## Early Theatre

A Journal Associated with the Records of Early English Drama

# The Erotics of Salvage

John Yargo 匝

Volume 26, numéro 1, 2023

URI : https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1108219ar DOI : https://doi.org/10.12745/et.26.1.4996

Aller au sommaire du numéro

### Éditeur(s)

McMaster University Library Press / Becker Associates

ISSN

1206-9078 (imprimé) 2293-7609 (numérique)

### Découvrir la revue

#### Citer cet article

Yargo, J. (2023). The Erotics of Salvage. *Early Theatre*, *26*(1), 29–52. https://doi.org/10.12745/et.26.1.4996



### Résumé de l'article

In the aftermath of the storm in The Tempest, as Miranda suffers vicariously with the shipwrecked passengers, Prospero imposes meaning onto the environmental catastrophe. Imbricating maritime salvage, physical saving, and theological salvation, Prospero insists on a temporality of supersession in which catastrophe allows one political order to displace an older, corrupt paradigm. But the act of salvaging deepens Miranda's erotic attachment to Ferdinand and complicates the social affiliations of the island. Alternately, Caliban, inverting the erotics of salvage, dramatizes how racialized perception saturates experiential encounters with the storm.

All Rights Reserved © John Yargo, 2023

érudit

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/

### Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

https://www.erudit.org/fr/

## The Erotics of Salvage

In the aftermath of the storm in The Tempest, as Miranda suffers vicariously with the shipwrecked passengers, Prospero imposes meaning onto the environmental catastrophe. Imbricating maritime salvage, physical saving, and theological salvation, Prospero insists on a temporality of supersession in which catastrophe allows one political order to displace an older, corrupt paradigm. But the act of salvaging deepens Miranda's erotic attachment to Ferdinand and complicates the social affiliations of the island. Alternately, Caliban, inverting the erotics of salvage, dramatizes how racialized perception saturates experiential encounters with the storm.

Environmental catastrophe delivered a shock to the affective and intellectual lives of the early moderns. William Strachey's *A True Reportory*, which narrates how a 1609 sea storm battered the *Sea Venture*, captures that psychic turbulence:

For it is most true there ariseth commonly no such unmerciful tempest, compound of so many contrary and diverse [motions], but that it worketh upon the whole frame of the body, and most loathsomely affecteth all the powers thereof. And the manner of the sickness it lays upon the body, being so unsufferable, gives not the mind any free and quiet time to use her judgment and empire.<sup>1</sup>

I turn to *A True Reportory* not to revisit the long-standing debates over whether a manuscript of this account was a source for Shakespeare's *The Tempest* but to attend to the critical scrutiny that Strachey's narrative brings to the representation of environmental catastrophe.<sup>2</sup> *A True Reportory* dramatizes the uncertainties of narrating within rather than outside the storm. The sea storm and sea fire are everywhere shadowed by the potential fallacy of narrativizing environmental catastrophe. Strachey renders how it feels to encounter these sudden, disruptive events while deprived of aesthetic or intellectual distance: 'For four and twenty

John Yargo (<u>yargo@bc.edu</u>) is a visiting assistant professor in the department of English at Boston College.

hours the storm in a restless tumult had blown so exceedingly as we could not apprehend in our imaginations any possibility of greater violence<sup>3</sup>.

Like Strachey's prose account, *The Tempest* asks its audience to inhabit the present tense of the sea storm, losing their temporal and spatial bearings. The storm is in this sense an 'untimely' catastrophe whose significance shuttles between the past, present, and future. The storm carries us beyond what Jona-than Gil Harris has called the 'firmly policed borders' and 'shaping constitution' of the 'national sovereignty model of temporality' in literary criticism.<sup>4</sup> Harris does not write about catastrophe, but the sea storm in *The Tempest* qualifies as an event 'that cross[es] temporal borders' and 'change[s] our understanding of temporality'.<sup>5</sup> The play returns again and again to the subject of catastrophe: the Boatswain and Gonzalo's tense exchange, Prospero and Miranda's descriptions of the storm on the shore, and later in Ferdinand's speeches.<sup>6</sup> Though Prospero imposes an aftermath onto the catastrophe never really has a before or an after.

My analysis of the play speaks directly to the affordances of reading Shakespearean drama in the Anthropocene.<sup>7</sup> This article's phenomenologically-oriented reading of *The Tempest* shifts attention from the field of theory and ideology to the lived experience of environmental catastrophe. 'Experience' refers to, in Timothy Harrison's words, 'nothing other than openness to the world — to the influence of nurture, to the realm of engagement with other things and persons'.<sup>8</sup> Departing from an ecocriticism that converges on scientific or religious dogma, experiential ecocriticism invites us to dwell in the first-person present of environmental encounter.<sup>9</sup> Inhabiting the 'flamed amazement' (1.2.198) of the sailor clinging to the mast, the crew member rushing over the yards, or the prince jumping overboard, we can recuperate the tentative practices through which knowledge about environmental catastrophe was made and circulated.<sup>10</sup> By doing so, we might yet understand how the problems of mimetically representing environmental catastrophe came to matter to the play's audiences in the first place.<sup>11</sup>

What I have been describing up to this point as experiential ecocriticism would seem to exclude a reckoning with the histories of violence and subjugation embedded in the play's treatment of Ariel and Caliban, so urgently explored by Ania Loomba, Kim F. Hall, Paul Brown, Patricia Akhimie, Meredith Anne Skura, Rachel Bryant, Kimberly Ann Coles, and Arthur L. Little, Jr.<sup>12</sup> But racialization and colonialism also creep into the first-person phenomenological tense.<sup>13</sup> The question remains, for instance, of who gets to represent their experiences. While Miranda watches the sea storm from the shore, 'suffering with those that [she] saw suffer' (1.2.86–7), Caliban is 'stied' in a 'hard rock', kept from 'the rest o' th'

island' (343–5). Nor do his experiences overcome the narrative strictures of Prospero's or Miranda's story about environmental catastrophe. Additionally, Trinculo's description of what he sees when he looks at Caliban reflects how racialization often becomes misconstrued as a reflexive or preconscious behaviour, thus reinforcing oppressive hierarchies. The events and perceptions broadly collected under the category of experience inescapably depend on habituated practices of racialization.

By borrowing twenty-first century language for environmental crisis ('catastrophe'), this article seeks to complicate, rather than repudiate, the play's relationship to historical context. From the first scene of *The Tempest*, the play articulates what I am calling here the logic of salvage — in short, the premise that the storm will wipe away the status quo, and labour and language will convert Italy into something better (though we do not see what the something better is).<sup>14</sup> The bodies of the ship's passengers are salvaged, yes: but, as we have long recognized about triumphalist paradigms, the salvage-and-restoration trope exercises monopolistic authority over which experiences can (or cannot) be memorialized. *The Tempest* explores the aesthetic implications of such a restoration. Parsing various attempts to rhetorize the sea storm in Shakespeare's play, I use the term salvage to conceptualize how characters such as Ferdinand, Miranda, and Prospero manage the affective, erotic, and narrative confusion thrown up by the storm. The just-so story of salvage imposes a set of values that refuses individuals, beliefs, and histories that cannot fit onto the lifeboat borne away from the wreckage.<sup>15</sup>

I begin by arguing that *The Tempest* pulls apart the congruences and antinomies in the early modern lexical salvage/save/salvation cluster.<sup>16</sup> The play dramatizes the erotics of salvage, the compulsive desire to know, control, discipline, and possess survivors of environmental catastrophe. The desire of a voyeuristic audience attaches to a rescued individual but then goes on to disrupt and reorganize the interpersonal dynamics on the island. Prospero insists on a redemptive framework to palliate catastrophe's sexual aftershocks. This article turns to the play's racialization of its 'salvage and deformed slave', Caliban, in relation to the tropes of wreck and redemption.<sup>17</sup> A brief coda examines the non-human dimension of ecological salvage: I propose that *The Tempest*'s storm is a portal through which the island unexpectedly breaks free from a system of human narrativizing.

