# Encounters in Theory and History of Education Rencontres en Théorie et Histoire de l'Éducation Encuentros en Teoría e Historia de la Educación



A Critical History for the Twenty-first Century? Critique, Truth, Method and Audience

Une histoire critique pour le XXIe siècle ? Critique, vérité, méthode et public

¿Una historia crítica para el siglo XXI? Crítica, verdad, método y público

Johannes Westberg 🕞 et Beth Marsden 🗈

Volume 25, numéro 1, 2024

Consequences of the Past and Responsible Histories of Education for the Future

URI : https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1116834ar

DOI: https://doi.org/10.24908/encounters.v25i0.17738

Aller au sommaire du numéro

Éditeur(s)

Faculty of Education, Queen's University

**ISSN** 

2560-8371 (numérique)

Découvrir la revue

#### Citer cet article

Westberg, J. & Marsden, B. (2024). A Critical History for the Twenty-first Century? Critique, Truth, Method and Audience. Encounters in Theory and History of Education / Rencontres en Théorie et Histoire de l'Éducation / Encuentros en Teoría e Historia de la Educación, 25(1), 152–171. https://doi.org/10.24908/encounters.v25i0.17738

#### Résumé de l'article

Les perspectives critiques sont récurrentes dans l'histoire de la recherche en éducation depuis les années 1960. Dans cet article, nous examinons ce que peuvent être les histoires critiques de l'éducation au XXIe siècle, alors que le scepticisme à l'égard des vérités acceptées est répandu et que l'analyse critique est devenue essentielle aux pratiques d'évaluation néolibérales. Cet article identifie quatre éléments clés d'une telle recherche – la critique, la vérité, la méthode et le public visé – et soutient que les histoires critiques actuelles doivent s'intéresser à ces éléments. En utilisant les perspectives des études autochtones, il propose des réflexions sur la manière dont de telles histoires pourraient être construites. Bien qu'il ne fournisse pas de réponses définitives, il souligne des considérations importantes pour la conception d'une recherche critique, notamment le type de récits produits, la position du chercheur, l'inconfort généré et la manière dont les publics potentiels sont impliqués. En conséquence, cet article pose la question de savoir si une recherche peut être véritablement critique si elle ne provoque pas d'inconfort chez le chercheur, ou ne provoque pas d'actions réparatrices ou transformatrices.

© Johannes Westberg et Beth Marsden, 2024



Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/



# A Critical History for the Twenty-first Century? Critique, Truth, Method and Audience

Johannes Westberg University of Groningen

**Beth Marsden**Australian National University

#### **Abstract**

Critical perspectives have been recurrent in history of education research since the 1960s. In this article, we examine what critical histories of education can be in the twenty-first century, when scepticism towards accepted truths is widespread, and critical analysis has become essential to neoliberal assessment practices. This article identifies four key elements of such research – critique, truth, method, and intended audience – and argues that up-to-date critical histories must engage with these. Using perspectives from Indigenous Studies, it offers reflections on how such histories might be constructed. Although not providing definitive answers, it outlines important considerations for designing critical research, including the type of narratives produced, researcher positionality, the discomfort generated, and how potential audiences are engaged. As a result, this article raises the question of whether research can be truly critical if it does not provoke discomfort for the researcher, or provoke restorative or transformative actions.

**Keywords:** critique, critical pedagogy, history of education, applied history of education, Indigenous studies

ISSN: 2560-8371 DOI: 10.24908/encounters.v25i0.17738

© The author | 152

# ¿Una historia crítica para el siglo XXI? Crítica, verdad, método y público

#### Resumen

Las perspectivas críticas han sido recurrentes en la historia de la investigación en educación desde los años sesenta. En este artículo, examinamos lo que pueden ser las historias críticas de la educación en el siglo XXI, cuando el escepticismo hacia las verdades aceptadas está generalizado y el análisis crítico se ha vuelto esencial para las prácticas de evaluación neoliberales. Este artículo identifica cuatro elementos clave de dicha investigación –crítica, verdad, método y público objetivo– y sostiene que las historias críticas actualizadas deben abordarlos. Utilizando perspectivas de los estudios indígenas, ofrece reflexiones sobre cómo se podrían construir esas historias. Aunque no proporciona respuestas definitivas, describe consideraciones importantes para diseñar una investigación crítica, incluido el tipo de narrativas producidas, la posición del investigador, la incomodidad generada y cómo se involucra a las audiencias potenciales. Como resultado, este artículo plantea la cuestión de si la investigación puede ser verdaderamente crítica si no provoca malestar al investigador, o provoca acciones restaurativas o transformadoras.

Palabras clave: crítica, pedagogía crítica, historia de la educación, historia aplicada de la educación, estudios Indígenas

# Une histoire critique pour le XXIe siècle ? Critique, vérité, méthode et public

#### Résumé

Les perspectives critiques sont récurrentes dans l'histoire de la recherche en éducation depuis les années 1960. Dans cet article, nous examinons ce que peuvent être les histoires critiques de l'éducation au XXIe siècle, alors que le scepticisme à l'égard des vérités acceptées est répandu et que l'analyse critique est devenue essentielle aux pratiques d'évaluation néolibérales. Cet article identifie quatre éléments clés d'une telle recherche – la critique, la vérité, la méthode et le public visé – et soutient que les histoires critiques actuelles doivent s'intéresser à ces éléments. En utilisant les perspectives des études autochtones, il propose des réflexions sur la manière dont de telles histoires pourraient être construites. Bien qu'il ne fournisse pas de réponses définitives, il souligne des considérations importantes pour la conception d'une recherche critique, notamment le type de récits produits, la position du chercheur, l'inconfort généré et la manière dont les publics potentiels sont impliqués. En

conséquence, cet article pose la question de savoir si une recherche peut être véritablement critique si elle ne provoque pas d'inconfort chez le chercheur, ou ne provoque pas d'actions réparatrices ou transformatrices.

**Mots-clés : c**ritique, pédagogie critique, histoire de l'éducation, histoire appliquée de l'éducation, études autochtones

#### Introduction

Historical research and expertise occupy an ambivalent position in the twenty-first century. History certainly matters. We – researchers working in the international field of history of education – live in a culture immersed in history. History is present not only in museums, monuments and research, but also in tourism, festivals, literature and a range of media that in various ways celebrates or laments our joint history. History is not only a source of entertainment, as the excesses of historically oriented TV shows or World War II documentaries might indicate but is certainly also a serious matter. Historians have, for example, served as experts at the trials following World War II and thereafter the Holocaust denial trials. Historical knowledge has also been key to the processes of acknowledging the rights and past mistreatments of minoritised groups. These include, for example, those suffering from racial discrimination in the USA, Indigenous populations in Australia and Canada, and institutional abuse in out-of-home care in England, Ireland, the Netherlands and Denmark.

