

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Wong, John Chi-Kit. *The Lords of the Rinks: The Emergence of the National Hockey League, 1875-1936*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005. Pp viii, 235, index, illustrations. \$32.95 (paper)

Colin Howell

Volume 35, Number 1, Fall 2006

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1015997ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1015997ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Howell, C. (2006). Review of [Wong, John Chi-Kit. *The Lords of the Rinks: The Emergence of the National Hockey League, 1875-1936*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005. Pp viii, 235, index, illustrations. \$32.95 (paper)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 35(1), 50–51.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1015997ar>

The professionalization of history, Wright demonstrates, involved its masculinization. Although women were central in the nineteenth century to the writing and preservation of history, as history became embedded within the university, they were pushed to the margins. History became defined as a masculine endeavour, requiring reason, decisiveness, and broad interpretation rather than the ostensibly feminine qualities of emotion and intuition. Some historians did support women, and often they recognized female graduates as superior to their male counterparts. But, in general, ingrained beliefs about male and female intellectual abilities and social position led male academics to exclude women from student historical clubs, separate men and women in seminars, and rank women below men for scholarships and academic positions. The sexism that prevented many women from continuing on in history also shaped what was considered historically significant. Wright recounts a wonderful example in which the *Review of Historical Publications* denigrated as insignificant the reprinting of an 1816 letter by a Saint John Woman by the Women's Canadian Historical Society of Toronto in their 1914–15 *Annual Report and Transactions*, because it mentioned only the latest fashions and styles of furniture. The professionalization of history was also its privatization. History increasingly became a conversation among professionals, who used technical language. Local historical societies, while still considered important to the collection and preservation of documents, were increasingly marginalized by historians who eschewed their "heroic" (and especially as written by women, their emotional and romantic) approach to the past.

There were also, however, continuities between the approach of "amateurs" and "professionals." Wright argues that facts and values have always been interconnected for historians. In the nineteenth century nationalists drew on history to convey Canada's Loyalist and Tory past and its imperial connections. In the 1920s and '30s historians drew on social science methods and the resulting emphasis prioritized facts over values. However, in the 1940s and 1950s, in the face of war and the perceived threat to democracy posed by fascism and communism, historians rearticulated the need to forcefully emphasize history's moral aims and to make history accessible to the public. As Wright notes in his conclusion, historians' debates in the 1990s over the purpose and aims of history echoed those earlier in the century.

Wright places his work within a historiographical debate over the emergence of the social sciences. There are other literatures that also could have been usefully employed. In showing that historians did not sever social scientific methods from humanistic ideals, Wright's work falls within an emerging historiography on North American religion and the modern university which argues, like Wright, that despite a process of change and modernization at the turn of the century, nineteenth-century moral thought continued to shape the intellectual landscape well into the twentieth century. This literature might have helped shed light on some lingering questions: Was the moral imperative changed by the aims and insights of social science? Or, in other words, did the "amateurs" of the nineteenth century mean the

same thing as the "professionals" of the mid-twentieth century when they evoked the need for history to elucidate the "moral good" and provide a civilizing influence? Moreover, did professional historians (with their disparate political and religious affiliations) all mean the same thing when they evoked these concepts? Similarly, Wright's is an important contribution to the history of the professionalization of a particular discipline. It might have been useful to know how the process of professionalization within this discipline compared to that of other areas, and in particular the experience of female historians to their counterparts in other fields. On a less substantive critical note, Wright has been ill served by the editorial staff of the Press—the note numbers in chapter one do not correspond to the endnotes.

Overall, Wright provides a thoughtful history of the historical profession and the pitfalls of the process of professionalization. It is a well-written book, which engages the reader, and it makes an important contribution to our understanding of the nature of Canadian history and more generally, the development of the modern university.

Catherine Gidney
University of Waterloo

Wong, John Chi-Kit. *The Lords of the Rinks: The Emergence of the National Hockey League, 1875–1936*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005. Pp viii, 235, index, illustrations. \$32.95 (paper).

This well-researched and clearly written account of the early history of the National Hockey League (NHL) provides an explanation of how various stakeholder groups, club directors, promoters, arena owners, players, fans, the media, rival leagues and the three levels of government contributed to the building of a complex and integrated professional hockey network. From the late nineteenth century until today, hockey has been a game of many different guises, from shinny contests on frozen lakes, to youth and recreational hockey for both men and women, to high-school and collegiate games, to the elite amateur and professional games directed at attracting broad audiences. In this study, however, one will find little mention of hockey played outside of major metropolitan centers, or by women or people of colour, or of the development of the game in small towns in hinterland areas, on the Prairies, in rural Quebec or in the Maritimes.

