

Culture



Ian A.L. GETTY and Antoine S. LUSSIER (eds.), *As Long as the Sun Shines and Water Flows, A Reader in Canadian Native Studies*, Nakoda Institute Occasional Paper No. 1, Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1983. 363 pages, \$12.50 (paper), \$29.95 (cloth)

Carmen Lambert

Volume 4, numéro 2, 1984

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1078284ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1078284ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Canadian Anthropology Society / Société Canadienne d'Anthropologie (CASCA),
formerly/anciennement Canadian Ethnology Society / Société Canadienne
d'Ethnologie

ISSN

0229-009X (imprimé)

2563-710X (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Lambert, C. (1984). Compte rendu de [Ian A.L. GETTY and Antoine S. LUSSIER (eds.), *As Long as the Sun Shines and Water Flows, A Reader in Canadian Native Studies*, Nakoda Institute Occasional Paper No. 1, Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1983. 363 pages, \$12.50 (paper), \$29.95 (cloth)]. *Culture*, 4(2), 86–87. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1078284ar>

Tous droits réservés © Canadian Anthropology Society / Société Canadienne
d'Anthropologie (CASCA), formerly/anciennement Canadian Ethnology Society /
Société Canadienne d'Ethnologie, 1984

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des
services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique
d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

érudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de
l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à
Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

with kinship, to invoke openness and closure and thereby locate villagers in the English status system. The argument is well framed in a discussion of kinship, and the idiom of belonging.

The focus of Isabel Emmett's contribution is the continuity of Welsh identity, which is seen to saturate everyday life in Blaenau Ffestiniog. Breaking with the emphasis on locality, Emmett invokes the imagery of colonialism to describe Welsh nationalism and employs the concept of class (relations to the means of production) to describe social structure. After Welshness, she finds that the most noticeable characteristic of the community is its lack of social differentiation, for control over capital and political decisions rest primarily with the English ruling class. It is only after establishing this that she moves in her second essay, *Place, Community and Bilingualism*, to a discussion of the "finer mesh of interaction", the density of local encounters, and the sense of identity.

While individual articles are well worth reading in their own right, it should now be clear that their empirical and theoretical variations limit the coherence of *Belonging* to a celebration of diversity. A celebration, it might be added, that is dampened by the formidable task of contextualization which such divergent contributions leave the reader. Coherence is further undermined by the dualistic organization which, in reproducing the fading part-whole dilemma, recreates the difficulties of an earlier anthropology practiced in more exotic quarters. A minor result is an inconvenient separation of companion chapters which are more usefully read together. However, the dualism is of more fundamental importance, because it downplays the historic and contemporary significance of transcending structures to an understanding of locality. Of course, these comments refer to the collection as a whole. The merit of *Belonging* lies in the uniformly high quality of the particular articles, and the insights they provide into both the specific issues raised and the concerns of British social anthropology.

Ian A.L. GETTY and Antoine S. LUSSIER (eds.), *As Long as the Sun Shines and Water Flows, A Reader in Canadian Native Studies*, Nakoda Institute Occasional Paper No. 1, Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1983. 363 pages, \$12.50 (paper), \$29.95 (cloth).

By Carmen Lambert
McGill University

Though this volume is intended to present an overview of Canadian Indian policy and its effects on Native peoples, it borders on being another collection of conference papers without any clear unified thread. Among the twenty contributions, thirteen are original papers given at a Native Studies Conference held in 1981 at Brandon University. Seven articles, reproduced from various sources, have been added by the editors in an attempt to give some unity to the volume and provide the reader with a more coherent picture of Native history in Canada.

The collection is interdisciplinary and includes contributions from anthropology, sociology, political science, and economics; however, the largest number of essays is by specialists in social history. The essays vary considerably in content, style of analysis and format. They range from broad overviews of Indian-White relations to short descriptions or detailed analyses of particular historical events. Most of the articles focus on the period between 1815 and 1915. The book also reveals a definite geographical bias, since most of the contributions are concerned with the history of the Prairies.