Despite being surrounded by history, historical research has a legitimacy problem. While history matters, historians and their analyses certainly do not always matter, with history departments seeing a decline in academic and student numbers.<sup>4</sup> The wealth of research on the history of colonialism is a case in point, where political elites despite all

154 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For insights into such uses and abuses of the past, see, e.g., Roy Rosenzweig and David P. Thelen, *The Presence of the Past: Popular Uses of History in American Life* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See, e.g., Richard J. Evans, "History, Memory, and the Law: The Historian as Expert Witness," *History and Theory* 41, no. 3 (2002).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Johanna Sköld and Shurlee Swain, eds., *Apologies and the Legacy of Abuse of Children in Care: International Perspectives* (Cham: Palgrave MacMillan, 2015). For other instances of historians involved in court matters, see for example the case of cold war radiation research in David J. Rothman, "Serving Clio and Client: The Historian as Expert Witness," *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 77, no. 1 (2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Martin Crotty, Frank Bongiorno, and Paul Sendzuik, "Our Research Shows the Number of History Academics in Australia has Dropped at least 31% since 1989," *The Conversation*, October 12, 2023, https://theconversation.com/our-research-shows-the-number-of-history-academics-in-australia-has-dropped-by-at-least-31-since-1989-213544; Julia Akinyi Bookins, "Tracking Undergraduate History Enrollments in 2023," *Perspectives: American Historical Association*, April 16, 2024, https://www.historians.org/perspectives-article/tracking-undergraduate-history-enrollments-in-2023-april-2024/.

accumulated knowledge still tend to reproduce paternalistic discourses and sanitize or even glorify a violent colonial past.<sup>5</sup> History of education, as a multidisciplinary subfield between history and education, certainly experiences these challenges. With research methods that do not fit the criteria generally promoted in the social and behavioural sciences, addressing topics that are beyond those usually found in departments of history, there are good reasons to pose questions concerning the role, relevance and meaningfulness of history of education research.

Research in the history of education is certainly a multifaceted tool that can, and should, be used in a wide range of contexts, with a corresponding range of functions and purposes. In this article, we focus on one of these purposes, which in various ways is addressed by the articles of this special issue, namely that of providing a critique. In the 2020s, a decade marked by a global pandemic, environmental crises, the rise of right-wing movements and wars through which history is constantly evoked, the questions of what critical histories of education are, and can be, appear as particularly significant. How should we write critical histories that are fitting for the twenty-first century, and that allow us not only to shed light on the shadows of history, but also allow us to use historical knowledge to address the challenges that we face both in the present and in the future?

In this article, we address this question by considering four key elements of such critical research: critique, truth, method, and intended audience. In order to do so, we will use historiographical reflections on critical research, combined with that of Indigenous Studies. Indigenous Studies is a global, interdisciplinary field that draws on concepts from history, political science, sociology, criminology, anthropology and settler colonial studies. A key lesson from this field, which this article draws upon, is the assumption that knowing the past is key to more reparative futures.<sup>7</sup>

The main purpose of our examination of these issues is not to argue that all histories of education can or should be critical, or that there is a certain strand of critical research that should be prioritized. Instead, this article intends to promote an awareness of some

155 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Tom Bentley, "The Sorrow of Empire: Rituals of Legitimation and the Performative Contradictions of Liberalism," *Review of International Studies* 41, no. 3 (2015): 623–645; see also, for example, Ben Quinn, "Former British Colonies Owe 'Debt of Gratitude', Says Robert Jenrick," *The Guardian*, October 29, 2024, https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2024/oct/29/former-british-colonies-owe-debt-of-gratitude-robert-jenrick-reparations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See, e.g., Johannes Westberg, "What We Can Learn from Studying the Past: The Wonderful Usefulness of History in Educational Research," *Encounters in Theory and History of Education* 22 (2021): 227–248.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Katharina Ruckstuhlm, Irma A. Velasques Nimatuj, John-Andrew McNeish, and Nancy Postero, "Indigenous Futurities: Rethinking Indigenous Development," in *The Routledge Handbook of Indigenous Development*, ed. Katharina Ruckstuhlm, Irma A. Velasques Nimatuj, John-Andrew McNeish, and Nancy Postero (Abingdon: Routledge, 2023), 2–3. For history of education see, for example, "The Future is in the Past: How Land-Grab Universities can Shape the Future of Higher Education," *Journal of the Native American and Indigenous Studies Association* (NAIS) 8, no. 1 (2021): 162; Meredith McCoy, "Pausing and Contributing towards Indigenous Futures: A Pedagogical Reflection on College History Classrooms," *Curriculum Inquiry* 10 (2024): 1–20.

of the considerations that are key if we are to continue to develop critical research in an era not only troubled by crises, disruptions and precarity, but also of a trivialization of critique where skepticism towards truths and institutions has become commonplace. As we will argue below, these points of consideration include the critical narrative pursued, the positionality and discomfort of the researcher, suffering populations, activism and urgency.

### Critique and the "Critical"

In the history of education, critical research has enjoyed an important position since the 1960s. Relieving itself from a history that celebrated the progress of educational systems, often from the perspective of a male white middle-class perspective, historians of education started to produce historical research that was critical to school and society. In the US case, such research explored how schools reproduced the social order, assimilated and discriminated against minorities and immigrants, and how public high schools served the interests of the middle and upper classes. While, for example, women, African Americans and Indigenous populations were initially strikingly absent from these accounts, they slowly also gained attention. Regardless of the group addressed: instead of research presenting a glorified past, historians of education were, as Ruben Donato and Marvin Lazerson noted, eager to question almost all educational reforms based on their social function.

