

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Fry, Bruce W. *"An appearance of strength": The Fortifications of Louisbourg*. 2 vols., Ottawa: Parks Canada, 1984. Vol. 1, pp. 214; Vol. 2, pp. 212. 256 black and white illustrations. \$23.00 a set

"Un air de fort": Les fortifications de Louisbourg. 2 vols., Ottawa: Parcs Canada, 1984. Vol. 1, pp. 221; Vol. 2, pp. 212. 256 illustrations noir et blanc. \$23.00 le jeu

F. J. Thorpe

Volume 14, numéro 1, juin 1985

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1017895ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1017895ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Thorpe, F. J. (1985). Compte rendu de [Fry, Bruce W. *"An appearance of strength": The Fortifications of Louisbourg*. 2 vols., Ottawa: Parks Canada, 1984. Vol. 1, pp. 214; Vol. 2, pp. 212. 256 black and white illustrations. \$23.00 a set / *"Un air de fort": Les fortifications de Louisbourg*. 2 vols., Ottawa: Parcs Canada, 1984. Vol. 1, pp. 221; Vol. 2, pp. 212. 256 illustrations noir et blanc. \$23.00 le jeu]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 14(1), 83-84. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1017895ar>

hygienically sub-standard. These dormitory areas, consisting only of men, soon became the breeding-ground of violence and of many racial stereotypes about Italians: a violent race of inferior culture, incapable of conforming to the customs and imperatives of the host society (p. 44).

As the need for seasonal labour subsided, and many of the migrant workers took residence in Montreal and formed their own families, their needs also changed. These changes, which ultimately led to the rise of a spirit of community and to the establishment of new community structures — an Italian school, a church, “Italian” shops (especially grocery-shops, an important focal point of the Italian population) — within the newly chosen quarter of Mile-End, are documented in the third and last chapter of the volume, “L’implantation.” Near the end of the first decade of the twentieth century, the author concludes, “. . . la transition du séjour à l’établissement . . . paraît avoir été complétée, aidée en cela par la brusque interruption du flux des Italiens due au conflit mondial. Mais cette zone de concentration à laquelle nous avons souvent fait référence dans cette étude arbore les signes distinctifs d’une petite Italie. C’est dans le quartier du Mile-End, en fait, que se trouve le plus fort regroupement d’Italiens, et c’est là que la tendance à devenir propriétaire est devenue très visible” (pp. 84-85).

The interviews which close the volume are deemed by the author as essential documents about the development of the community given the scarcity of surviving documents.

Professor Ramirez is careful to point out the provisional nature of his study. However, because of the solid theoretical structure of the investigation, and the clear and precise use of the available documentation, this volume deserves to be considered one of the best among the growing number of important studies focusing on Italian immigration in Canada, and as such it will appeal to social as well as to urban historians.

Massimo Ciavolella
Carleton University

Fry, Bruce W. *“An appearance of strength”: The Fortifications of Louisbourg*. 2 vols., Ottawa: Parks Canada, 1984. Vol. 1, pp. 214; Vol. 2, pp. 212. 256 black and white illustrations. \$23.00 a set.

“Un air de fort”: Les fortifications de Louisbourg. 2 vols., Ottawa: Parcs Canada, 1984. Vol. 1, pp. 221; Vol. 2, pp. 212. 256 illustrations noir et blanc. \$23.00 le jeu.

The restoration program at the Fortress of Louisbourg National Historic Park has enabled readers to benefit from a fine by-product: a cogent, informative and eminently readable study by a senior Parks Canada archaeologist whose

Canadian career began at Louisbourg in 1963. It is noteworthy that the program, by making possible a very significant level of archaeological research at the site, has both facilitated and circumscribed Bruce Fry’s work: facilitated it because of what archaeology could do to complement the historical record, and circumscribed it because archaeological research was limited largely to those parts of the fortification destined for reconstruction.

The battered fortifications of Louisbourg were demolished in 1760 and the townsite virtually abandoned a few years later. The site is quite unusual because archaeologists have been able to research 18th-century remains unencumbered by 19th and 20th century urban accretion.

The documentary record of Louisbourg’s structures, both military and civil, is at once voluminous and fragmentary, and extremely detailed but often puzzling. It can be elucidated in part by reference to typical early-modern fortifications extant in Europe; and the author has made an extensive study of these. But there can be no substitute for careful archaeological research. Fry has demonstrated, in his chapters on the King’s and Dauphin Bastions and the King’s-Dauphin and Queen’s-King’s curtains, that astute analysis of both the documentary and archaeological evidence, against a background of thorough knowledge in the theory and practice of 18th-century European military architecture, can do much to unravel the mysteries and explain the vagaries of European fortification building at this isolated North American port. Urbanists will thus have an interest in carefully reading this book, not because it has much to say about urban planning, daily life, care of the sick, sanitation, law and order, fire prevention, recreation, religion or property — although there is useful incidental information on some of these — but because of the ways in which the author has interwoven various kinds of evidence for the purposes of reconstruction. One is reminded, for example, that stones which are merely “rubble” to the uninitiated may, to the archaeologist, be evidence for deducing the nature of long-demolished parapets; or that unexpected locations for artifacts such as pottery may be clues to some structural improvisation that is absent from the written record.