### Save: Salvage: Salvation

In calculating the cost of catastrophe, Prospero can grieve only death and injury:

There is no soul — No, not so much perdition as an hair Betide to any creature in the vessel. (1.2.29–30)

This is the narrow ethical vision by which Prospero frames environmental catastrophe. The exiled mage consoles Miranda, who suffers 'with those who suffer' (6), but he passes over the deeply unsettling screams of the ship's passengers that affect her: 'O, the cry did knock / Against my very heart' (8–9). Ignoring her vicarious experience of suffering, Prospero explains that he 'so safely ordered' (29) what appears as 'The direful spectacle of the wreck' (26) that no one died and the ship itself was salvaged. The reference to 'perdition', charged with theological significance, suggests that the passengers ought to be grateful for the salvation Prospero offers. Once it establishes that everyone survives without any physical maiming or debilitation, Prospero's officially endorsed narrative largely suppresses Miranda's vicarious pain. This suppression is what I am describing as the logic of salvage.<sup>18</sup> By salvage I mean the intellectual, aesthetic, and material practices that guide the afterwards of ecological catastrophe toward safety, equability even, and yet also the ante status quo.

The triumph of salvage over environmental catastrophe; or, better yet, the enveloping of environmental catastrophe by salvage. Although Shakespeare does not use the word salvage here — and its meaning was evolving rapidly in the first decades of the seventeenth century — the clustered meanings of 'save', 'salvage', and 'salvation' operate in the play. In the first decades of the seventeenth century, the word that most closely approximates the modern meaning is 'save', which held a wide range of connotations: rescuing, affording salvation, preserving, keeping, sheltering, deliverance.<sup>19</sup> From the fifteenth century, the word meant 'to salvage from shipwreck'. Writers often observed in the lexical constellation around 'save' both the spiritual significance of 'salvation' and the maritime meaning of 'salvage'. These three terms converge around a temporality of supersession: a fragmented, probably corrupt and ineffective, order of being is soon displaced by a charismatic new order that promises to transfigure the status quo. Salvage's transfiguration of the status quo is paradoxical — a landscape turned upside down, altered profoundly, but also mutatis mutandis the same, unchanged landscape.

As Europeans increasingly commercialized the seas, both English theorists and government authorities debated the medieval legal precedents about salvage rights. The jurist Henry of Bracton (ca 1210–68) insisted that rulers owned all rights over salvaged wrecks.<sup>20</sup> The Statute of Westminster (1275) defined how a ship becomes a salvaged object in the first place: 'Concerning wrecks of the sea, it is

agreed, that where a man, a dog, or a cat escape quick out of the ship, that such ship nor barge, nor any thing within them, shall be adjudged wreck'.<sup>21</sup> But the Statute of Westminster and the later *Black Book of the Admiralty* would restrict the total authority Bracton had given sovereigns, granting property owners a one-year-and-a-day window to claim their property. In 1613, William Welwood reiterated that claimants have a year-and-a-day deadline to bring suit before the rights pass to 'princes'. As Dan Brayton puts it, 'A lively debate over crown properties rumbled throughout the reign of Elizabeth I and those of James I and Charles I'.<sup>22</sup> In *Mare Clausum* (1663), John Selden advocated for 'closed seas', proposing that owners had inalienable rights to their property. Salvage restores what storms (temporarily) throw into disarray. Selden writes, 'If they suffered shipwreck, [crews] had libertie to recover as many of their goods as they could'.<sup>23</sup> As Hayley Cotter demonstrates, knowledge about salvage law, from piracy to salvage, circulated through pamphlets, proclamation, and other popular writing.<sup>24</sup>

In addition to the legal and maritime discourses, Calvinist theology shaped the cultural meaning of storms and shipwrecks. Miranda leverages these metaphysical implications to justify unequal material conditions. Miranda racializes Caliban's moral unsalvagability by remarking,

> Abhorred slave Which any print of goodness will not take Being capable of all ill.

### (1.2.351-2)

Caliban's rejection of the 'print of goodness' appears as a rationale for his enslavement. According to the English variety of Calvinism that was influential in the early seventeenth century, the intrinsic difference between the salvageable (Ferdinand) and the unsalvageable (Caliban) is evidence of a sort of cosmic uplift. The dispensation of salvation leaves an individual better off, though not necessarily due to their actions or thoughts. English theologians of the early seventeenth century, such as William Perkins, discredited the presumption that 'accidents' were the result of 'meere chance'. Instead, these accidents, such as a storm delivering a wizard to an island where he then consolidates his own political rule over the natives, could be squared with a providentialist worldview.<sup>25</sup> Perkins himself argued that God 'hath ordained certaine men to salvation, to the praise of the glorie of his grace' and that we ought to attend to the 'signes and testimonies in our selves, to gather what was the eternall counsell of God concerning our salvation'.<sup>26</sup> Though none of us can actively earn our salvation or know if we are saved, we can ready ourselves affectively to accept grace.

According to sixteenth-century English theology, no one could ever be sure if they were among the elect or the damned: saved and the unsaved were muddled categories. As Lori Ann Ferrell has observed of 'how-to' manuals such as Perkins's A Golden Chain, Protestant theological writings made 'the act of reading uncomfortably akin to the Calvinist experience of prolonged uncertainty'.<sup>27</sup> And there was no reliable practice for dispersing this cloud of unknowing. Cosmic uncertainty was everywhere requisite to reading and constructing narratives about environmental catastrophe. People at times understood environmental catastrophe as divine punishment for some individual's sin, but just as often posited a broader explanatory field, such as the moral corruption of a community or all humankind. Catastrophe might set one off on the path of salvation or corruption. As a result of this theological perspective as well as a humanist pedagogy that encouraged ambivalence, early moderns self-consciously critiqued the didactic accommodations of mimetically representing large-scale catastrophes that resisted both mimetic representation and didactic accommodation.<sup>28</sup> When they took up this especially oversaturated and fluid subject, early modern English people understood themselves as actively participating in a meta-discourse.

On the one hand, salvage promises to return things to an idealized state before catastrophe rent the fabric of society while also naturalizing a process of extraction. On the other hand, salvage sets out to reincorporate the communal body, integrating all the fragments into a new and improved identity. Salvaging an heirloom shield, for instance, magically restores Pericles's selfhood after he survives a tempest; he says to the fishermen:

> Till the rough seas, that spare not any man, Took it in rage, though calmed have given't again: I thank thee for't: my shipwreck now's no ill, Since I have here my father's gift in his will. (2.1.127–30)<sup>29</sup>

That moment is a to-scale miniature of the play *Pericles*, which stages salvage as a reactionary, even imperialist, political force.<sup>30</sup> This salvific image generates a future horizon of egalitarianism and concord over which Pericles rules.<sup>31</sup> But that reincorporation depends on a logic of hierarchal value judgments — salvage extracts and preserves what it sees as worthy of being salvaged, and nothing else.

