtue of their class and gender, would automatically take up key positions in public life. The most vital element of the original settlement idea, in fact, was the belief that the problems of poverty needed to be addressed by men rather than women for the simple reason that reform efforts would remain marginalized until slum conditions could be brought to the attention of those (males) destined to hold economic and political power. "If men, cultivated young thinking men, could only know of those things," wrote Henrietta Barnett, one of the founders of the settlement, "they would be altered[.]"<sup>25</sup>

As it was, male students from Oxford had started "settling" in the East End in the late 1870s, gathering around Henrietta and Samuel Barnett, who lived and worked in the most destitute parish in the Whitechapel area. Like Green and Toynbee, believed that only male university graduates could bring the influence of their class to bear on social problems and provide the civic leadership necessary to achieve local reforms and alleviate the cultural poverty of the slums.

Named first Warden of Toynbee Hall, and dedicated to fulfilling the mission identified by Green and Toynbee, Samuel Barnett insisted that men alone be admitted as residents, so that with the exception of Henrietta the settlement remained an exclusively masculine community. It flourished throughout the late 1880s and 1890s as a kind of residential college in the East End, where successive generations of young university men gave lectures on literature and philosophy, or served on the local poor law board, before going on to pursue their careers in civil service, religion, politics, or law.

As settlement houses spread throughout Britain, however, women seeking professional training in social work began to outnumber the kind of "young thinking men" attracted to Toynbee Hall,<sup>26</sup> a development which, in Samuel Barnett's view, threatened the usefulness of the movement in the most fundamental way by possibly discouraging the involvement of those who moved in the masculine world of politics. In 1897, for example, he complained to his brother that a meeting of settlement workers ("a striking lot over whom the Toynbee Hall men towered") had included a large number of

- 
24. For a discussion of the work of Octavia Hill and the Charity Organization Society, see Jane Lewis, *Women and Social Action in Victorian and Edwardian England* (Aldershot, England, 1991), 24-82.
  25. Henrietta O. Barnett, "The Beginnings of Toynbee Hall," quoted in *Canon Barnett: His Life, Work, and Friends*, by Henrietta O. Barnett (London, 1918), vol. 1, 302.
  26. *Monthly Calendar*, *Toynbee Record* (1888-1906); Meacham, 47; Vincent and Plant, 147; Vicinus, 215-18.

women. “The women were many — too many, I think, for the movement,” he wrote.<sup>27</sup> Henrietta Barnett later explained her husband’s comment: “[T]he novelty of Toynbee was not so much that men lived among the poor, but that young and brilliant men had chosen to serve them in ways based on thought. It was the fear that men, still shy in their new role, would retire if the movement was captured by women that made Canon Barnett anxious to keep the Settlement movement primarily for men.”<sup>28</sup>

The masculine ethic which had inspired Toynbee Hall was imported to the University of Toronto in 1888 when W.J. Ashley was appointed its first Chair in Political Economy. Already there were perceptions that the University could perform a much broader public role (and, as at Oxford, expectations that its male students would be the future leaders in their country’s economic and political life); and it was hoped that the new Department of Political Economy in particular would both prepare young men for these positions and establish important contacts between academia and the worlds of business and politics.<sup>29</sup>

Himself an undergraduate at Balliol between 1878 and 1881, when T.H. Green’s influence had been so strong, Ashley had been drawn to the new inductive and historical school of economics and was a devoted student and disciple of Toynbee, whose *Industrial Revolution* he had helped to edit and publish in 1884.<sup>30</sup> Like his mentor, Ashley combined the empirical study of political economy with the moral conviction of idealism and enthusiasm for social betterment, and it was his goal to inspire his students to seek a public career, providing both an outlet for their ambition and satisfying their growing sense of social responsibility.<sup>31</sup>