The inspiration for this critical research was wide-ranging. These included Marxist perspectives, which historians of education could meet in the publications of E.P Thompson and Eric Hobsbawm, critical educational theory and critical pedagogy. Critical educational theory, informed by the critical theory of the Frankfurt School, stressed the inherent power relations in education, forming an excellent basis for a critique of repression, coercion, alienation, dependency, and a lack of freedom in education. In the version of critical pedagogy, promoted by Paulo Freire's *The Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (1968), such a critique shed light on the oppression inherent in education, and the possibility of fostering a critical consciousness. In an attempt to define critical histories of education, Derrick Aldridge argued that such research often is linked to the critical theory of the Frankfurt school, and that it challenges traditional narratives by posing questions about power relations, and how

156 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Gary McCulloch, *The Struggle for the History of Education* (London: Routledge, 2011), 11–18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Ruben Donato and Marvin Lazerson, "New Directions in American Educational History: Problems and Prospects," *Educational Researcher* 29, no. 8 (2000): 5–6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> E.g., E. P. Thompson, "Time, Work-Discipline, and Industrial Capitalism," *Past & Present* 38, no. 1 (1967).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Rosa Bruno-Jofré, "History of Education in Canada: Historiographic 'Turns' and Widening Horizons," *Paedagogica Historica* 50, no. 6 (2014): 774–778; Jan Masschelein, "How to Conceive of Critical Educational Theory Today?," *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 38, no. 3 (2004): 353–355.

groups or individuals are advantaged or disadvantaged by specific educational configurations.<sup>12</sup>

From the 1960s and onwards, the sources of inspiration for critical research widened to include feminist, post-structural, and postcolonial theories, which both reflected, and promoted, increasing interest in issues of gender, race and sexuality. The timing and extent to which this happened seem to have followed different trajectories depending on regional and national conditions. As a result, however, the critical gaze concerning the oppression, the disadvantages and the discrimination that education produces, now started to widen its scope to groups in society that rarely had been included in older traditions of historical research. This includes, not the least, various minority groups and Indigenous populations.<sup>13</sup>

Simultaneously, a discussion concerning what critique is, and might be, has grown in the humanities and social sciences. Jan Masschelein has noted how critique has become trivialized in a society where critique based on individual autonomy and emancipation is commonplace. Instead of being mainly a tool of social justice, critical analysis has also become an important part of a neoliberal assessment culture where the subversion of the status quo is necessarily the first step towards a better world. In such instances, where critique merely becomes part of management strategies, attempts to improve efficiency or the optimization of organizations. <sup>14</sup> Bruno Latour has, in a similar vein, discussed the role of a critical ethos in the twenty-first century. In a society marked by skepticism towards accepted truths, artificially maintained controversies, and a constant debunking of myths, what kind of criticism is then required?<sup>15</sup> While Latour questioned the enlightenment roots of this search for reality, others have noted the white, western and Eurocentric fundaments of this kind of thinking.<sup>16</sup> That is certainly an important point: the critical gaze of middle-aged white academics living in wealthy European cities must, by definition, have significant limitations.

Partly in communication with such a critical debate, the range of critical approaches has widened in the humanities and social sciences. Apart from shedding light on how education takes part in the patterns of power, inequality and domination, and questioning the taken for granted, researchers engaged in all kinds of critical research.

157 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Derrick Aldridge, "The Ideas and Craft of the Critical Historian of Education," in *Critical Approaches to the Study of Higher Education: A Practical Introduction*, ed. Ana M. Martínez Alemán, Brian Pusser, and Estela Mara Bensimon (Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2015), 103–104.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> For an overview of these theoretical developments, see the special issue "Histories of Education in the Past, Present and Future: Trends and Intersections", *History of Education* 52, no. 2–3 (2023).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Masschelein, "How to Conceive of Critical Educational Theory Today?," 354–364.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Bruno Latour, "Why Has Critique Run out of Steam? From Matters of Fact to Matters of Concern," *Critical Inquiry* 30 (2004): 225–248.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Jan McArthur, "Critical Theory in a Decolonial Age," *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 54, no. 10 (2022): 1681–1692.

These include the so-called history from below. Instead of the traditionally strong interest in the prominent, successful, influential or rich, such accounts focused on the common people.<sup>17</sup> In E.P. Thompson's famous words, such research is about saving even those perceived as obsolete, deluded, backward-looking and foolhardy from the "enormous condescension of posterity."<sup>18</sup> In such lines of research, an interest in, for example, children's voices and children's agencies has followed.<sup>19</sup> Such research in migration studies has, among other things, questioned traditional critical narratives of oppression highlighting the poverty, trauma and resilience of migrants.<sup>20</sup>

Such widening approaches also include the Foucauldian act of problematization. Rather than a straightforward uncovering of oppression of unjust conditions, such an analysis examines the history in terms of how solutions and problems have been constructed.<sup>21</sup> It is in such a line that Nikolas Rose presented his critical ethos concerning governance and psychology that also implies a critical stance towards some strands of critical theory. Here, Rose promoted a problematizing analysis that not only highlights dependence and repression but also examines the cost of our contemporary emphasis on freedom and self-realization. Freedom is not only an ideal but may also be part of a certain liberal governmentality.<sup>22</sup>

Along with the contributions to this special issue, such approaches to critical studies certainly raises questions concerning the appropriate application of critical perspectives in the history of education. This question can also be further discussed using Jörn Rüsen's typology of historical narratives. He differentiated between traditional narratives that affirmed existing cultural patterns, and exemplary narratives that demonstrated exemplary lives and events. That is, using history as the teacher of life. Rüsen also noted the genetical narratives, which highlight changes from the foreign to the well-known, and finally the critical narratives which question cultural patterns and forms of life.<sup>23</sup> Although well-known to scholars of historical consciousness and historical culture, this typology nevertheless raises interesting questions concerning both what kind of

158 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, "History from Below – Some Reflections," in *History from Below: Studies in Popular Protest and Popular Ideology*, ed. Frederick Krantz (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1988), 13–27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> E. P Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class* (New York: Vintage Books, 1966), 12–13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Mona Gleason, "Avoiding the Agency Trap: Caveats for Historians of Children, Youth, and Education," *History of Education* 45, no. 4 (2016): 446–459.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Liisa H. Malkki, "Speechless Emissaries: Refugees, Humanitarianism, and Dehistoricization," *Cultural Anthropology* 11, no. 3 (1996); Sabrina Axster, "We Try to Humanise Their Stories': Interrogating the Representation of Migrants and Refugees through the Shift from 'Poverty Porn' to Humanisation and Resilience," *Millennium* 51, no. 2 (2023).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Michel Foucault, "Polemics, Politics and Problematizations," in *Essential Works of Foucault, 1954–1984, Ethics*, ed. James D Faubion (New York: Penguin, 2000), 389.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Nikolas Rose, *Governing the Soul: The Shaping of the Private Self* (London: Free Association Books, 1999).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Jörn Rüsen, "Historical Narration: Foundation, Types, Reason," *History and Theory* 26, no. 4, (1987): 87–97.