In telling his story, Prospero smuggles in the ideological machinery of salvage, which draws on the philological links that hatched nautical catastrophe (salvage and saving) and spiritual apotheosis (salvation) together. Prospero represents this salvage operation in his description of his own survival from environmental catastrophe. Prospero relates that the traitors 'hurried us aboard a bark' and then removed them to a 'rotten carcass of a butt, not rigged, / Nor tackle, sail, nor mast', a ship so broken-down that the rats 'instinctively quit it' (1.2.144–8). The boat is described as a 'carcass', as if equating the seacraft with their own corpses. The vessel's spare fittings expose the infant Miranda and Prospero to the hostile elements. After Miranda asks how they survived, Prospero answers, 'By Providence divine' (161–2). Linking their being saved from the shipwreck to the Calvinist principle of salvation gives a providentialist cast to the entire imperialist regime that he establishes on the island. Miranda and Prospero's lifeboat is set adrift at sea where the roaring waters threaten to dash their vessel to pieces. According to Prospero, 'Providence divine' explains how they made it to shore safely, and how they founded a polity on the island. Divine providence notwithstanding, *The Tempest* hinges on the premise that the catastrophe, though traumatic for Ferdinand and the other survivors, has offered Prospero an opportunity to salvage a future.

The Tempest sceptically treats Prospero's too-exclusive commitment to the logic of salvage. For both the direct and vicarious sufferers, environmental catastrophe reconditions the individual's relationship to self and to others. For instance, the spectacle of the wreck moves Miranda, despite her father's resistance, to take up again the 'bootless inquisition' into her backstory (1.2.35). The spectacle jars Miranda away from an allegiance to her father and toward a complicated inquiry into her own selfhood. Looking upon environmental catastrophe and its consequences, Miranda is curious about her own identity, but Prospero's salvage narrative — at just the moment when things might completely unravel — imposes a design on environmental catastrophe that constricts that range of possibilities. Prospero and Miranda, not the Milanese passengers on the ship, are really the victims. By relating a sentimental (and tedious) narrative about their own stormy experience, Prospero conducts Miranda's sympathy for Ferdinand toward their own family's suffering. This move is part of a larger attempt to consolidate his narrative and paternal authority over Miranda's suffering. While environmental catastrophe offers a fleeting opportunity to upend old pieties, salvage rushes in to preserve the status quo.

## The Erotics of Salvage

It is the arrival of a salvaged body that challenges Prospero's soteriological premise. When observed by Prospero and Miranda, Ferdinand's body, emerging from the wreckage, shows signs of profound emotional and physical suffering. Ariel's song makes clear that his father's body lying 'full fathom five' (1.2.397) is unrecoverable, drawing an ecological limit on what a person can salvage from catastrophe. Given his condition, Ferdinand unthinkably sets aside his grief and becomes absorbed in erotic desire. Miranda's attraction to the shaken-up Ferdinand seems to eclipse Prospero's machinations, demonstrating how catastrophe amplifies erotic desire. Environmental catastrophe strikes an erotic key in The Tempest, even exceeding Prospero's ability to anticipate the sexual attraction between his daughter and the salvaged prince. I call the love-in-the-ruins affect that magnetizes Miranda and Ferdinand to one another the erotics of salvage. This recurring plot device appears in early modern literary texts about shipwreck, in which a survivor of a catastrophe relates an experience of catastrophe and inspires a compulsive desire to attain the survivor-narrator. In The Tempest, this affective attachment of vicarious sufferer to catastrophe's direct victims destabilizes the systems of affiliation that Prospero has prescribed for the island. Prospero attempts to impose order on the catastrophe's affective and social after-effects. But his efforts at consolidating the erotics of salvage do not entirely dispel the threat to his control over their attraction.

Besides *The Tempest*, other Shakespearean salvage operations feature the eroticization of catastrophe survivors, such as in *Othello* (1603) and *Twelfth Night* (1601–2). *The Tempest* extends the scope of those earlier plays to consider why survivors of environmental catastrophe become so desirable. For one, their suffering draws in the audience's over–identification with the figure that stands outside of socially normative affiliations. In *The Tempest*, Miranda says to herself, in the hopes that Prospero will treat Ferdinand decently: 'Pity move my father / To be inclined my way' (2.1.447–8). Miranda's 'way' refers to her attraction to stormbattered Ferdinand. As Jane Hwang Degenhardt argues, Miranda's witnessing of the shipwreck mirrors a theatrical audience's beguilement and the uncertainty of a voyeur's sympathies.<sup>32</sup> More troublingly for Prospero, Miranda's 'pity' for Ferdinand could displace her filial obligations. In addition to pity's affective pull, Prospero hints that hardship makes courtship more gratifying:

> This swift business I must uneasy make, lest too light winning Make the prize light. (2.1.454)

Lastly, catastrophe gives the eroticization of survivors the sense of divine appointment amid cosmic uncertainty. Even if the orthodox Calvinist assumed that no one was certain of salvation, surviving catastrophe indicated some purpose behind one's persistence in the world. In *The Tempest*, salvage generates erotic energies in the vicarious sufferer that are all-consuming, perverse, destructive — as if in an attempt to match the intensity of the environmental catastrophe they depict. Discussions of the play have largely overlooked Miranda's sexuality, perhaps because of the unusually oppressive conditions under which it is expressed. A notable exception is Melissa Sanchez's recognition that Miranda's 'betrothal to Ferdinand offers both an idealized vision of the mutual service missing in other of the play's relations and an intricate scene of erotic and political sedition'.<sup>33</sup> Though her circumstances severely curtail Miranda's autonomy, the play presents her as sexually agential in her expressions of erotic attraction to grief-stricken Ferdinand. During their courtship, Miranda assumes control over his body and oversees his internment on the island. Early modern sexual politics often insisted on fluid power relations between the masculine and the feminine, the desired and the desiring — the sonnet tradition is just one example — but Miranda's active participation makes her complicit in Ferdinand's enslavement.

Though Ferdinand initially functions as a screen onto which Prospero and Miranda can project desires, the erotics of salvage come to be intersubjective. Miranda's attraction to Ferdinand is predicated as much on her father's praise as on the prince's affective reaction to the catastrophe, which is passive in the good Calvinist sense. When Miranda asks what kind of creature the survivor is, Prospero says,

> This gallant which thou seest Was in the wreck; and, but he's something stained With grief (that's beauty's canker) thou mightst call him A goodly person. (2.1.412–15)

Through this corporeal metaphor, the stain of suffering and his beauty become unified in Ferdinand's pathologized body. Grief and beauty further throw into relief his 'goodly', 'gallant' character. Believing his closest family and friends have perished, Ferdinand poignantly describes his grief. When the prince of Naples appears, he is 'weeping again the King my father's wreck' (391). His language captures the grief of the just-after of catastrophe. The 'again' is a hitch in his speech, a hiccup, as is the pairing of 'the King' and 'my father': both indicate involuntary tremors in Ferdinand's vocalized trauma. The 'sweet air' of Ariel's song narcotizes Ferdinand; it 'allays' the storm's 'fury' and his own 'passion' (1.2.393–4). Ferdinand in his grief is receptive to the spirit's ministrations, like William Perkins's Protestant believer who cultivates an openness to the 'signes and testimonies' of divine purpose. Like the Calvinist reader who can assert neither agency over their salvation nor epistemological confidence in their own spiritual status, Ferdinand expresses uncertainty about his control over both his own salvaged body and the

meaning attributed to his experience of catastrophe. As his responsiveness to Ariel's song demonstrates, post-catastrophe Ferdinand feels distraught but also newly sensitive to the environment around him and the cosmic meaning which saturates it. According to Ariel, the unsalvaged body of his father, King Alonso, has been transformed into 'something rich and strange' (1.2.402), which is also an apt description of Ferdinand's salvaged body. Seeing Ferdinand for the first time, Miranda is drawn to his amplified sensitivity. Miranda's attraction to Ferdinand intensifies after hearing Ferdinand's brief, compelling description of the shipwreck. Ferdinand refers to the waves' 'fury and my passion' (393). Miranda, praising his 'brave form', says:

> I might call him A thing divine, for nothing natural I ever saw so noble.