These objectives were clear in the curriculum he devised for the Department of Political Economy and which Mavor maintained when he was offered the chair in 1892. The discipline was established in line with the inductive school, students being exposed to a plan of study meant to give them both moral training and skills in empirical research so that, as cultured male citizens, they would be fit to hold positions of influence. Undergraduates were to gain what Ashley wanted termed “loftiness of thought” through

---

27. Samuel Barnett to Francis G. Barnett, 4 April 1897, quoted in *Canon Barnett*, vol. 2, 50-51.

28. Henrietta Barnett, *Canon Barnett*, vol. 2, 51.

29. UTA, James Loudon, B72-0031/010(W20), pamphlet: *Address at the Convocation of the University of Toronto and University College, October 19, 1888, by Sir Daniel Wilson*; Testimonial for W. J. Ashley by G. W. Ross, Minister of Education (November 1890), quoted in Anne Ashley, *William James Ashley: A Life* (London, 1932), 54.

30. Anne Ashley, *William James Ashley*, 11-23; UTA, Pamphlets: *Testimonials in Favour of W. J. Ashley, M.A.: A Candidate for the Drummond Professorship of Political Economy in the University of Oxford*, Lujo Brentano to W. J. Ashley, 2 November 1890.

31. W. J. Ashley, “The Present Position of Political Economy,” *Economic Journal* XVII, No. 68 (December 1907): 482. Ashley dedicated his first major work to the memory of Arnold Toynbee. W. J. Ashley, *An Introduction to English Economic History and Theory* (London, 1888).

their contact with political philosophy and, by reading Plato or T. H. Green, they would learn to appreciate the duties of citizenship. At the same time, Ashley them to be educated in the techniques of "scientific" social research and, to that end, in 1889 he initiated a series of studies on Canadian conditions which explored such subjects as local government, agriculture, and urban development.<sup>32</sup>

Together, Ashley and Mavor produced an ideological framework at the University of Toronto which, by encouraging male students to regard themselves as chiefly responsible for Canada's future welfare, elevated their role in social service while simultaneously devaluing that of female social workers. Just as important, the message was widely heard. The Department of Political Economy achieved tremendous prominence within the University of Toronto and, as Ashley and Mavor had hoped, it soon produced a generation of graduates who gained prominent positions in politics and the civil service, among them William Lyon Mackenzie King, whose career is well known, Hamar Greenwood, last British Chief Secretary for Ireland, S. J. McLean, Assistant Chief Commissioner of the Board of Railway Commissioners for Canada, and S. A. Cudmore, Chief General Statistician at the Dominion Bureau of Statistics.<sup>33</sup>

This generation was also responsible for strengthening of the University's own idealist and empirical tradition in the decade preceding World War I. For by 1910 an identifiable group of academics had emerged who were committed to the Balliol ethic and who, placing their hope in the power of research to solve contemporary problems, shared the conviction that "scientific" knowledge needed only to be harnessed to the moral energy of idealism to bring about social betterment. Among them were E. J. Kylie, lecturer in the Department of History and editor of the alumni magazine, *University of Toronto Monthly*; McLean and Cudmore, who both taught political economy before moving on to other things; and Robert A. Falconer, President of the University.

Having graduated in classics and history from Toronto in 1901 and awarded the Flavelle Travelling Fellowship, E.J. Kylie had spent the next three years at Balliol, where the spirit and ethos of Green and Toynbee still animated the College through Benjamin Jowett's successor as Master, Edward Caird.<sup>34</sup> Deeply impressed by the moral environment he had found, upon returning to Toronto in 1904 Kylie attempted to promote its ideal of active citizenship among male undergraduates at the University. Writing in

- 
32. Archives of Ontario, RG 2, Department of Education, Series D-7, box 1, file: W. J. Ashley, "Syllabus of new Political Science Department by W. J. Ashley, October 1888"; NA, William Lyon Mackenzie King Papers, MG 26, J 1, vol. 5, 4349-56, microfilm, reel C-1904, W.J. Ashley to W. L. M. King, 27 February 1906; UTA, William James Ashley, B65-0033(02), Minute Book of the Economic Seminary, University College, Toronto, 1889-1892; UTA, P78-0321(01), *Toronto University Studies in Political Science*, First Series, No. 1-4 (Toronto, 1889-1895).
33. UTA, Department of Graduate Records, A73-0026/128(33-4), Hamar Greenwood; A73-0026/288(16), Simon James McLean; and A73-0026/75(02), Sedley Anthony Cudmore.
34. Meacham, 18-20.