Wong's interest is in hockey as a commercial enterprise, and the development of a highly urbanized hockey network that mirrored the growing inter and intra-urban systems of transportation, communications and commercial interaction. Having gained relatively unfettered access to the NHL's previously unexamined archives for the interwar period, Wong concentrates on the development of hockey as a business, outlining the transition from fraternal, albeit commercialized organizations committed to elite amateur competition, to the closed corporations that organizations such as the National Hockey Association (NHA), the Pacific Coast Hockey Association (PSHA), and the NHL eventu-

ally became. In the grander scheme of things, the choice of a closed corporation model, rather than a system of community-based clubs that allowed for possible promotion and demotion within a hierarchical divisional structure—like that of soccer in Britain—reflected “the promotion of a sport brand based on skill level” and a hockey system in which the league struggled to maintain internal order and subordinate rival organizations.

While the basic elements of hockey’s development prior to World War One are well known: the initial pre-eminence of Montreal and Ottawa in commercial hockey activities; the splitting of hockey into separate professional and amateur camps as a result of the Athletic War; and the gradual expansion of hockey into new markets in Western Canada and the United States; Wong’s analysis is clearly the most comprehensive treatment of that history to date. Unlike commentators such as Bruce Kidd who focus on management and player relations, Wong’s analysis is more broadly fashioned and less critical of the NHL’s ascent to dominance in the hockey world. Kidd distinguished between strictly amateur, not-for-profit, and full-scale professional hockey, painting the NHL as a threat to community and national interests and even to the game itself. Wong argues instead that hockey was enmeshed in the processes of commercialization from its earliest origins. In a straight-forward narrative approach, he outlines the attempts of professional organizations to bring order to a highly competitive marketplace. In the creation of this corporate culture during the early years of the century, he argues, contending groups fought to assert their control over the player market, the buying, selling and access to franchises, the rules, regulations and officiating of the game, the wording of league constitutions, the authority of the league president, negotiations with rival associations, and the expansion of the game into the United States.

Wong’s access to the league archives and the correspondence of owners and league officials sets this book off from earlier histories of North American professional hockey. Although the influence of these records is most evident in the last half dozen chapters, they allow for a clearer description and more textured understanding of the important personalities involved over the years in the fashioning of the NHL’s hegemonic authority. Beginning with chapter six, “An Inglorious End and Auspicious Beginning,” Wong employs the minutes of league meetings and confidential correspondence to demonstrate both the growing authority exercised by Frank Calder as NHL president and the central importance of maverick NHA owner Eddie Livingstone whose litigious personality helped a fractious group of owners come together to keep him out of their exclusive club. Calder’s ability to manage internal conflict helped place the NHL on a secure footing during the 1920s. From that stable base it could confront challenges from rival organizations such as the American Hockey Association, and develop an integrated and affiliated minor league system whose constituents respected the NHL’s territorial rights.

Calder was often at odds with wealthy and strong-willed ‘lords of the rinks’ who were critical of his use of presidential power.

Charles Adams of the Boston Bruins considered him to be unduly influenced by Canadian owners. Chicago Blackhawks owner Major Fred McLaughlin was suspicious of the eastern establishment and clashed with Calder over the issue of territorial rights and his handling of the American Hockey Association’s short-lived defection from the NHL minor league system. Frank Ahearne of the Ottawa club was frustrated by Calder’s and the league’s refusal to increase its share of revenues from road games in order to salvage a franchise with a venerable past. Nevertheless, Wong argues, Calder’s approach was on the whole positive and restrained, bringing stability and order to the league. “Under his guidance the NHL emerged from being a small regional organization to become an international cartel. Although he did not hesitate to use the power of his office at times, he preferred diplomacy and alliance making, with great attention to details.” (p. 154).

Wong’s book is a valuable read for historians interested in sport, business organization, urban history and capitalist development before World War Two. Of course, the story of the NHL’s rise to ascendancy does not really end with the 1936 agreement between the NHL and the CAHA. The years to follow are equally important. Hopefully, Professor Wong will seriously contemplate a sequel to this useful volume that will bring this fascinating story of the consolidation of the NHL’s hegemony into the contemporary era.

Colin Howell
St. Mary’s University

McLeod, Donald W. *A Brief History of Gay: Canada’s First Gay Tabloid, 1964–1966* Toronto: Homewood Books, 2003. Pp 96, index, illustrations.

Donald McLeod, a Toronto research librarian, is one of the pioneering activists working in the area of the history of sexuality in Canada. Scholars, students, and members of the gay and lesbian public are indebted to McLeod for his chronology *Lesbian and Gay Liberation: A selected annotated chronology. 1964–1975* and his later work, co-authored with activist Jim Egan, entitled *Challenging the Conspiracy of Silence*. Now McLeod is back with a fascinating little appetizer of a book about the first Canadian gay periodical — *GAY International*. Although *GAY* published a mere 15 issues between 1964–1966 McLeod is convincing about the importance of this magazine for the history of gay and lesbian publishing, and the periodical press in particular.

GAY was launched in Toronto in March 1964. Directed at a gay male readership, *GAY* offered entertainment, re-publications from other sources, gossip and some local material, clip art, photography, and personal ads. McLeod notes that *GAY* was one of the first homosexual periodicals to use the word gay on the cover—and to be so explicit about its subject matter. Adding to the rich detail that McLeod provides about the magazine’s content, and cover-art, he also provides circulation figures and