(418 - 20)

The play offers at this moment a gender reversal of Adam's first sighting of Eve, with a difference. Unlike Adam, Miranda recognizes a 'thing divine' in Ferdinand's body, despite — or, I am suggesting here, because of — his tear-streaked face, enfeebled physical resistance, and somewhat torpified mental state. She also aspires to emulate the spiritual openness available to a survivor of environmental catastrophe. In attaching her desires to a bonded, traumatized servant, Miranda thinks she might transcend her earth-bound condition. Her sexual attraction to this salvaged stranger, built on her propensity to 'suffer with those who suffer', is a chance to ladder up in a stratified, vertical cosmology.

This vicarious overidentification takes a more sinister tone in the scene when Miranda, as an adjunct to Prospero, assumes power over Ferdinand's body. Whereas the catastrophe levelled the class structure on the ship, Miranda can exert another form of domination on dry land by salvaging the prince. When Ferdinand draws his sword on Prospero, the mage suspends him. Miranda asks that her father not 'make too rash a trial of him' (1.2.468). The father-and-daughter salvage team then mocks the prince's incapacitated body. Prospero and Miranda assume a share of omnipotence, almost trivializing in its display, over the survivor's body. From this moment, the relationship between Miranda and Ferdinand shifts from voyeuristic rapport to physical intimacy, and her salvaging of his body reconfigures the island's sexual dynamics. Miranda, as voyeur and salvager, can exercise transgressive desires in the catastrophized landscape, including toying with Ferdinand's 'divine form'. As Miranda's interest in Ferdinand deepens, the eroticization of salvage introduces forms of intimacy, including ecstasy, involuntary bondage, and sadomasochism, which shift the affective structure of the island community. The play eventually attempts to redeem these forms of intimacy through what Sanchez calls 'the redemptive sexualities' of marriage and friendship.<sup>34</sup> These overtures sit uncomfortably with the earlier erotic transgressions: salvage disrupts society and transforms communities, and that churning disruption is not so easily domesticated.

In the aftermath of ecological catastrophe, Miranda seems poised to recast herself as a salvational figure, but the play complicates this self-identity. Salvage has arrogated new abilities to her, such as the ability to restore the political order in faraway Naples. In part, this is because Miranda can locate desirability in the wreckage. For Ferdinand, the catastrophe is debilitating; for Prospero, empowering. Miranda wields power in a less crude but perhaps more pervasive way. She can impose value on the damage and thereby transmute it into something fungible. By cashing out value from unlikely places, by taking in the prodigal youth despite his questionable family relations and over her father's (insincere) demand that she not get too close to him, Miranda unsettles the status quo ante. Just as much as Prospero, Miranda moves between the two extremes of exploitation and benevolent recovery. So: coping with eco-catastrophe requires a sensitivity to uncertain shifts in power and perspective. Ferdinand, as a survivor of ecocatastrophe, thinks and feels his way through catastrophe to conceive of a life after. When he is unfrozen, Ferdinand confesses that his affection for Miranda supersedes his traumatic experience. He no longer thinks about his dead father and dead friends, and his only thought is of her. His forgetting seems abrupt and complete; he barely mentions his father again. The logic of the salvaged self does not allow him to express his suffering, at least not explicitly. His suffering instead becomes sublimated into his expressions of devotion to Miranda.

As the entanglements of narrator (Ferdinand) and audience (Miranda) deepen in *The Tempest*, what begins as devotion or compassion evolves into erotic desire, and that erotic desire eventuates an uncertainty about the affiliations among individuals, the family, and the larger state. Prospero is quick to exclude the possibility of deeper political change, establishing modest reform: some events get rolled back, such as the deposing of Prospero, and Ferdinand is set up as the rightful heir. Salvage installs a new social order that is as pernicious and limiting as the one that environmental catastrophe disrupted. (Meet the new boss, same as the old boss.) *The Tempest* is a wish-fulfillment revenge fantasy that shows one wrong getting corrected, but without any eternalized change in political structure or any expanded agency for any of the characters. In *The Tempest*, Prospero's teleological narrative unravels the sense of possibility that the erotics of salvage briefly kindled. Consider Ariel's speech to Alonso, Sebastian, and Antonio. Likened to a harpy, a cryptozoological creature that carries out divine retribution, Ariel narrates a story of post-salvage reformation as a mode of spiritual apotheosis caused by environmental catastrophe. In the process of being salvaged, each of them will be terrorized, and their own emotional and intellectual horizons will expand. Once 'the never-surfeited sea / Hath caused to belch up you', the 'three men of sin' will undergo a magical transformation into better people (3.3.53-7). The men's ignoble character is described as excess that must be discharged. Their sin marks them out as superfluous life. Ariel describes their post-salvage disorientation, which extends the affective reach of the catastrophe beyond the storm to the suffering experienced afterward, as a 'ling'ring perdition, worse than death' (77). Salvage, a process of transformation with rungs all the way from the individual to the cosmic level, is enacted on the three catastrophe survivors as 'lingering perdition' shall 'step by step attend / you and your ways' (78-9). As a vehicle for Prospero's vision of the island's spiritual economy, Ariel imagines that the environmental catastrophe can be conducted into the straitened frame of the redemptive narrative.

Yet: *The Tempest* insists that Prospero's control over the environmental catastrophe and its effects is imperfect. Consider the lines of Prospero quoted earlier in this essay:

There is no soul — No, not so much perdition as an hair Betide to any creature in the vessel. (1.2.29–30)

Prospero, concerned with the intensity of Miranda's vicarious suffering with Ferdinand, attempts to redact elements of the tempest story. By doing so, he dispels the uncertainty around the storm's after-effects and particularly the human cost of the catastrophe. Prospero assures Miranda that no one was injured, 'not so much perdition as an hair'. But the play also shows that Prospero does not know — in fact, could not know — that to be true. After Ariel describes Ferdinand jumping from the ship, possibly with his hair on fire, Prospero asks, 'But are they, Ariel, safe?', and Ariel assures him, 'not a hair perished' (224–5). That tremulous question — 'But are they, Ariel, safe?' — underscores that there are cracks in his narratives about environmental catastrophe.

