

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Hesketh, Bob, and Frances Swyripa, eds. *Edmonton: The Life of a City*. Edmonton: NeWest Press, 1995. Pp. ix, 366. Black and white illustrations, maps. \$39.99 (paper)

J. William Brennan

Volume 28, Number 2, March 2000

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1016530ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016530ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Brennan, J. W. (2000). Review of [Hesketh, Bob, and Frances Swyripa, eds. *Edmonton: The Life of a City*. Edmonton: NeWest Press, 1995. Pp. ix, 366. Black and white illustrations, maps. \$39.99 (paper)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 28(2), 51–52. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016530ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 2000

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

nily to update its image, style, and methods. New York City which, after some hesitation, was chosen as its American headquarters, quickly became an "Open Air Cathedral," its streets the venue for noisy, open-air services, its slum-infested Lower East Side the Army's major battlefield. By 1900 as vaudeville and theatre flourished, the Army began to offer its own stage entertainment in the form of musical variety shows, accompanied by lectures and stereopticon views of its social programs. In 1917, the country's entry into war offered yet another opportunity to re-invent the missions impulse: the Sallie preparing platefuls of doughnuts for the boys at the front, a "surrogate mother," reminding soldiers (and financial sponsors) of all that was best about America.

With a keen eye for the symbolism of advertising, and an understanding of the modern construct of "role-playing" as key to the Army's ability to remain up to date, Winston attributes much of the movement's success to the American leadership of the children of William and Catherine Booth, the Army's English founders. Second generation evangelicals who were equally at home in slum missions and the parlours and boardrooms of New York's philanthropists, Maud Charlesworth-Booth and Ballington Booth (1886–1896), Emma and Frederick Booth-Tucker (1896–1904), and Evangeline Cory Booth (1904–1934) helped the Army to shift its image from a ragtag evangelical mission to respectability. Where Maud Charlesworth-Booth through the use of Chautauqua-style lectures presented the "Sister of the Slums" as a Christian model of the "the new woman" of the 1890s, a decade later the visionary Booth-Tucker's, motivated by the discussion on pauperism between social gospellers and urban reformers, established farm colonies for the urban poor. It was Evangeline, the youngest Booth, however, who managed to place the Army on a permanently sound financial base, thereby launching it on its present course as a conservative force for traditional values and today's top-grossing American charity.

"Red Hot" in its call to engage the culture, the Army in this account does have difficulty in maintaining its image as a "Righteous" movement of ardent evangelicals bent on sacralizing urban secular spaces. Where once Salvationists had sought to subvert the commercial culture to further the cause of evangelization, by the early twentieth century, they had become increasingly accommodationist. In an interpretive framework where religion and commercial culture enter into a symbiotic relationship, it is not surprising that in the end the evangelical movement that had set out to challenge and conquer the city became itself a manifestation of urban culture. By the 1940s Hollywood's film industry and commercial advertising had managed to turn Hallelujah Lassies into love-struck heroines and promoters of victory bonds.

Can one conclude, therefore, that the encounter of the Salvationists with the cosmopolitan commercializing culture of the city is ultimately a story of religious decline? Winston rightly argues that the story of the Salvation Army as an urban religion must be understood in terms of change and transformation, rather than in dualistic categories like rise and decline. Nevertheless, by drawing on film and advertising to package the Army's identity during the final period of this study (1920–1950), by focusing on leaders rather

than followers, and by making New York City rather than smaller urban centres her primary site of investigation, the author does not entirely escape the dualism she seeks to avoid. At the same time, in drawing on recent theory on the commodification of religion, this book moves the study of the Salvation Army well beyond concepts of social control, evangelical outreach, or metropolitan mission. Currently a Research Fellow at New York University's Center for Media, Culture, and initially trained as a reporter "to get the story and to tell it with style," Winston has written an engaging, thought-provoking, and elegant study, which sets a high standard for future research and writing in urban religious history.

Marguerite Van Die
Departments of History and Religion
Queen's University

Hesketh, Bob, and Frances Swyripa, eds. *Edmonton: The Life of a City*. Edmonton: NeWest Press, 1995. Pp. ix, 366. Black and white illustrations, maps. \$39.99 (paper).

This collection of essays was first presented at a conference held to mark the bicentennial of the founding of Fort Edmonton in 1995. Paul Voisey's "Unsolved Mysteries of Edmonton's Growth" is the most provocative, and it probably ought to be read first (even though it appears at the end of the book). Voisey briefly sketches Edmonton's evolution from fur trade post to western metropolis, and identifies several aspects of its growth that need to be examined more critically. He argues, for example, that while historians have described how Edmonton managed to obtain more extensive railway connections, Alberta's seat of government and the provincial university in the short space of five years (1905–1909), the subsequent impact of these acquisitions has been largely ignored. Thus in accounting for Edmonton's dramatic growth after World War II, Voisey asks, should the expansion of government activities and of enrollment at the University of Alberta not be given more weight than they have?