narratives we want to promote, and the possibilities and limitations of critical perspectives. While critical narratives allow us to problematise the past and the present, and to pass judgements, exemplary narratives enable us to produce research that not only provide examples of society's vices, but also its virtues.<sup>24</sup>

#### **Truth and Politics**

Apart from the kind of critique intended, critical historians of education also need to address issues of truth and politics. In traditional critical accounts, issues of truth and politics were often closely intertwined. It was by presenting the truth of education, hidden by the ideologies of our present society, that a basis for research as well as politics could be found. Following the linguistic turn, and a continuous discussion concerning the social nature of reality, historians of education have started to address truth in different ways. As a result, historians of education may be found on both sides of the postmodern fence.<sup>25</sup> Anyone that attempts to write critical histories of education, should therefore address how they intend to engage with the matter of truth in an appropriate way.

Some researchers have emphasized the constructed nature of history. Lieselot De Wilde, Bruno Vanobbergen and Sarah Van Bouchaute argue that the ambiguity of remembering the horrors of the past can be addressed by finding innovative combinations and mixes of sources and voices. These may include presentations of both general theories and individual testimonies but also analyses and anecdotes. According to these authors, such a conceptualization of the past opens new possibilities. If we refrain from the idea that history can either be true or false, we would then need to present multiplicities of interpretations that create a multiplicity of connections between the past and the present.<sup>26</sup>

In other contexts, historians have instead adhered to traditional positivistic concepts of truth. A function of historical research in general has been described as reducing the amount of lies in public discourse – a function that many historians of education can subscribe to.<sup>27</sup> In legal contexts, such a conception of truth has also remained important. While historians do not always need to decide on a single version of the truth, a judge is required to. In this setting, historians may worry about how lawyers use history without caring too much about actual historical truths, while legal scholars may criticize historians for being unable to present reliable historical facts. In this context,

159 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Rüsen, "Historical Narration: Foundation, Types, Reason," 91–92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Aldrich, "The Three Duties of the Historian of Education," 139–140.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Lieselot De Wilde, Bruno Vanobbergen, and Sarah Van Bouchaute, "Exhibiting the Past: Life after the Apology: Making the Unspeakable Visible," in *Public Histories of Education*, ed. Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés (Oldenbourg: De Gruyter, 2023), 59–60, 76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Elizabeth Cole, "Transitional Justice and the Reform of History Education," *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 1, no. 1 (2007): 119.

historical truth can also be in focus, such as in the Holocaust denial trials. In that context, the claim that David Irving was a falsifier of history stood trial.<sup>28</sup>

In truth commissions that are formally truth-seeking, the concept of truth is also most often applied in a non-postmodern fashion. Notably, truth commissions tend to define truth both as facts, but also as personal accounts. The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission (1995–2002) did, for example, distinguish between factual truth, personal narrative truth, social truth produced by the collective reflection on the past, and restorative truths. In the latter case, these are truth-telling instances when facts are related to present-day human relationships.<sup>29</sup>

As with the issue of truth, critical historians of education need to address the issue of politics. Traditionally, the ideal pursued by historians has been that of the objective, impartial and distant observer, that does not participate in current cultural or political movements.<sup>30</sup> Although historians with critical perspectives have departed from such ideals, they have nevertheless often remained distant observers: criticizing inequality in nineteenth or early twentieth-century schooling is in most cases not a particularly direct intervention in current politics.

In this setting of traditional ideals and critical studies, historians of education have certainly taken various standpoints. Some have favoured a stance akin to that of a critical but distanced observer. Marc Depaepe has, for example, argued that historians may contribute to present-day discussions by demythologising the past, but that historical research should not intend to interfere with the present or problematise our present ways of life.<sup>31</sup> Along similar lines, Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés have argued that a public history of education should concern making histories of education available, and "not about instrumentalizing, educationalising or politicising and thus (ab)using the past."<sup>32</sup>

In contrast, others have argued that the history of education should intervene in current culture and politics. Diane Ravitch and Maris Vinovskis have, for example, argued that policymakers need the knowledge and experience of historians of education

20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Delafontaine, Historians as Expert Judicial Witnesses in Tobacco Litigation: A Controversial Legal Practice, 2, 26, 41, 61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Johanna Sköld, "The Truth About Abuse? A Comparative Approach to Inquiry Narratives on Historical Institutional Child Abuse," *History of Education* 45, no. 4 (2016): 498.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Berber Bevernage and Chris Lorenz, "Breaking up Time – Negotiating the Borders between Present, Past and Future. An Introduction," in *Breaking up Time: Negotiating the Borders between Present, Past and Future*, eds. Chris Lorenz, et al. (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2013), 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Marc Depaepe, "The Ten Commandments of Good Practices in History of Education Research," *Zeitschrift für pädagogische Historiographie* 16 (2010): 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés, "Towards a Public History of Education: A Manifesto," in *Exhibiting the Past: Public Histories of Education*, ed. Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés (Oldenbourg: De Gruyter, 2023), 15–16.

when they engage with educational reform.<sup>33</sup> In a similar vein, David Tyack and Larry Cuban have argued for the relevance of historical knowledge when addressing current educational issues: since many of the solutions debated today have been tried before, history offers analyses that can aid current policymakers.<sup>34</sup> In this respect, Richard Aldrich has noted that the history of education has an important function to fill, as it can support informed discussions as well as decision-making.<sup>35</sup>

While the role of historians in current politics has been discussed, historians of education and childhood have on several occasions been directly engaged in politics. Well-known examples include the above-mentioned Dianne Ravitch and Maris Vinovskis, who were involved in the George H. W. Bush and Bill Clinton administrations, but also the English historian of education Brian Simon. Such involvement also includes a wide range of truth and inquiry commissions concerning the abuse that has faced children in the past. As mentioned in Matthew Keynes' article in this special issue, more than forty countries have established truth commissions to investigate historical wrongs during the last three decades. In these contexts, historians are not only directly involved in the political process but are also intending to actively contribute to this process by offering, for example, justice and recognition.<sup>36</sup> In such instances, historians of education are not merely shedding critical light on distant events in past, but also clearly attempting to contribute to a just cause in the present. The articles of this special issue certainly address this issue of the relationship between the past and present in particularly challenging cases, including those of Australia, South Africa and Brazil.