Just as Prospero is on the cusp of eternalizing his vision of sociopolitical salvation, the insurgency of which Caliban is a part interrupts, disrupting the masque's feedback loop of wreck and redemption. Act 4 re-enacts the key moments in Prospero's self-mythology, including the coup, the conspiratorial plotting, and his distractedness as a ruler. In re-enacting them, the play underscores that any narrative of salvage will necessarily carry forward the histories it tries to overwrite. The wedding masque upcycles Prospero's own experiences of personal disaster and environmental catastrophe, but the wider frame of *The Tempest* shows that the wider implications of those events are not escapable. Prospero's masque is a pagan eco-fantasy that explicitly links marriage, reproductive sex, and prosperity:<sup>35</sup>

> Honour, riches, marriage-blessing, Long continuance and increasing ... Earth's increase, foison plenty, Barns and garners never empty. Vines with clustering bunches growing, Plants with goodly burden bowing.

(4.1.106–7, 110–13)

Prospero 'startles' and interrupts the masque when he remembers 'that foul conspiracy': 'The minute of their plot is almost come' (139-41). Like the watery catastrophe before it, Caliban's 'foul conspiracy' does not seem quite within his control. Prospero quickly dispatches the coup, almost as if the scheme emerged from his own psychic need to repair the memory of the earlier successful coup in Naples. Critics conventionally understand The Tempest as putting the storm and the masque in discursive tension with each other: the storm is radical disorder, and the masque is magical restoration. Since the failed insurgency interrupts Prospero's pastoral dream, however, Caliban's betrayal mirrors and legitimizes the storm not as a lever for Prospero's machination but as a disruptive force beyond his power. Like the sea storm at the beginning, Caliban's plot dictates Prospero's reactions, shifting agency back to the island's native. Indeed, there will be no end to challenges from below for Prospero or for his descendants, and no end to the attempts to suppress those challenges through coercion. What we have instead in The Tempest is a picture of salvage's infinite regress; the vision of 'long continuance and increasing' and 'Earth's increase' is forever contingent on the uneasy settlement between lived experience and Prospero's narrative.

## Race and the 'Salvage and Deformed Slave'

The first folio's 'Names of the Actors' list describes Caliban as a 'salvage and deformed slave', marking him with physiological, psychological, and ethnic difference. In the F1 version, Stephano recognizes Caliban's partly concealed body

instantly as being non-European: 'Do you put trickes upon's with Saluages, and men of Inde?'.<sup>36</sup> In both cases, the use of 'salvage' is closer to the modern meaning of the term 'savage', as the Arden edition glosses its meaning as 'uncivilized, existing in the lowest form of culture', in tension with its maritime and theological connotations. Bringing together the terms salvage and savage elucidates Caliban's relationship to environmental catastrophe and the erotics of salvage. Inverting the erotics of salvage which brought together Miranda and Ferdinand, Caliban becomes magnetized to Trinculo, who is also visibly marked by an encounter with environmental catastrophe. Caliban, more than any other character, serves as the limit case for salvage and salvation in the play. Does a character that is described as 'deformed' and 'savage' have a place in the idealized world built upon the ruins of catastrophe? Is there space in the afterwards of catastrophe for Caliban's experience?

Oddly enough, a safely ordered catastrophe — informed by indigenous magic, guided by a settler-colonialist - produces the encounter between the shipwrecked Italians and Caliban that precipitates all the talk of 'freedom, high-day; high-day freedom' (2.2.181). In the scene of that encounter, Stephano traces the chain of experience from surviving the storm to encountering a 'salvage': 'I have not 'scaped drowning to be afeard now of your four legs' (58-9). The storm shatters a sense of experiential norms in much the same way as Trinculo and Stephano seeing Caliban for the first time does. In doing so, this line of thought shows us that the first-person present tense, if uninterrupted, naturalizes the division of bodies into racialized groups, reproducing social inequities. Raymond Williams describes how ideology can be perceived as experience: the 'thought' seems to us 'felt' and 'feeling [is experienced as] thought'.<sup>37</sup> As he retreats from the shipwreck, Stephano perceives Caliban to be monstrous in at least two ways: his unusual number of limbs and his supposedly uncivilized nature. The racialization of Caliban is bound up with a reading of intellectual and moral qualities inhering in corporate difference; the Europeans call Caliban a 'fish-man' and a 'mooncalf' (115, 25), and they then think these physical qualities indicate viciousness and untrustworthiness. Stephano and Trinculo mobilize sense-data to reinforce these judgments (Caliban's smell, his physical appearance), but their perceptions rely on inherited beliefs about his racial identity. While the narrativization of environmental catastrophe in The Tempest appears to offer phenomenological access to lived immediacy, habituated ways of seeing nevertheless shape and condition that unmediated experience.38

For Ferdinand, labouring on the island converts the grief related to ecological catastrophe into something valuable; not so much for Caliban. The logic of salvage

transmutes Ferdinand's trauma into a new and improved way of inhabiting the world. Watching him perform 'some kinds of baseness' (3.1.2) shapes Miranda's relationship to Ferdinand. Ecological catastrophe has reduced Ferdinand from a prince surrounded by family and friends to an isolated and enslaved labourer before an act of self-fashioning redeems him.<sup>39</sup> Some scholars have even read Ferdinand and Miranda's courtship as the displacement of hierarchal relationships with a more reciprocal romance.<sup>40</sup> Patricia Akhimie argues that Caliban's labour on the island does not afford him the same opportunity to fashion a better self: 'Caliban emerges as a kind of counterpoint or benchmark, representing an uncultivatable underclass of subhuman who can labour but who cannot improve'.<sup>41</sup> Caliban can work at menial tasks, but unlike Ferdinand, this action will never allow him to cultivate deeper capacities.<sup>42</sup> Caliban performs labour that degrades the individual and reinforces Prospero's imposed social system. In terms of both his refusal to accept 'any print of goodness' and his irredeemable labour, Caliban cannot reach the other side of salvage's shore.

The play signals Caliban's unsalvageability through the sadistic glee with which he refers to sexual violence; his attempted rape of Miranda apparently justifies his perpetual subjugation. When accused of attempted rape, Caliban responds, 'Thou didst prevent me, I had peopled else / This isle with Calibans' (1.2.351-2). That inability to feel guilt or remorse implicates Caliban as a racialized figure who exists outside the circle of salvation. Sparked by the turbulence of environmental catastrophe, Prospero salvages an advantageous political marriage from the sexual attraction between Ferdinand and Miranda. Caliban's sexuality remains irredeemable in those same terms — he refuses to follow Ferdinand in assuming the pretenses of courtship or emulate Alonso in submitting himself to reformation. Hailing him on stage, Prospero first addresses Caliban as 'Thou poisonous slave, got by the devil himself / Upon thy wicked dam; come forth!' (320-1). As Prospero says, Caliban is 'a devil, a born devil, on whose nature / Nurture can never stick' (4.1.188-9). Since the early modern period inherited a long history of racializing the devil as black, Prospero here draws a connection between two supposed aspects of filial inheritance, Caliban's race and his moral corruption.43

Embedded in the denunciation is the claim that Caliban's ethical character, as immutable as his phenotype, is unsalvageable. Caliban's reported deformation registers not as an autonomous aesthetic experience of what other characters see or smell but as a culturally ingrained way of seeing people like him. The descriptions of Caliban by Stephano, Trinculo, and other characters illustrate what Alia Al-Saji calls the 'I cannot' of racialization, that is, the disavowed practices through which

'racialization hierarchically stratifies and congeals' experience and perception. 'I cannot' refers to the tactics of racialized perception that cannot see or perceive outside of the structures of colonialism and white supremacy.<sup>44</sup> Though Ariel, Ferdinand, and Miranda narrate vivid descriptions of the sea storm as preceding cultural categories such as race, class, and nationality, we find the operation of racialization already at work even before the first appearance of Caliban. Caliban's disruption of Prospero's salvage narrative makes visible the race-thinking that the experiential premise obscures.