*The Varsity* in December 1904, he enthused on the advantages students gained by living in Oxford's cultured surroundings and receiving a liberal education intended not just to be practical, but also self-sufficient. "With his better trained judgment and more cultivated taste," he asserted, "such a man will perform even his more purely professional tasks with greater facility and thoroughness, and in the discharge of the broad duties of citizenship will display deeper insight and greater grasp than one more narrowly educated."

For Kylie, the exercise of citizenship was an explicitly masculine responsibility, and therefore the acceptance of those duties was the supreme indication of manliness. The "final expression of the Oxford ideal," he concluded, was to be found in Jowett's response to an American writer who, upon entering the Balliol quadrangle, asked what was made there. Jowett had replied, according to Kylie, "we make men."<sup>35</sup> Kylie himself tried to live up to this ideal by actively supporting public housing in the city, and to this end he served as chairman of Toronto's Civic Guild Committee on working-class housing in 1911 and was subsequently Director of the Toronto Housing Company.<sup>36</sup>

Kylie's frame of mind was reflected in the Department of Political Economy by two of James Mavor's young recruits: S. J. McLean, appointed in 1906, and S. A. Cudmore, appointed in 1908 after McLean's resignation. Characteristic of Toronto graduates in political economy, McLean and Cudmore combined an absolute faith in the importance of empirical research, on the value of statistics and the accumulation of facts, with an idealist conviction that these facts must contribute to social reform. One of Mavor's first honours students, McLean graduated from Toronto in 1894, and then left Canada for several years to pursue graduate work at Columbia and Chicago.<sup>37</sup> While studying for his PhD at Chicago in 1897, he published an article in *The Canadian Magazine* entitled "Social Amelioration and the University Settlement," which provided an eager description of Toynbee Hall and its intellectual origins. Like Kylie, McLean believed social reform to be the domain of educated middle-class men, and explained that the university settlement idea was a product both of the sense of duty instilled in young Oxford and Cambridge students, and a new confidence in the ability of "trained men, cognizant of actual facts" to precipitate social improvement. He assumed that through teaching the lower classes the "ideals of a nobler citizenship," university men themselves would become better educated in the needs of modern society, and therefore better fitted for their permanent careers. For McLean, the bond between Toynbee Hall and the world of political power was obvious. "Men of renown consider it an honour to be permitted to help on, in any way, the work which it has undertaken." "To go among such classes," he concluded, "to investigate their life, to render them help and guidance, to point out to

35. E. J. Kylie, "Oxford Education," *The Varsity* XXIV, No. 8 (1 December 1904): 127-8.

36. UTA, Department of Graduate Records, A73-0026/212(15), Edward Joseph Kylie.

37. UTA, Department of Graduate Records, A73-0026/288(16), Simon James McLean; UTA, Department of Alumni Affairs, A72-0024/021, pamphlet: *University of Toronto, Faculty of Arts, Class 1894*.

them higher ideals and render easier their struggles upwards towards respectability, is the peculiar phase of usefulness with which the Settlement is concerned."<sup>38</sup>