# Method: Narrative, Positionality, and Discomfort

Entangled with these challenges of critique, truth and politics, are questions of method. What methods and approaches are needed in societies where skepticism towards accepted truths is commonplace, and where critical analysis has become an important part of state governance? While the critical traditions of the history of education certainly can remain an important source of inspiration, other disciplines can offer useful lessons. Of particular interest in this respect is the interdisciplinary field of Indigenous Studies, where these questions of critique are essential.

Firstly, Indigenous studies may aid us in reflecting on the kind of critical narratives produced. In Indigenous studies, scholars have argued for replacing narratives focusing on damage, destruction, deficit and oppression, and instead focusing on producing

161 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Diane Ravitch and Maris A. Vinovskis, eds., *Learning from the Past: What History Teaches Us about School Reform* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1995), ix.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> David Tyack and Larry Cuban, *Tinkering toward Utopia: A Century of Public School Reform* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Richard Aldrich, "The Three Duties of the Historian of Education," *History of Education* 32, no. 2 (2003): 136–137

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Johanna Sköld, "The Truth About Abuse? A Comparative Approach to Inquiry Narratives on Historical Institutional Child Abuse," *History of Education* 45, no. 4 (2016): 493.

critical studies which, while critical, are also future-oriented.<sup>37</sup> This is to be distinguished from a liberal understanding of the future as ever-unfolding progress, but instead implies a reparative orientation towards the past and the building of more just futures.<sup>38</sup> In this respect, the articles of this special issue raise several important questions. These include how we can historicise and understand so-called "difficult" past events, and where the value of such histories lies. Does the critical value merely lie in shedding light on a problematic past, or does the main value lie in how those difficult stories make us feel, or make us want to enact some social change? In this respect, Indigenous studies raise interesting questions concerning core features of critical histories of education, both in relation to social change, but also concerning the costs and benefits of such historical work.

Such questions relate to questions of what is "difficult" or traumatic in the histories we produce. Can critical histories of education address matters which are traumatic or difficult, and when we address such issues, what are the ethical considerations required? That is, what are the ethics of attempting to access the trauma of other individuals, or groups to which we do not belong, both now and in the past? In that sense, such questions certainly concern the intended impact of our research. When we conduct critical research, who benefits from our research and what are the risks involved? There is certainly great potential in examining phenomena such as colonial violence, and other kinds of violence and discrimination based on social class, gender, ethnicity and age. But the risks involved must be assessed. This may concern both the impact of research results, and the focal points of the research. The latter may include how research exploring individual experiences of violence might overshadow the societal and institutional features of such experiences.

A second lesson concerns that of politics. Critical research may in this respect be informed by reflections on how we position ourselves politically, and how this shapes our perspectives. Indigenous scholars and educators have argued that the choice to be political or not is only available to some researchers, in some contexts. In a sense, it is obviously difficult to stay out of politics as an educational researcher. As Elizabeth McKinley and Linda Tuhiwai Smith remind us, education is "always political." While this is less salient when addressing certain research questions in the more distant past, this is particularly true in specific contexts. Pat O'Shane, the first Aboriginal teacher in the Australian state of Queensland, has pointed out that Indigenous people have "no

162 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Eve Tuck, "Suspending Damage: A Letter to Communities," *Harvard Educational Review* 79, no. 3 (2009): 409–428.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Arathi Sriprakash, "Reparations: Theorising just Futures of Education," *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education* 44, no. 5 (2023): 782–975.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Elizabeth Ann McKinley and Linda Tuhiwai Smith, "Towards Self-Determination in Indigenous Education Research: An Introduction," in *Handbook of Indigenous Education*, ed. Elizabeth Ann McKinley and Linda Tuhiwai Smith (Singapore: Springer, 2019), 17.

choice but to be political."<sup>40</sup> The politics and positionality of Indigenous peoples – working on and in Western education systems – means that they have a different set of choices than those faced by non-Indigenous scholars. Madeline Whetung expresses this by explaining:

Under settler colonialism, Indigenous people are fighting a war on many different battlefields. But you don't have to fight the war at all if you're a non-Indigenous researcher; you don't *have* to do anything.<sup>41</sup>

Linked to this issue of politics, a third key lesson from Indigenous studies relates to that of positionality. While reflecting on positionality remains rare in the field of history of education, it has become standard practice within Indigenous studies to identify one's own position, and for researchers to critically and reflexively orient themselves in relation to their research aims and outcomes, their position in the academy, as well as society more generally. This practice has emerged from community-based directives about research ethics and is increasingly expected by the formalized process of gaining ethical approval from relevant authorities, which includes stating the anticipated costs and benefits of the research.<sup>42</sup>

Raising such questions concerning the personal and the political holds potential for critical histories of education, but it is not without some pitfalls. There are certainly instances where such reflections may appear as irrelevant, or as a luxury afforded to ivory tower academics. But there are also other difficult questions concerning how it feels to engage in the research, writing and teaching of difficult histories that often will be relevant. These are particularly challenging when historians explore histories we might label as traumatic. How can we acknowledge the ways this makes us feel as historians, without centering those feelings on ourselves, or using them to deflect responsibility, or as a "move to innocence"?<sup>43</sup>

Acknowledging that discomfort may follow from critical research, and recognising that it is often connected to one's positionality, is an important lesson from Indigenous studies. Indeed, as Eve Tuck and K. Wayne Yang remind us, it should remain so, as "solidarity is an uneasy, reserved and unsettled matter that neither reconciles present

163 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Pat O'Shane cited in Andrea Booth, "No choice but Politics for Indigenous Women: Pat O'Shane," *SBS News*, March 24, 2015, https://www.sbs.com.au/news/article/no-choice-but-politics-for-indigenous-women-pat-oshane/qwvv825mh.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Madeline Whetung and Sarah Wakefield, "Colonial Conventions: Institutionalized Research Relationships and Decolonizing Research Ethics," in *Indigenous and Decolonizing Studies in Education: Mapping the Long View*, ed. Linda Tuhiwai Smith, Eve Tuck, and K Wayne Yang (London: Routledge, 2019), 152.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Gioconda Coello and Ligia (Licho) Lópes López, "Futures Taking Place," in *Indigenous Futures and Learnings Taking Place* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2021), 1–7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Eve Tuck and K. Wayne Yang, "Decolonization Is not a Metaphor," *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society* 1, no. 1 (2012): 1–40.

grievances nor forecloses future conflict."<sup>44</sup> This emphasis on discomfort differs from the hopeful ambitions of some strands of critical research, in which truth is supposed to deliver lessons, identify solutions or liberate us from false accounts of the past. Yet this continuing uneasiness might also be viewed as an opportunity to stay reflective of the researcher's own position, and to remain aware of the kind of past that is under study. Discomfort may also be formulated as a question concerning the criteria of critical research – can critical research really be critical if it does not evoke discomfort? – but also as a challenge for critical histories of education: to explore topics that make the researcher feel uneasy.