To put it another way, Caliban both as a physicalized presence in the play and through his 'foul conspiracy' resists the machinery of salvage. Prospero's narrative of salvage runs aground in Caliban's experience and knowledge of the world. Years earlier, Prospero relied on Caliban's familiarity with the island, and Prospero taught him language and astronomy. Stranger and more powerful than anyone knows, the island's ecology is not proof positive of the inevitability of Prospero's master plot but an instrument, a weapon, that could be wielded against him. When Caliban first appears in the play, he curses Prospero with something like an environmental catastrophe, wishing magical violence on Prospero — 'a raven's feather from unwholesome fen' — and calling a 'southwest' wind to afflict the sorcerer with plague (1.2.385–8). This ecological knowledge, assumed to be inherited from his mother Sycorax, establishes that environmental catastrophe does not serve a grand teleological purpose ('Providence divine') but rather the psychological needs of the person wielding that knowledge. By embodying the limits of what Prospero does not know about environmental catastrophe, Caliban shakes confidence in the mage's claims of mastery.

The plasticity of the word 'salvage' during the early modern period also sheds light on what the figure of Caliban has to say about the structuring presence of histories of racial and colonial violence on narratives of environmental catastrophe. While Miranda sees Ferdinand's shipwrecked body as a 'divine form', Caliban comically elevates Trinculo who describes himself as having 'swum ashore ... like a duck' after the first-act sea storm (2.2.125). As Miranda is drawn to Ferdinand so is Caliban to the storm-beaten Trinculo. For the island native, the ducklike survivor who offers him an otherworldly liquor is 'a wondrous man' (160). 'Hast thou not', Caliban asks of Stephano, 'dropped from heaven?' (134). Again, devotion gets directed toward a survivor of environmental catastrophe — amorous but travestied, emptied out of the promise of providential design or spiritual transcendence. While Prospero scripts a teleological narrative culminating in marriage and political restoration, Stephano and Trinculo salvage a very different transcendent goal: alcohol. Prospero enlists the erotics of salvage to realize his own political desires. Caliban, on the other hand, turns the erotics of salvage inside out, by attaching his desires to a character who cannot offer him salvation, salvage him from environmental catastrophes, or physically save him. The alliance of Caliban, Stephano, and Trinculo repurposes the metaphors and raw narrative material that is the basis for the Miranda and Ferdinand romance plot — namely, the rhetoric of service as a means to repair catastrophe — and reclaims the subversive politics that persist through salvage.

Against Prospero's urging of a master plot, The Tempest self-reflexively dramatizes how catastrophe survivors never really escape the turbulence of lived experience. Caliban, challenging Prospero's salvage narrative from below, exposes the erotics of salvage by absurdly becoming a storm shelter himself. Caliban enters, carrying wood, with thunder overhead. He again calls for the environment to cause suffering to his oppressor, a form of punitive catastrophism: 'All the infections that the sun sucks up / From bogs, fens, flats, on Prospero fall' (2.2.1-2). Mistaken by Caliban for one of Prospero's malevolent spirits, Trinculo approaches looking for shelter from the oncoming storm. Trinculo sees 'another storm brewing' and hears the oncoming storm 'singing i' th' wind' (20). After Trinculo describes Caliban as a 'strange fish', he takes shelter under Caliban's gaberdine: 'This is no fish, but an islander that hath lately suffered by a thunderbolt. My best way is to creep under his gaberdine; there is no other shelter hereabout. Misery acquaints a man with strange bedfellows' (36-9). In these lines, Julia Reinhard Lupton has pointed out the swerve from Trinculo's recognition of Caliban as an example of a general creatureliness to the recognition that he belongs to the specific, exclusive category of humanity.<sup>45</sup> Caliban is an individual whose body testifies even more strongly than Ferdinand's to the firsthand experience of living through environmental catastrophe. His body is scarred and deformed to such an extent that Trinculo believes he was injured in the storm. Caliban 'hath lately suffered by a thunderbolt', transforming him into a person who resembles a fish who could pass for human if he were painted, at least in England. Caliban's catastrophized, racialized body could then be showcased like a 'dead Indian' (2.2.34). In this imagined scene, Caliban becomes an externalized memorial to Trinculo's own experience: an embodiment of psychic and physical wreck offered up for the visual consumption of English audiences.

Trinculo instrumentalizes Caliban's body as a makeshift shelter. Caliban knows how to persist in a suspended state of uncertainty. Even though he appears to be physically scarred by thunder, Caliban receives no chance to narrate his own experience with ecological turbulence. Neither is he elevated within Prospero's narrative, as Ferdinand and Miranda are, in a future-oriented vision of resilience.

Within what is represented as the unmediated tumult of environmental catastrophe, the affective and political rhetorization of stormy experience instead eternalizes Caliban's status as unfree. Indeed, as the scene develops, The Tempest naturalizes the condition of servitude by having Caliban shelter a survivor through the thunderstorm. Once their two bodies are entangled, Stephano mistakes them for a single monstrous body, a visual metaphor for how to imagine plural communities of refuge. Their bodies, of course, are arranged in a way that suggests queer intimacy. Inscribed in that fiction of eroticized shelter is epidermal prejudice and subjugation. As Urvashi Chakravarty observes, early modern English discourses around freedom, slavery, and servitude mutually reinforced each other and 'underwrote more permanent forms of racialized slavery'.<sup>46</sup> In this sense, the image of Caliban hunkering down and riding out the storm as a physical shield for Trinculo from the violence of an imminent storm allegorically anticipates the uneven effects of climate change on people of colour in our twenty-first-century present.<sup>47</sup> Stephano adds insult to injury by mistaking Trinculo for the sheltering body: 'How / camest thou to be the siege of this mooncalf?' (2.2.106-7). Though their improvised storm shelter seems like a far more inclusive model for surviving environmental catastrophe than Prospero's master plot, Trinculo and Caliban's proximity remains rooted in the same system of unfreedom.

In these disparate cases, Caliban can serve as the means for another's salvage operation, but he remains excluded from the very dispensation that salvage offers. In the persistence of his embodied presence, in devoting himself to his own will-ful unsalvageability, Caliban shows that salvage cannot purify the raw materials that it grinds down and spins through its wheels. The salvage narrative always remains marked by what has happened before — the multiple sea storms, the thunderstorm on the island — and will forever retain the durable traces of the stories, experiences, and perspectives that Prospero suppresses.

## Coda: Salvaging the Island

The early modern literary archive, and *The Tempest* specifically, calls us to reflect on the challenges posed by narrating the experience of environmental catastrophe and the implications of vicariously suffering with those who suffer. Experience is not often viewed as a scholarly subject. Thomas Alexander, a self-described 'ecological, humanistic naturalist', defines experience as 'our shared, embodied, symbolic life, *the meaningful ways we inhabit the world*'.<sup>48</sup> Alexander articulates a defense of meaning-making as fundamental to human existence: 'The point is that we *do* recognize the removal of meaning and value from someone's life as a way of destroying that individual'.<sup>49</sup> I have discussed how meaning and value is removed from Ferdinand, Caliban, and Miranda's lives but have only begun to consider the full cost of these deprivations. *The Tempest* encourages us to think about these casualties, though the play remains embedded in a symbolic and cultural system that often dismissed the experiences of those who suffered. The meaning-making systems of the early moderns are enduringly alien to us, but, since we are creatures who live metaphor, let us preserve the repertoire of meaning in as complete a form as possible.