For his part, Cudmore had graduated in political economy from Toronto in 1905, and, like Kylie, had been sent to Oxford on a Flavelle Fellowship. In December 1909, while still a junior lecturer, he wrote "The Condition of England" for *University of Toronto Monthly*<sup>39</sup>, an essay exemplifying the alumni magazine's direction under Kylie's editorship and which challenged British Liberal politician and journalist C. F. G. Masterman's pessimistic criticism of contemporary society, *The Condition of England*.<sup>40</sup> By presenting a bevy of statistics, Cudmore strongly refuted the suggestion that the British masses were in a state of degeneration, arguing with feeling that "the heart of the Empire" was still sound. Instead of becoming degraded, he stressed, the British race had increased in vitality, and this social regeneration was the direct result of the idealist movement which had swept through the ancient universities. "Hundreds of Oxford and Cambridge graduates and undergraduates are giving their lives to the work of raising the people," Cudmore maintained, describing how the "best men" from the universities were sacrificing their leisure to work in settlements and curacies in the slums. "No nation has ever in the history of the world been blessed with so many trained unselfish workers for the good of the race," he observed, "and not a few of these have laid down their lives at their self-sought post of duty."

Cudmore went further than Kylie and McLean, however, by concluding his article with an urgent plea for Toronto undergraduates to follow the example of Oxford and take immediate social action. Pointing out that local arm-chair critics of Britain should look to conditions in their own city, Cudmore appealed for a similar social regeneration in Toronto. "Within a mile of our University we have a slum as vile as the worst in London stretching westward and engulfing new streets from year to year. . . The smells of the slum and the sounds of the slum and the sights of the slum are at the very gates of our University, if we will only open our eyes to see."<sup>41</sup>

By the time this article appeared, Toronto's existing settlement, Evangelia House, already had established an extensive network of co-operation among women at the University, and the problems of Toronto's slums had for years been debated at the meetings of female students and graduates. Yet Cudmore's essay presented the idea of a settlement house as something new to the University community, and, most significantly, as an imperative civic duty which had for too long been neglected by those most qualified

---

38. S. J. McLean, "Social Amelioration and the University Settlement: With special reference to Toynbee Hall," *The Canadian Magazine* VIII, No. 6 (April 1897): 469-70, 471, 473.

39. Similar articles which appeared during the editorship of E. J. Kylie are: S. G. Tallents, "Toynbee Hall," *UTM* X, No. 4 (February 1910): 201; and "The Settlement Movement," *UTM* XI, No. 2 (December 1910): 38. S. G. Tallents is listed as a visitor from Balliol College, Oxford, in the *Toynbee Record* XXI, No. 6 (March 1909): 90.

40. C. F. G. Masterman, *The Condition of England* (London, 1909).

41. S. A. Cudmore, "The Condition of England," *UTM* X, No. 2 (December 1909): 71, 77, 77-8.

to act: the Empire's "best men." His article, therefore, indicated an important stage in what was to be a rapid acceptance of the idealist and empirical interpretation of service among male members of the University.

Undergraduates in political economy had been exposed before to the idea that their empirical skills should be used to satisfy moral ends, but direct service to the poor, for male students, had been limited to the city mission work of the YMCA, which had been defined by the Association's evangelical emphasis on individual redemption. In the popularized idealist message proclaimed by such faculty members as Kylie and Cudmore, however, this emphasis was assimilated into a much larger concern for humanity. Moreover, as the idealist ethic continued to gain scientific authority by its association with empiricism, it also began to appropriate the moral authority previously held by on campus by the Christian Associations. Through the public speeches of President Falconer, for example, male students were urged toward a direct and personal sacrifice which would express their true manhood, and the idealist desire to find the "highest good" in a useful life was joined to the evangelical need for spiritual redemption.

Robert A. Falconer had been exposed to philosophical idealism while studying at Edinburgh University in the late 1880s, and his childhood grounding in evangelical morality made him particularly sensitive to the persuasiveness of the idealist ethic.<sup>42</sup> As President of the University of Toronto for twenty-five years, he created a definition of the University's function in the larger community which was shaped by the social convictions of idealism. In his inaugural address in September 1907, he asserted his belief that the University's chief goal was to maintain the ideal or spiritual element in national life, a task only made possible through the cultivation, as he put it, of "the nation's chief wealth — its manhood." Denouncing intellectual aloofness as the "besetting academical sin," Falconer argued that the real university ideal was one of co-operation and service, in which the student was obligated to address the problems of contemporary society.