The volume opens with an historical review of Indian-White relations by the historian, George F. G. Stanley. The following essays are divided into two thematic sections. The first section traces in part the evolution of Canadian Indian policy and administration. The main themes developed in the first article, J. L. Tobias' succinct analysis of the principles guiding Indian policy before and after Confederation, as well as in Stanley's Introductory essay, are elaborated upon in several succeeding papers: the assimilation goals pursued by the British and Canadian governments and the failure of the system to reach these objectives. R. J. Surtees examines the factors that led to the implementation, in the 1830s, of a policy geared to the creation of self-governing Indian communities. J. S. Milloy describes subsequent policy changes that establish-

ed increased federal government control of on-reserve government, thus creating a system described as one of "wardship, colonization and tutelage" (p. 63). Three papers look at the role of key policy makers, who imposed their personal views on the administration of Indian Affairs during the nineteenth century. D. T. McNab's reprinted article (1981) on Herman Meridale shows that, by the mid-part of the century, British Indian policy was rather regional in its approach: the prevailing goal on the east and west coasts was the "insulation" of Indians until they were ready for assimilation while, in Central Canada and in the Northwest, the objective was quick assimilation primarily through education. The zeal with which Lawrence Vankoughnet tried, in the period 1874-1893, to implement the assimilation policy of the central government is the subject of an article by D. Leighton. The historian D. J. Hall describes Clifford Sifton's efforts to speed the assimilation process through the introduction, in the 1890s, of a more repressive system of Indian administration. A second essay by McNab argues that by 1915 the central government's attempts to develop a global national Indian policy had failed and, as a result of provincial interests in land and resources ownership, regional policies once again emerged. The editors have included in this first section two articles to cover the more contemporary period. The first, a well known article by D. Jenness (1954) illustrates the point that assimilation and eventual termination of reserves remained, after 1950, the philosophy of scholars as well as decision makers. The second article is an abridged version of chapter 17 from the Hawthorn Report (1966), which provides the context for understanding the termination policy formulated in 1969.

Through a definite focus on aspects of the evolution of Indian policy, the first section of the volume has a certain unity; however, the second part comprises an eclectic collection of papers under the heading: "Native Responses to Changing Conditions and Circumstances". In the opening article, F. L. Barron provides an analysis of the temperance movement in the 1820s, which prompted the government to adopt legislation prohibiting the sale of alcohol to Indians. R. S. Allen looks at the events surrounding the Cypress Hills Massacre of 1873 in the Plains, and suggests that by supporting the subsequent Winnipeg Trial the government had acted out of self-interest. A revised version of a published article by I. M. Spry documents some of the consequences in the Prairies of the signing of the treaties and other changes introduced during the 1870s; in particular, the transition from common property to open access resources and finally to

private property, which resulted in the disappearance of the commons. Three essays deal with aspects of Metis history. J. Morisset provides a short analysis of colonial expansion through the northwest, T. Flanagan explains Louis Riel's theory of aboriginal rights, and R. Huel examines the confrontation that apposed Louis Riel and Louis Schmidt over the issue of Metis identity during the crisis period of 1884-85.

The second section also includes an analysis by D. McCaskill of the Canadian legal and judicial system and the pattern of criminal activities among Native peoples. The last two articles are devoted to current social and cultural changes among the Inuit. L. W. Roberts' paper describes attempts made by the Inuit to preserve autonomy and control over their communities, and S. McInness' essay examines the strategies adopted by the Inuit to lead the government to entrench aboriginal rights in the Constitution. The book ends with a bibliographic essay by James St. G. Walker on the Indian in Canadian historical writing (1972-1982).

The primary value of the book is as an informational source for those interested in the development of Canadian Indian policy. The essays, collectively, underline the notable continuity in Canadian legislation over time, despite the emergence at certain periods of regional policies, and suggest that the assimilation objectives set forth were, in fact, impossible to attain.

The volume also stresses the right to self-determination for Native peoples and the right for social-cultural equality. A synthesis presenting a framework of analysis for these questions would have been welcome. The presentation by the editors is mainly descriptive, and only draws together in a historical perspective the diverse offerings of the individual contributors. Nevertheless, this reader can serve a useful purpose, for it provides students with an introduction to administrative and legislative policies affecting Native peoples. As mentioned by the editors, it is hoped that this volume will inspire more research and writing in this and related fields. The Nakoda Institute, under the sponsorship of the Stoney Indian tribe of Morley, Alberta, should be encouraged to expand its collection.