Here, I want to briefly gesture toward ways we might consider how a single narrative can also remove meaning and value from non-human forms of life. The courtiers offer differing narrative descriptions of the island. Gonzalo exclaims, 'How lush and lusty the grass looks! how green!' (2.1.55). Trinculo observes in another part of the island: 'Neither bush nor shrub to bear off any weather at all' (2.2.17-8). But the Milanese mage overpowers all other voices on the island, including the supernatural creatures, plant life, and other non-human perspectives. His version of the storm similarly engulfs all other stories. When the characters decide to leave for Italian shores, we get a glimpse at some of the environmental damage connected to Prospero's building. The island's resources are somewhat diminished by the end of the play: piling up all those 'thousands of logs' (3.1.10), the absence of 'bush or shrub', and supernatural extraction from 'bogs, fens, flats' (2.2.2). This exploitation has made the island a less hospitable place, to say nothing of depleting the biodiversity of the island. At play's end, we learn the island will be liberated from the narratives that have flattened its meaning and value. When Prospero announces his plan to 'retire me to my Milan, where / Every third thought shall be my grave' (5.1.311-12), you can almost hear the island sigh with something like relief.

## Notes

I am grateful to Jane Hwang Degenhardt, Joseph Black, Jean Feerick, Lowell Duckert, Maria Ishikawa, Ben Latini, Eric Griffin, Laurie Shannon, Steve Mentz, and Erin Kelly for their feedback on earlier drafts of this article. I presented some of the ideas here as a Next Generation Plenary speaker at the 2022 Shakespeare Association of America conference; a version of that paper is forthcoming in volume 51 of *Shakespeare Studies*. This work benefitted from the advice and encouragement of Lucy Munro, Whitney Sperrazza, Misha Teramura, Diana Henderson, and James Siemon.

- William Strachey, 'A True Reportory of the Wreck and Redemption of Sir Thomas Gates, Knight', in *A Voyage to Virginia in 1609*, ed. Louis Wright (Charlottesville, 2013), 5. I follow Wright, who believes that 'nations' was miscopied from Strachey's manuscript and should be 'motions'.
- 2 For the possible link between Strachey's A True Reportory and The Tempest, see Alden T. Vaughn, 'William Strachey's "True Reportory" and Shakespeare: A Closer Look at the Evidence', Shakespeare Quarterly 59.3 (2008), 245–73, <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/shq.0.0017</u>; Roger Stritmatter and Lynne Kositsky, 'Shakespeare and the Voyagers Revisited', Review of English Studies 58 (2007), 447–72, <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/res/hgl152</u>; and Arthur Kinney, 'Revisiting The Tempest', Modern Philology 93 (1995), 161–77, <u>https://doi.org/10.1086/392301</u>. For the original claim, see Edmond Malone, An Account of the Incidents (London, 1808).
- 3 Strachey, 'A True Reportory', 6.
- 4 Jonathan Gil Harris, *Untimely Matter in the Time of Shakespeare* (Philadelphia, 2009), 2, https://doi.org/10.9783/9780812202205.
- 5 Ibid, 2.
- 6 Gwilym Jones, *Shakespeare's Storms* (Manchester, 2016), 4, <u>https://doi.org/10.7765/9781526111852</u> observes that the 'narrators give slightly different versions of the storm, and each in turn different from the version seen by the audience'.
- 7 Sharon O'Dair, 'Is It Shakespearean Ecocriticism if it Isn't Presentist?' in *Ecocritical Shakespeare*, ed. Lynne Bruckner and Dan Brayton (London, 2011), 71–85; Jonathan Bate, *The Song of the Earth* (Cambridge, 2000), 92; Steve Mentz, *Break Up the Anthropocene* (Minneapolis, 2019), <u>https://doi.org/10.5749/j.ctvhhhg4h</u>; and John Drakakis, 'Shakespeare as Presentist', *Shakespeare Survey* 66 (2013), 177–87, <u>https://doi.org/10.1017/SSO9781107300699.013</u>. See also Alice Dailey, *How to Do Things With Dead People* (Ithaca, 2022), <u>https://doi.org/10.7591/cornell/9781501763656.001.0001</u>, and James Bromley, *Clothing and Queer*

*Style in Early Modern English Drama* (Oxford, 2021), <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/</u> <u>oso/9780198867821.001.0001</u>.

- 8 Timothy M. Harrison, *Coming To: Consciousness and Natality in Early Modern England* (Chicago, 2020), 29, https://doi.org/10.7208/chicago/9780226725260.001.0001.
- 9 For other examples of experiential ecocriticism, see Pablo F. Gómez, *The Experiential Caribbean: Creating Knowledge and Healing in the Early Modern Atlantic* (Chapel Hill, 2017), <u>https://doi.org/10.5149/northcarolina/9781469630878.001.0001</u>; Greta LaFleur, ed., *A Natural History of Sexuality in Early America* (Baltimore, 2018), <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/book.61934</u>; and Gerard Passannante, *Catastrophizing: Materialism and the Making of Disaster* (Chicago, 2019), <u>https://doi.org/10.7208/chicago/9780226612355.001.0001</u>.
- 10 Parenthetical citations reference act, scene, and line numbers in William Shakespeare, *The Tempest, The Arden Shakespeare*, 3rd series, ed. Virginia Mason Vaughan and Alden T. Vaughan (New York, 2011).
- For an analysis of catastrophe and theatrical practice, see Caro Pirri, 'Unsettling The Tempest', Renaissance Drama 49.1 (2021), 77–99, <u>https://doi.org/10.1086/713985</u>. On staging more generally, see Henry S. Turner, The English Renaissance Stage: Geometry, Poetics, and the Practical Spatial Arts, 1580–1630 (Oxford, 2010) and Erika Lin, Shakespeare and the Materiality of Performance (Basingstoke, 2012), <u>https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137006509</u>.
- 12 See Ania Loomba, Gender, Race, Renaissance Drama (Manchester, 1989); Kim F. Hall, Things of Darkness: Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England (Ithaca, 1995), <u>https://doi.org/10.7591/9781501725456</u>; Patricia Akhimie, Shakespeare and the Cultivation of Difference: Race and Conduct in the Early Modern World (New York, 2018), 152, <u>https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351125048</u>; and Meredith Anne Skura, 'Discourse and the Individual: The Case of Colonialism in The Tempest', Shakespeare Quarterly 40.1 (1989), 42–69, <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/2870753</u>.
- 13 Frantz Fanon, Black Skin White Masks, trans. Richard Philcox (New York, 2008). See also Linda Martín Alcoff, Visible Identities: Race, Gender, and the Self (Oxford, 2006), 179–94, <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/0195137345.001.0001</u>.
- 14 For a reading of this 'encounter between human labour, technical language, and the ungovernable sea', see Steve Mentz, *At the Bottom of Shakespeare's Ocean* (New York, 2009), 11.
- 15 This article is indebted to the important feminist and new historicist scholarship of Janet Adelman, Suffocating Mothers: Fantasies of Maternal Origin in Shakespeare's Plays, Hamlet to The Tempest (New York, 1992), <u>https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203420652</u>, and Stephen Greenblatt, Learning to Curse: Essays in Early Modern Culture (New York, 1990), <u>https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203823736</u>.