### **Audience: Oppression, Activism and Urgency**

A final challenge for critical historians of education reflecting on critique, truth, politics and methods concerns that of the audience. Critical histories cannot exist in isolation but require, almost by definition, that they reach and engage with an audience. The question is, however, how to accomplish this? If we are to write such histories of education, what is the purpose and audience for our work? What roles might historians take on, if the aim is to recover from the past that which can be used to counter the current crises we are facing, and to build sustainable futures?

When addressing such questions, which in their essence address the issue of the relevance and meaningfulness of the critical history of education, Indigenous Studies may provide us with some points of discussion. The first concerns how we engage with those who are oppressed, now and in the past. This issue is linked to the limitations of critique that have been noted above, and in particular the inherent limitations of such practices when they take place in the wealthy minority world of the West.<sup>45</sup> An approach to deal with these challenges is to allow research to be informed by the interests and needs of those who suffer and have suffered. An example of such an approach is the Nova Scotia Restorative Justice Program's inquiry into the Nova Scotia Home for Colored Children. This program took direction from former residents, who identified the imperative to examine the past in order to address the racism experienced by African Nova Scotians in the present in deliberately restorative ways. 46 The inquiry was based on the vision of the former residents, who contributed to the collaborative research design, and produced a curriculum aiming to support reconciliation. Such attempts at collaborative efforts may reduce some of the distance between historical research and researchers and the past, by responding to the kind of knowledge that currently is in demand.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Tuck and Yang, "Decolonization Is not a Metaphor," 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> McArthur, "Critical Theory in a Decolonial Age," 1681–1692.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Province of Nova Scotia, *Journey to Light: A Different Way Forward* (2019): 3–14.

Such public inquiries may certainly provide historians of education with an excellent opportunity to engage with contemporary issues and contribute to the development of policy as well as public debate. Making histories of education both educative to a broader public audience, and sensitive to the community affected, is, however, a challenging task.<sup>47</sup> Whether such public engagement will have positive results for those involved is also far from evident. The gaps between historical research, policy action and implementation are often significant. The result of historical research may also uncover information that questions commonly held assumptions, which is not necessarily appreciated by any of the parties involved.

A second issue to consider concerns the potential of linking research to contemporary political activism. Historians of education might be guided by the imperatives of contemporary campaigns for educational justice and inclusion, and the principles of what Kamilaroi education scholar Nikki Moodie describes as a "reparative activism" approach: that is, research that is "relevant, supports self-determination and consequently develops from critique to include a theory of change."48 For instance, the abolitionist "No More Exclusions" program in the United Kingdom draws on the history of school discipline in British imperialism in their campaign for exclusion policy reform. In Australia, the National Indigenous Youth Education Coalition recently launched the School Exclusion Project based on a national history of exclusionary practices in government school systems. 49 This campaign was developed in response to issues identified by Indigenous young people and includes tools for developing historically informed advocacy for more inclusive disciplinary policies. In such projects, research has a double function. These projects simultaneously draw upon community-identified research agendas and seek to use historical expertise to build more just educational futures.50

As a result, these projects also raise an important question about the position and role of critical histories of education. While several of the critical approaches presented above in this article stress the importance of distance and dispassionate analyses of educational injustice, these projects take a contrary stance. Instead of a critique based on distance, this is a critique based on collaboration with the involved communities.

165 | Encounters 25, 2024, 152 - 171

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Nelleke Bakker, "Memories of Harm in Institutions of Care: The Dutch Historiography of Institutional Child Abuse from a Comparative Perspective," *Exhibiting the Past: Public Histories of Education, ed. Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, María del Mar del Pozo Andrés (Oldenbourg: De Gruyter, 2022),* 290.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Nikki Moodie, "Decolonising Race Theory: Place, Survivance and Sovereignty," in *The Relationality of Race in Education Research*, ed. Greg Vass et al. (Abingdon: Routledge, 2018): 33–46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> No More Exclusions, https://www.nomoreexclusions.com/, accessed February 1, 2024; National Indigenous Youth Education Coalition, *The School Exclusion Project Report*, https://www.niyec.com/the-school-exclusion-project, accessed March 22, 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Sriprakash, "Reparations," 782–795.

The third question that Indigenous studies raise concerns urgency. In order to escape a trivialisation of critique, how can histories of education address truly urgent issues? Attending to student protests is an example of how historians might heed the urgency of the present in the past. Student protests centered on issues like nationalistic curriculum, discipline and gendered facilities and uniforms, for example, show us what is important to students now and as such, provide direction for interrogating the historical precedents or systems upon which the contemporary issue has emerged.<sup>51</sup>

School strikes also provide an excellent starting point for indicating urgent topics to be explored by critical histories of education, as they in various ways address the legacies of the past: such as School Strikes for Climate, for Palestine, for decolonising the curriculum, and the Black Lives Matter movement.<sup>52</sup> These recent collective student actions have responded to student-identified immediate needs: to protest political inaction regarding the climate crisis, and police violence against racialized groups as recent global examples. The interconnectedness of student demonstrations against colonisation and colonial education systems and curriculum is already mirrored in the renewed field of history of education, colonization and empire, and public history.<sup>53</sup> In these ways, student activism presents historians of education with a rich source of inspiration and direction for future-oriented, applied historical research.