In agreement with both Ashley and Mavor, Falconer believed that the natural and most significant consequence of empirical study was the development of individual character, and the ultimate objective was to motivate the student toward active citizenship. "It should fit him to observe the social and political situation," he declared, and "awaken in him human sympathies and the desire to emancipate his fellows from the ignorance and prejudice which are breeding evil."<sup>43</sup> Considering wealth, social position, and intellectual training to be dangerous because of their potential to isolate the individual from the rest of humanity, Falconer urged the university community to break down such barriers and carry the advantages of education to those who lacked them. "Find the highest good by serving your fellows," Falconer entreated, "through your intellect, your wealth, your position, or whatever talent you may possess."<sup>44</sup>

---

42. James G. Greenlee, *Sir Robert Falconer: A Biography* (Toronto, 1988), 24-6.

43. Robert A. Falconer, "Inaugural Address," *UTM* VIII, No. 1 (November 1907): 7, 10.

44. *The Varsity* XXX, No. 3 (11 October 1910): 1.



During the early years of Falconer's presidency there was in fact a noticeable alteration in the general character of the male students. The explosive behaviour which had marked the late-nineteenth century began to be replaced by a more sober attitude, springing from an increased consciousness of the responsibilities of social position. A greater respect for authority led to the regulation by student organizations of the ritualized forms of student rowdiness: initiations became more standardized and tended to involve athletic contests between seniors and freshmen rather than the surprise attacks typical of the 1890s.<sup>45</sup> In January 1907, a Board of Student Control was established by the student-run University College Literary Society, with a mandate granted by the College Council to prevent "ungentlemanly" behaviour among male students. After 1908, this change in male undergraduate culture was precipitated by a growing awareness of the city's poverty crisis, and University men began to give prominence to social topics in their meetings, discussion groups, and publications.<sup>46</sup> In April 1908, to take one example, *Acta Victoriana* printed an essay entitled "Religious Life in Oxford," in which the writer, E. Brecken, described the social service undertaken by Oxford students. Like Kylie and McLean, Brecken drew attention to the importance of the settlement movement in preparing Britain's finest young men for their future positions of power. "England is on the verge of a tremendous social revolution," he wrote, "and it is well that among her students there are being trained men who in years to come will from the floor of the Commons, from the editor's desk, or from the pulpit, meet the inevitable crisis with a sympathetic understanding and unselfish devotion to the highest good."<sup>47</sup>

While previous articles in University publications had seen settlement work as a distinctly female occupation, and had discussed it in terms of the American movement, after 1908 the settlement idea gained a new masculine character on campus. As male students at the University became increasingly preoccupied with social questions during the winter of 1909 to 1910, a growing number united behind the idea of a university settlement which, they hoped, would offer them a distinctive role in social regeneration. In the summer, twelve young men from Victoria College had been sent by the Methodist Church to hold an evangelistic campaign in the downtown slum districts.<sup>48</sup> Although the primary incentive of the campaign was missionary, the students were authorized to gather facts on such aspects of slum life as overcrowding and poor sanitation, and, in October, *Acta Victoriana* was able to report that "a good deal of valuable information regarding social conditions has been collected."<sup>49</sup> During the fall term, J. M. Shaver, the leader of the student campaign and a Methodist minister studying theology, began conducting a class for the YMCA on "City Problems." Another student from the survey, Arthur H.

---

45. Keith Walden, "Hazes, Hustles, Scraps, and Stunts: Initiations at the University of Toronto, 1880-1925," in *Youth, University and Canadian Society*, 104.

46. UTA, University College Council, A69-0016/001(03), University College Council Minutes, 1890-1958, (18 January 1907).

47. E. Brecken, "Religious Life in Oxford," AV XXXI, No. 7 (April 1908): 463.

48. UCA, Methodist Church (Canada), Toronto Conference, Methodist Union of Toronto, 84.050C, file 2-5, Fred Victor Mission Board Minutes, 1907-1913, (20 May and 22 June 1909).