Voisey also questions the prevailing wisdom that 1947 (the year of the first big oil discovery at Leduc) was the key turning point in Edmonton's postwar economic boom. During World War II Edmonton provided a base for the construction of the Alaska Highway, the Canol Pipeline and the network of airfields (the Northwest Staging Route) that the Americans used to ferry Lend Lease aircraft to the Soviet Union. Did the war provide Edmonton with "expertise in the sorts of engineering, construction, and camp supply functions" (327) that would subsequently enable it to play a major service and supply role in the new economy spawned by the Leduc discovery, Voisey wonders.

The other thirty-three essays bring together the different perspectives of academic and popular historians (as well as geographers, sociologists and other urban specialists). Some address themes raised in Voisey's essay: P. J. Smith's "Planning for Residential Growth since the 1940s" and Doug Owrarn's "The Baby Boom and the Transformation of the University of Alberta" most espe-

cially. Others reveal something of the ethnic diversity of the city and its impact on Edmonton's cultural life, or tell us more about the lives of some famous and not-so-famous Edmontonians (people as varied as fur trader James Bird, early businessman Alexander Taylor, suffrage activist and magistrate Emily Murphy, labour politician and mayor Elmer Roper, musician Tommy Banks, and sports entrepreneur Peter Pocklington).

Like all conference proceedings, these essays are somewhat uneven in quality, but there is enough in *Edmonton: The Life of a City* to justify careful perusal.

J. William Brennan
Department of History
University of Regina

Hamlin, Christopher. *Public Health and Social Justice in the Age of Chadwick: Britain 1800–1854*. Cambridge Studies in the History of Medicine. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1998. Pp. vii, 368. 7 black and white illustrations, and index. US\$64.95

Nineteenth-century urban historians are familiar with campaigns to clean up unsanitary cities through the provision of clean water and the efficient removal of human and industrial waste. This public health movement, as it is usually called, took its origins in early Victorian Britain under the leadership of the bureaucrat Edwin Chadwick, and by the end of the century his program for urban renewal had been largely adopted in England and abroad. Analysis of the differential implementation of sanitary reform is a staple of Victorian urban history, yet according to the medical historian Christopher Hamlin the content of Chadwick's program itself has never been subject to proper scrutiny. Historians have accepted Chadwick's paradigm for public health as though it was the only possible rational solution to the crisis of urbanization. In this important book, Hamlin subjects Chadwick's model of public health to critical reappraisal. Chadwick, Hamlin argues, did not discover the sanitary solution to excessive urban death and disease. Rather, he actively constructed a narrow, technocratic, conservative version of public health in contrast to a rival social medicine with far more reformist potential.

The first two chapters outline the state of social medicine before Chadwick. Here Hamlin brilliantly recovers a lost tradition that was especially prominent among Poor Law medical practitioners and Scottish physicians. Medical men had realized well before Chadwick that filthy circumstances and water predisposed the poor to ill health, yet their theory of disease admitted a much greater range of potentially destabilizing influences on health than did Chadwick's. They were especially concerned with work and wages, and with the medical consequences of low pay and brutal working conditions.

This early social medicine was, however, never institutionalized in Britain, and one of Hamlin's goals is to explain that failure. Hamlin

devotes five chapters – more than half of the book – to the years 1833 to 1845 during which Chadwick created the sanitary version of public health. Chadwick was, he argues, fully aware of the Scottish strand of social medicine, and providing an alternative to it was the *raison d'être* of his famous 1842 *Report on the Sanitary Condition of the Labouring Population of Great Britain*. Far from being an empirical investigation of excessive mortality, Hamlin notes, the *Report* was a polemical, ideological document designed to preclude certain forms of analysis rather than to foster proactive behavior.

This is the heart and soul of the book. Hamlin's lesson that Chadwickian public health is not an objective response to deteriorating conditions is well taken. Yet one cannot but feel that Hamlin protests too much at Chadwick's reactionary tendencies. Although Chadwick's public health may have been less threatening to the status quo than the earlier social medicine, to call it politically "innocuous" (15, 83, 157, 185) may strike some readers as special pleading.

Three following chapters focus on Chadwick's attempt to create constituencies for public health: in Parliament, which resulted in the passage of the 1848 Public Health Act; in towns, which generated widespread official inspections of localities; and among civil engineers, which conveniently marks the end of the book and Chadwick's permanent exile from government service in 1854. Hamlin's attempt to deal with what he calls the marketing of sanitation to towns is the least satisfying chapter for urban historians; there is little in the way of local studies here. To be fair, Hamlin reserves his analysis of the workings of public health for a future volume, and even with this limitation, future treatments of local sanitary reform will be indebted to Hamlin's reappraisal.

This provocative book should be of interest to a wide range of readers. It is a deeply researched, theoretically informed, and engagingly written attempt to fully integrate public health into Victorian social and political history.

James G. Hanley
Department of History
University of Winnipeg

Stradling, David. *Smokestacks and Progressives: Environmentalists, Engineers, and Air Quality in America, 1881–1951*. Baltimore MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1999. Pp. x, 270. Black and white illustrations, bibliographical essay, index. US\$42.50 (hardback)

"I have heard it said," wrote the City of Winnipeg's Smoke Inspector in 1909, "that a 'smoky city means a prosperous city,' but common sense is opposed to such an assertion." Smoke, W.F. Thornley argued, "means waste, it also means that the atmosphere is fouled by unconsumed carbon ... which may mitigate against the public health, in addition to being a menace to the comfort of the individual."