#### Conclusion

This article has addressed the question of how to research and write critical histories of education in the twenty-first century. In that sense, it responds to the thematic focus of this issue, being the current social, economic, political and environmental challenges that we face, as well as a certain culture where critical perspectives have become commonplace and arguably 'lost steam'. How should we write critical histories of education in societies where the skepticism towards accepted truths is widespread, and where critical analysis of ourselves and others is key to neoliberal assessment practices?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> John Bartlett, "Students Surge back to Chile's Streets as Schools remain Hotbed of Protest," *The Guardian,* November 1, 2022; C. T. Jones, "Oklahoma Students Walk out over Trans Student Nex Benedict's Death," *Rolling Stone,* February 26, 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Jeremy Phu Howard, "As a Student, I'm Striking for Climate Action. If you're Worried or Angry about the Climate Crisis, Join us," *The Guardian* (Aus), November 17, 2023; Anneleen Kenis, "Clashing Tactics, Clashing Generations: The Politics of the School Strikes for Climate in Belgium," *Politics and Governance* 9, no. 2 (2021): 135–145; Aditya Chakrabortty, "How Do young Britons See the Massacre in Gaza? These Luton Students will Tell you," *The Guardian*, December 7, 2023; Mihir Zaveri, "I Need People to Hear my Voice': Teens Protest Racism," *The New York Times*, June 23, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> See, for example, the special issue "Statue Wars," of *Public History Review* 28 (2021); Dr Aunty Doris Paton, Beth Marsden, and Jessica Horton, "No Time for A History Lessons: The Contest over Memorials to Angus McMillan on Gunaikurnai Country," *Aboriginal History* 46 (2022): 3–27; Rebecca Swartz, "Histories of Empire and Histories of Education," *History of Education* 52, no. 2 (2022): 442–461; Tony Ballantyne, "Education, Difference and Reform in the Pacific and Modern British Empire," *History of Education* 52, no. 5 (2022), 697–716.

In this article we address this question by considering four key elements of critical research in the history of education: critique, truth, method, and the intended audience. As such, we have argued that critical histories of the twenty-first century need to be aware of the critical traditions that exist, how these have been challenged and changed, and to address ongoing issues of truth and politics. How is the relation between critique and truth envisioned, and what is the intended relationship between such critical research and politics? Using Indigenous Studies as a vantage point, we have also provided some reflections on how looking beyond discipline history to fields such as Indigenous Studies can provoke new thinking on long-standing questions of truth, politics, method, and audience.

While this article certainly is not in the position to provide the answers for how critical histories of education should be written in the twenty-first century, it has consequently provided a list of considerations items that are useful to discuss when designing such critical research. These include reflecting on what kind of are produced, the positionality of the researcher, the discomfort that the research produces, and how this research engages with an audience. The latter concerns how the critical research relates to groups that are or have been oppressed in the past, activism and the urgency of contemporary education and societal issues. Of particular importance in that respect is to consider where the critical value of the research lies, and to what extent in what ways, and to what ends, the research produces actions. In that sense, this article certainly raises questions concerning the role of discomfort in history of education research, and whether critical histories should not only provoke discomfort but also have the ability to promote restorative or transformative actions.

# **Bibliography**

- Aldridge, Derrick. "The Ideas and Craft of the Critical Historian of Education." In *Critical Approaches to the Study of Higher Education: A Practical Introduction*, edited by Ana M. Martínez Alemán, Brian Pusser, and Estela Mara Bensimon, 103–129. Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2015.
- Ambo, Theresa Stewart. "The Future Is in the Past: How Land-Grab Universities can Shape the Future of Higher Education." *Journal of the Native American and Indigenous Studies Association* (NAIS) 8, no.1, (2021): 162–168.
- Axster, Sabrina. "'We Try to Humanise Their Stories': Interrogating the Representation of Migrants and Refugees through the Shift from 'Poverty Porn' to Humanisation and Resilience." *Millennium* 51, no. 2 (2023): 615–639.
- Bakker, Nelleke. "Memories of Harm in Institutions of Care: The Dutch Historiography of Institutional Child Abuse from a Comparative Perspective." In *Exhibiting the Past:*

- Public Histories of Education, edited by Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés, 289–308. Oldenbourg: De Gruyter, 2023.
- Ballantyne, Tony. "Education, Difference and Reform in the Pacific and Modern British Empire." *History of Education* 52, no. 5 (2022): 697–716.
- Bartlett, John. "Students Surge back to Chile's Streets as Schools Remain Hotbed of Protest." *The Guardian,* November 1, 2022.
- Bookins, Julia Akinyi. "Tracking Undergraduate History Enrollments in 2023." Perspectives: American Historical Association, April 16, 2024.
- Bruno-Jofré, Rosa. "History of Education in Canada: Historiographic 'Turns' and Widening Horizons." *Paedagogica Historica* 50, no. 6 (2014): 774–785.
- Chakrabortty, Aditya. "How Do young Britons See the Massacre in Gaza? These Luton students will Tell you." *The Guardian*, December 7, 2023.
- Coello, Gioconda, and Ligia (Licho) Lópes López. "Futures Taking Place." In *Indigenous Futures and Learnings Taking Place*. Abingdon: Routledge, 2021.
- Cook Sather, A. "Sound, Presence and Power: Student Voice in Educational Research and Reform." *Curriculum Inquiry* 36 (2006): 359–390.
- Crotty, Martin, Frank Bongiorno, and Paul Sendzuik. "Our Research Shows the Number of History Academics in Australia has Dropped by at least 31% since 1989." *The Conversation* (Aus), October 12, 2023.
- De Wilde, Lieselot, Bruno Vanobbergen, and Sarah Van Bouchaute. "Exhibiting the Past: Life after the Apology: Making the Unspeakable Visible." In *Public Histories of Education*, edited by Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés, 59–76. Oldenbourg: De Gruyter, 2023.
- Delafontaine, Ramses. *Historians as Expert Judicial Witnesses in Tobacco Litigation: A Controversial Legal Practice*. Heidelberg: Springer International Publishing, 2015.
- Depaepe, Marc. "The Ten Commandments of Good Practices in History of Education Research." *Zeitschrift für pädagogische Historiographie* 16 (2010): 3–49.
- Donato, Ruben, and Marvin Lazerson. "New Directions in American Educational History: Problems and Prospects." *Educational Researcher* 29, no. 8 (2000): 4–15.
- Evans, Richard J. "History, Memory, and the Law: The Historian as Expert Witness." *History and Theory* 41, no. 3 (2002): 326–345.
- Gleason, Mona. "Avoiding the Agency Trap: Caveats for Historians of Children, Youth, and Education." *History of Education* 45, no. 4 (2016): 446–459.
- Herman, Frederik, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés. "Towards a Public History of Education: A Manifesto." In *Exhibiting the Past: Public Histories of Education*, edited by Frederik Herman, Sjaak Braster, and María del Mar del Pozo Andrés, 1–38. Oldenbourg: De Gruyter, 2023.
- Hobsbawm, Eric. "History from Below Some Reflections." In *History from Below:*Studies in Popular Protest and Popular Ideology, edited by Frederick Krantz, 13–27. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1988.