49. "The Students' Christian Social Union," AV XXXIII, No. 1 (October 1909): 37.

Burnett, organized the Students' Christian Social Union, which held a series of lectures and student conferences on social questions throughout the year.<sup>50</sup>

S. A. Cudmore's anxious appeal in "The Condition of England" was published in December, and in February a new undergraduate magazine, *The Arbor*, included a response by a third-year student at University College, A. M. Goulding. "The need of a University settlement has long been vaguely felt among the undergraduates," Goulding pointed out, urging that the time to take action had arrived. He acknowledged the existing involvement of University women in settlement work, but dismissed it as "an experiment," claiming that "it can scarcely be considered as fittingly representing the University." Although Goulding argued against excluding women from participating in a university settlement, he followed Cudmore in promoting it as an opportunity for service which was uniquely appropriate for University men. He asserted: "It is about time that the four thousand undergraduates in Toronto should awake to a sense of responsibility in this matter and make their settlement work bear some fair relation to their numbers and ability."<sup>51</sup>

President Falconer had already initiated the project, having approached J. M. Shaver to help plan a university settlement in the fall, and in March the University YMCA agreed to provide the necessary financial backing.<sup>52</sup> After the announcement that University Settlement would be opened in the summer, editorials in *The Varsity* earnestly supported the masculine vision of service. "Actual inculcation of decent, manly ideas into the minds of those people, who have found the State less kindly than you have and whose experiences have led to a sordid view of life," *The Varsity* enthused in 1911, "is the kind of constructive work that a University man should favor, with a share of his time at least."<sup>53</sup>

The notion that such "constructive work" would take up "a share" of a man's time reflected an assumption of considerable importance to those who espoused the Balliol ethos. For although their view of service presented social reform as a man's responsibility, it was not, however, a man's career. Like the young men of Toynbee Hall, Toronto's male graduates were to apply their expertise to the problems of poverty, and to bring that knowledge to bear on their employment in other fields. Direct social action, such as

---

50. "YMCA Notes," *The Varsity* XXIX, No. 15 (26 November 1909); UTA, Office of the President (Falconer), A67-0007/026, file: University Settlement, 1912-1913, Arthur H. Burnett to Robert Falconer, 20 March and 5 April 1913.

51. A. M. Goulding, "An University Settlement," *The Arbor* I, No. 1 (February 1910): 32, 33.

52. NA, Kelso Papers, MG 30, C 97, vol. 33, file 187, J. M. Shaver to J. J. Kelso, 24 April 1934.

53. *The Varsity* XXXI, No. 15 (1 November 1911). It should be noted that although the YMCA was instrumental in getting University Settlement under way, its insistence on a "note of active evangelism" fostered conflict on the Settlement Board, and led to the Association's eventual disengagement from the institution in 1911. UTA, Student Christian Movement, B79-0059/008, file: YMCA Annual Report, 1908-1909; *The Varsity* XXXI, No. 13 (25 October 1911).

settlement work, was seen as a way of gaining experience and accumulating information, which could then be applied to social issues from a man's more remote — but powerful — vantage point in the working world. The acceptance of the idealist and empirical approach to service was facilitated at Toronto as elsewhere by the widely held assumption that the participation of men, at any level, was innately more important than that of women. By prizing voluntary and temporary service over career-oriented social work, this belief contested the very legitimacy of social service as a female endeavour and the American, career-oriented approach to settlement work adopted by University women.