- 16 McKenna Rose uses salvage as a keyword to explore the temporality of persistence and resilience reflected in the repurposed materials of the early modern stage, whereas this article looks at the providentialist and narrative designs of salvage; see 'Surviving *The Tempest:* Ecologies of Salvage on the Early Modern Stage', *Shakespeare* 13.3 (2017), 271–81, <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/17450918.2017.1317283</u>.
- 17 This description of Caliban appears in the 'Names of the Actors' list at the end of the playtext in William Shakespeare, *Mr. William Shakespeares Comedies, Histories,* & *Tragedies: Published According to the True Originall Copies* (London, 1623; STC: 22273), 19/B4r, <u>http://doi.org/10.14288/1.0421801</u>.
- 18 Suparna Roychoudhury has drawn attention to the ways literary representations of storms mediated an early modern concern with dread and panic; see 'Mental Tempests, Seas of Trouble: The Perturbations of Shakespeare's *Pericles*', *ELH* 82.4 (2015), 1013–39, https://doi.org/10.1353/elh.2015.0037.
- 19 OED Online, s.v. 'save, v.1.a., v.1.c., v.2.e., v.2., v.19.a.'.
- 20 Henry of Bracton, *De Legibus et Consuetudinibus Angliae*, 41. Translated from the Latin by John J. Kenny and Ronald R. Hrusoff, in 'The Ownership of the Treasures of the Sea', *William and Mary Law Review* 9.2 (1967), 383–401.
- 21 The Statute of Westminster, Anno 3 Edwardi 1, cap. 4.
- 22 Dan Brayton, *Shakespeare's Ocean: An Ecocritical Exploration* (Charlottesville, 2012), 110.
- 23 Mare Clausum: The Right and Dominion of the Sea in Two Books (London, 1663; STC: 22175), 112–3.
- 24 Hayley Cotter, 'Robbers of the Sea: Piracy in Proclamations and Pamphlets, 1558– 1675', Journal of Early Modern Studies 10 (2021), 85–102, <u>https://doi.org/10.13128/ jems-2279-7149-12541</u>, and "On Neptunes Watry Realmes": Maritime Law and English Renaissance Literature', PhD dissertation (University of Massachusetts Amherst, 2021).
- 25 Michael Witmore, Culture of Accidents: Unexpected Knowledges in Early Modern England (Palo Alto, 2002), 21, <u>https://doi.org/10.1515/9780804779913</u>.
- 26 The first quote is from A Golden Chain (London, 1591; STC: 19658), C2r; the second is from An Exposition of the Symbole or Creed of the Apostles (London, 1596; STC: 19704), Y8v–9r.
- 27 Lori Anne Ferrell, 'Transfiguring Theology: William Perkins and Calvinist Aesthetics', in *John Foxe and his World*, ed. Christopher Highley and John N. King (Burlington VT, 2002), 160–79, <u>https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315251486-11</u>.
- 28 Rebecca Bushnell explains that early modern English education shifted 'between the extremes of liberation and control, variety and limits, play and discipline'. See *A*

Culture of Teaching: Early Modern Humanism in Theory and Practice (Ithaca, 1996), 19–20.

- 29 William Shakespeare, Pericles, ed. Suzanne Gossett (London, 2004).
- 30 For a reading of Pericles as 'accidental imperialist', see Jane Degenhardt, 'Performing the Sea: Fortune, Risk, and Audience Engagement in *Pericles'*, *Renaissance Drama* 48.1 (2020), 103–29, 116, <u>https://doi.org/10.1086/708967</u>.
- 31 Bruce Boehrer, *Environmental Degradation in Jacobean Drama* (Cambridge, 2013), https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9781139149976.
- 32 Jane Hwang Degenhardt, *Globalizing Fortune on The Early Modern Stage* (Oxford, 2022), 175–7.
- 33 Melissa Sanchez, 'Seduction and Service in *The Tempest'*, *Studies in Philology* 105.1 (2008), 50–82, <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/sip.2008.0001</u>.
- 34 Melissa Sanchez, "Use Me But as Your Spaniel": Feminism, Queer Theory, and Early Modern Sexualities', *PMLA* 127.3 (2012), 493–511, <u>https://doi.org/10.1632/</u> pmla.2012.127.3.493.
- 35 Stephen Orgel, 'Introduction', in *The Tempest*, ed. Stephen Orgel (Oxford, 1987), 43–50, <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/actrade/9780198129172.book.1</u>; Clifford Davidson, 'The Masque within *The Tempest*', *Notre Dame English Journal* 10.1 (1976), 12–17; and Glynne Wickham, 'Masque and Antimasque in *The Tempest*', *Essays and Studies* 28 (1975): 1–14.
- 36 Shakespeare, Mr. William Shakespeares Comedies, Histories, & Tragedies, 9/A5r. In the Arden edition, Shakespeare, The Tempest, the quoted passage is 2.2.59-60.
- 37 Raymond Williams, Marxism and Literature (Oxford, 1977), 132.
- 38 This work builds on recent scholarship on race and affect, such as the essays collected in Carol Mejia LaPerle, ed., *Race and Affect in Early Modern English Literature* (Chicago, 2022), <u>https://doi.org/10.54027</u>.
- 39 Akhimie, Shakespeare and the Cultivation of Difference, 151–86.
- 40 Donna B. Hamilton, *Virgil and* The Tempest: *The Politics of Imitation* (Columbus, 1990).
- 41 Akhimie, Shakespeare and the Cultivation of Difference, 152.
- 42 John Kunat, "Play Me False': Rape, Race, and Conquest in *The Tempest'*, *Shakespeare Quarterly* 65.3 (2015), 307–27, http://doi.org/10.1353/shq.2014.0036.
- 43 See Dennis Britton, Becoming Christian: Race, Reformation, and Early Modern Romance (New York, 2014), <u>https://doi.org/10.5422/fordham/9780823257140.001.0001</u>; Matthieu Chapman, Anti-Black Racism in Early Modern English Drama (New York, 2017), <u>https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315559544</u>; and Geraldine Heng, The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages (Cambridge, 2018), <u>https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108381710</u>.

52 John Yargo

- 44 Alia Al-Saji, 'A Phenomenology of Hesitation: Interrupting Racializing Habits of Seeing', in *Living Alterities: Phenomenology, Embodiment, and Race*, ed. Emily Lee (Albany, 2014), 140–2. This section owes a general debt to Al-Saji's work on race and phenomenology.
- 45 Julia Reinhard Lupton, *Citizen-Saints: Shakespeare and Political Theology* (Chicago, 2005), 159–80, <u>https://doi.org/10.7208/chicago/9780226157443.001.0001</u>.
- 46 Urvashi Chakravarty, Fictions of Consent: Slavery, Servitude, and Free Service in Early Modern England (Philadelphia, 2022), 9, <u>https://doi.org/10.9783/9780812298260</u>.
- 47 Natalie Suzelis explores how early modern studies and climate justice intersect in 'Climate Leviathan and Ecological Accumulation in *The Tempest*', *Shakespeare Studies* 49 (2021), 181–6.
- 48 Thomas Alexander, *The Human Eros: Eco-Ontology and the Aesthetics of Experience* (New York, 2013), 4, <u>https://doi.org/10.5422/fordham/9780823251209.001.0001</u>.
- 49 Alexander, The Human Eros, 7.