- Jones, C. T. "Oklahoma Students Walk Out Over Trans Student Nex Benedict's Death," *Rolling Stone*, February 26, 2024.
- Kenis, Anneleen. "Clashing Tactics, Clashing Generations: The Politics of the School Strikes for Climate in Belguim." *Politics and Governance* 9, no. 2 (2021): 135–145.
- Latour, Bruno. "Why Has Critique Run out of Steam? From Matters of Fact to Matters of Concern." *Critical Inquiry* 30 (2004): 225–248.
- Malkki, Liisa H. "Speechless Emissaries: Refugees, Humanitarianism, and Dehistoricization." *Cultural Anthropology* 11, no. 3 (1996): 377–404.
- Masschelein, Jan. "How to Conceive of Critical Educational Theory Today?" *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 38, no. 3 (2004): 351–367.
- McArthur, Jan. "Critical Theory in a Decolonial Age." *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 54, no. 10 (2022): 1681–1692.
- McCoy, Meredith. "Pausing and Contributing towards Indigenous Futures: A Pedagogical Reflection on College History Classrooms." *Curriculum Inquiry* 10 (2024): 1–20.
- McCulloch, Gary. The Struggle for the History of Education. London: Routledge, 2011.
- McKinley, Elizabeth Ann, and Linda Tuhiwai Smith. "Towards Self-Determination in Indigenous Education Research: An Introduction." In *Handbook of Indigenous Education*, edited by Elizabeth Ann McKinley and Linda Tuhiwai Smith, 1–15. Singapore: Springer, 2019.
- Menzel. Kelly, and Bindi Bennett. "There Is no such Thing as a blank Slate:
  Accountability in Decolonising Universities." In *The Routledge Handbook of Australian Indigenous Peoples and Futures,* edited by Bronwyn Carlson, Madi Day, Sandy O'Sullivan, and Tristan Kennedy, 103–122. London: Routledge, 2023.
- Mills, Martin, and Glenda McGregor. *Re-engaging Young People in Education: Learning From Alternative Schools.* London: Routledge: 2014.
- Moodie, Nikki. "Decolonising Race Theory: Place, Survivance and Sovereignty." *The Relationality of Race in Education Research*, edited by Greg Vass, Jacinta Maxwell, Sophie Rudoplh, and Kalervo. N Gulson, 33–46. Abingdon: Routledge, 2018.
- No More Exclusions, https://www.nomoreexclusions.com/, accessed February 1, 2024.

  National Indigenous Youth Education Coalition, <u>The School Exclusion Project Report,</u> accessed March 22, 2024.
- O'Shane, Pat. In Andrea Booth, "No choice but politics for Indigenous women: Pat O'Shane," SBS News (Aus), March 24, 2015.
- Paton, Aunty Doris, Beth Marsden, and Jessica Horton. "No Time for A History Lessons: The Contest over Memorials to Angus McMillan on Gunaikurnai Country." *Aboriginal History* 46 (2022): 3–27.

- Phu Howard, Jeremy. "As a student, I'm striking for climate action. If you're worried or angry about the climate crisis, join us," *The Guardian* (Aus), November 17, 2023.
- Province of Nova Scotia. Journey to Light: A Different Way Forward, 2019.
- Ravitch, Diane, and Maris A. Vinovskis, eds. *Learning from the Past: What History Teaches us about School Reform.* Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1995.
- Quinn, Ben. "Former British Colonies Owe 'Debt of Gratitude', Says Robert Jenrick." The Guardian (UK), October 29, 2024.
- Rose, Nikolas. *Governing the Soul: The Shaping of the Private Self.* London: Free Association Books, 1999.
- Rosenzweig, Roy, and David P. Thelen. *The Presence of the Past: Popular Uses of History in American Life*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1998.
- Rothman, David J. "Serving Clio and Client: The Historian as Expert Witness." *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 77, no. 1 (2003): 25–44.
- Ruckstuhlm, Katharina, Irma A Velasques Nimatuj, John-Andrew McNeish, and Nancy Postero. "Indigenous Futurities: Rethinking Indigenous Development." In *The Routledge Handbook of Indigenous Development*, edited by Katharina Ruckstuhlm, Irma A Velasques Nimatuj, John-Andrew McNeish, and Nancy Postero. Abingdon: Routledge, 2023.
- Rüsen, Jörn. "Historical Narration: Foundation, Types, Reason." *History and Theory* 26, no. 4 (1987).
- Sköld, Johanna. "The Truth About Abuse? A Comparative Approach to Inquiry Narratives on Historical Institutional Child Abuse." *History of Education* 45, no. 4 (2016): 492–509.
- Sköld, Johanna, and Shurlee Swain, eds. *Apologies and the Legacy of Abuse of Children in Care: International Perspectives.* Cham: Palgrave MacMillan, 2015.
- Sriprakash, Arathi. "Reparations: Theorising just Futures of Education." *Discourse:* Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education 44, no. 5 (2023): 782–795.
- Susen, Simon. *The 'Postmodern Turn' in the Social Sciences*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- Swartz, Rebecca. "Histories of Empire and Histories of Education." *History of Education* 52, no. 2 (2022): 442–461.
- Thompson, E. P. "Time, Work-Discipline, and Industrial Capitalism." *Past & Present* 38, no. 1 (1967): 56–97.
- Tuck, Eve. "Suspending Damage: A Letter to Communities." *Harvard Educational Review* 79, no. 3 (2009): 409–428.
- Tuck, Eve, and K. Wayne Yang. "Decolonization Is not a Metaphor." *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society* 1, no. 1 (2012): 1–40.
- Tuhiwai Smith, Linda. "Building a Research Agenda for Indigenous Epistemologies and Education." *Anthropology and Education Quarterly* 36 (2005): 93–95.

- Whetung, Madeline, and Sarah Wakefield. "Colonial Conventions: Institutionalized Research Relationships and Decolonising Research Ethics." In *Indigenous and Decolonizing Studies in Education: Mapping the Long View*, edited by Linda Tuhiwai Smith, Eve Tuck, and K Wayne Yang, 149–162. London: Routledge, 2019.
- Zaveri, Mihir. "I need People to Hear my Voice': Teens Protest Racism." *The New York Times*, June 23, 2020; https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/23/us/teens-protest-black-lives-matter.html