Social service was already a disputed field at the University of Toronto after 1900, as men and women competed ideologically to create an approach to reform which was defined by considerations of gender. By 1910, the prevalent acceptance of idealist and empirical beliefs ensured that the University's first official response to the poverty crisis was to offer the services of its young men, and at the same time to overlook the long-standing commitment of University women to neighbourhood work at Evangelia House. Like Toynbee Hall, University Settlement was opened to provide University men with first-hand experience of urban slum conditions, and initially only men were accepted as resident workers or volunteers. Unlike the founders of Toynbee Hall, however, the directors of Toronto's Settlement Board did not institute a policy which deliberately excluded women; rather the social service interests of female students were simply ignored, undermined by the prevalence of idealist beliefs.

The Settlement's Board of Directors, formally established in October 1910, was controlled by Robert Falconer, who was both President of University Settlement and Chairman of the board of directors, and he was largely responsible for determining its policy:<sup>54</sup> "to bring the University Students into direct contact with those living amidst the unfortunate social conditions of our modern cities and thus broaden the one and elevate the other." This idealist faith in the value of personal communication between the classes, and in the importance of community reintegration, was then tied to the goal of empirical research which had been cultivated at Toronto since the late-nineteenth century. University Settlement, the pamphlet announced, was to be "an institution where all kinds of social work and investigation could be carried on."<sup>55</sup>

However, while idealist and empirical convictions remained central to the thinking of the Settlement's Board of Directors, by 1915 it was becoming obvious that the Board would be forced to alter the structure of University Settlement to accommodate the growth of professional social work in Toronto, and, more pragmatically, to compensate for the enlistment of young men to fight overseas. In 1914, the University had reacted to the requirements of the emerging profession by forming the Department of Social Service as a training school for social workers. At least some observers had hoped to

---

54. "The University Settlement," *UTM* XI, No. 4 (February 1911): 113-14.

55. NA, Kelso Papers, MG 30, C 97, vol. 6, file: Social Settlements, pamphlet: *University Settlement, 1910-1911*.

attract men, but wartime conditions had increased the already large numbers of women entering the new field, and it now became apparent that in the city of Toronto both the study and the practice of social work would be dominated by women. J. J. Kelso, the Provincial Superintendent of Neglected and Dependent Children and one of the members of the University Settlement Board, later expressed his frustration that educated men failed to take up the responsibility of social service, and his words echoed those of Samuel Barnett. "It was a great disappointment to me," he remembered in 1932, "to find when the course was actually opened that it was swamped with young women and the young men felt they were quite out of it. It seemed to be taken for granted that it was a woman's job and this is a big mistake for the key positions should be held by men."<sup>56</sup>

Eventually, in 1915, after five years of male leadership, University Settlement was put under the management of Sara Libby Carson, who reorganized the program to resemble that of Evangelia House, giving priority to self-governing social clubs and hiring female University graduates to assist her.<sup>57</sup> Following Carson's appointment, University women divided their loyalties between Evangelia House and University Settlement; in November 1915 the Alumnae Association decided to offer financial support to both institutions; and within a few years other female organizations, such as the Women's Undergraduate Association, were supplying routine contributions to University Settlement.<sup>58</sup> By the end of World War I, the Settlement had been transformed into a female community, closely affiliated, through the Department of Social Service, to the city's professional social workers. As Kelso's remark indicates, however, the feminization of social service at Toronto was perceived by some to devalue the new Department, and in the following decades the construction of gender roles would continue to shape the academic development of both social work and sociology in the University system.

---

56. NA, Kelso Papers, MG 30, C 97, vol. 6, file: School of Social Work, University of Toronto, J. J. Kelso to T. R. Robinson, 7 July 1932.

57. *The Varsity* XXXV, No. 16 (5 November 1915); UTA, Office of the President (Falconer), A67-0007/040a, file: University Settlement, 1915-1916, Robert Falconer to Harry Edwards, 6 January 1916; *The Varsity* XXXVI, No. 32 (11 December 1916).

58. UTA, University College, A69-0011/014, Alumnae Association of University College, General and Executive Minutes, 1898-1927, (12 November 1915); UTA, University College, Dean of Women, B74-0011/001(11), Annual Report, 1921-1922.