The text and the 256 illustrations are in separate volumes so that they can be read together — most convenient in a work to which illustrations are vital. Presumably because of cost, however, all the illustrations are in black and white, so that the colour-code used in plans by engineers to distinguish work proposed from work done, is lost to all but those who consult archival copies or obtain colour photographs.

The author places his subject against a background of European fortifications from the advent of gunpowder to the beginning of the 18th century, an analysis to which he devotes almost the first quarter of his text. A detailed study of those parts of Louisbourg’s fortifications intended for reconstruc-

tion comprises somewhat more than 25 per cent, while the remainder — about half of the total — is devoted to discussions of the Louisbourg setting, to discursive analyses of the “Landward” and “New” enceintes, the outworks and the harbour defences, and to the two sieges. Particularly in his concluding chapter, the author joins the standing debate about the reasons for selecting the Louisbourg townsite and concludes that, by and large, the fortifications served their military purpose. “Forced into the historical limelight as a reluctant fortress, Louisbourg fell to besieging armies after resisting, alone and unaided, for much longer than could have been expected considering its many defects. More could not be asked.”

In a study requiring extremely detailed analysis of walls and foundations and drains, it is a pleasure to read prose of such clarity as Fry's. Still, the work could have benefitted from more editing than is evident, particularly to eliminate the occasional awkward construction or cliché. In the French version, words like *pied* and *toise*, not being “foreign,” should have required no italics and the numbering of the casemates of the King's Bastion should probably have been 8D (for *droite*) and 8G (for *gauche*) instead of 8R and 8L. Also, there is a certain inconsistency between the two versions in the matter of quotations: in the English version, the author has translated French texts whereas in the French version, English texts are left in the original. In both versions an index to Volume I and a table of contents for Volume II would have facilitated the consultation of the work.

F.J. Thorpe
History Division
National Museum of Man

Fram, Mark and John Weiler, eds. *Continuity with Change: Planning for the Conservation of Man-Made Heritage*, 2d ed. Toronto: Dundurn Press, 1984. Pp xix, 343. Illustrations. \$13.95.

In the past 15 years government heritage programs, both federal and provincial, have carried out extensive research and planning for Canada's cultural heritage. Most of the results of these efforts can be consulted in unpublished reports, but relatively few have been published. Of those published almost none have focused upon philosophies and approaches to heritage conservation. This volume is exceptional for its concern for these matters as well as for its purposefully defined audience and its commercial imprint.

Continuity with Change comprises seven “essays” relating to heritage conservation work carried out between 1977 and 1980 by the Ontario government's Heritage Branch,

Ministry of Citizenship and Culture (then Historical Planning and Research Branch, Ministry of Culture and Recreation). The studies are at once explorations of heritage issues and case studies of conservation approaches. Volumes of essays often struggle for a convincing coherence. In this case the volume has been carefully structured, with a strong introductory statement by the editors of the title's thesis and an arrangement of the papers in contrasting couplets in order of descending geographical scale (area, park, site). John Weiler's informative opening synthesis of fundamental issues related to conservation and planning sets the frame for the more detailed studies which follow. The further observable structure of the couplets, not explicitly noted by the editors, is their general reflection of the course of the conservation process in their sequential dominance by research, planning, and implementation.

The most important conservation message of the volume lies in its title: continuity with change. The heritage conservation movement has frequently been perceived as opposing change. In their excellent brief introduction, editors Mark Fram and John Weiler carefully explain that conservation and change are not mutually exclusive terms: “conservation is not a tactic for stopping overall change, although it may legitimately resist individually ill-conceived changes; rather, it is acknowledgement of change, a strategy for directing change to keep it from causing damage, waste or loss,” “a strategy . . . for moderating the pace of change and healing the raw edges of the new as it meets the old” (pp. xi-xii). The studies in this volume illustrate this philosophy. The selection of projects for inclusion also makes an explicit conservation statement. Largely bypassing the saving of old buildings which has been the core of the heritage conservation movement, the case studies focus on the less recognized engineering and industrial remains and cultural landscapes, urban and rural. Moreover, although all the projects reported occur in Ontario, and only one of them lies more than 80 km from Lake Ontario, the conservation issues are familiar, and the approaches outlined are equally applicable, everywhere in Canada.

Fram's examination of eastern Ontario's waterways and Marilyn Miller and Joe Bucovetsky's survey of the urban heritage of Dundas both apply potentially useful typological approaches to address the problem of assessing heritage resources where scale makes conventional architectural inventory approaches infeasible and inappropriate. Readers undertaking to assess the potential application of these approaches to their own situations may well, however, be frustrated by the overbearing length assigned essentially to reporting the respective historical backgrounds and data collected. Clearer analysis of the problems faced in developing and applying the approaches, the extent to which and how they met the planning needs that they were developed to fulfill, and the limits of their effectiveness would have made both studies more useful to the volume's intended audience