

## Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Cruickshank, Tom; Peter John Stokes; and John de Visser. *The Settler's Dream: A Pictorial History of the Older Buildings of Prince Edward County*. Picton: The Corporation of the County of Prince Edward, 1984. Pp. xvi, 454. Illustrations, maps, indices. \$40.00

A. M. de Fort-Menares,

Volume 14, Number 3, February 1986

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1018094ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1018094ar>

[See table of contents](#)

### Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

### ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

### Cite this review

de Fort-Menares, A. M. (1986). Review of [Cruickshank, Tom; Peter John Stokes; and John de Visser. *The Settler's Dream: A Pictorial History of the Older Buildings of Prince Edward County*. Picton: The Corporation of the County of Prince Edward, 1984. Pp. xvi, 454. Illustrations, maps, indices. \$40.00]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 14(3), 293–294.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1018094ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1986

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

in three. This is a weakness for those who would wish to use the book as a reference work, rather than an on-site guide. She has a tendency, especially evident on buildings of comparatively modest architectural importance, to point out the obvious instead of allowing the viewer to see the building for what it is. Her breezy prose style occasionally degenerates. Finally, her book is almost obsessively Toronto-centred, an unexpected weakness considering the author's advertised familiarity with Los Angeles, New York and London. World-class cities have a sense of their worth beyond their own borders, but this book shows disturbingly few signs of that level of maturity. The author even identifies two distinctive domestic styles of architecture for the city — but, contrary to McHugh's schema, the "Annex House" and the "Toronto Bay-n-Gable" are not house types uniquely Toronto's own.

McHugh's book is one of the happiest byproducts of Toronto's sesquicentennial. It joins what has quickly become a shelf of fine volumes on the city's past. For the architectural historian, she builds on an already-impressive body of work on the city's morphology and structural history, including Eric Arthur's magisterial *Toronto: No Mean City* (itself a candidate for revision and reprinting soon) and William Dendy's somewhat idiosyncratic *Lost Toronto*. But for those interested in seeing survivals of its past, no usable and comprehensive guide to the city had existed until McHugh's book became available. Its publication was undoubtedly aided by the immense resources available to building historians in Toronto: the Metropolitan Toronto Central Library has, in ARCHIDONT, an unparalleled source of documentation on structures built in the city, the Toronto Historical Board has been a most active agent in research and preservation, and the city has long had an active group of enthusiasts (most of whom are thanked in the acknowledgements to this book) working on its history. These resources, however, can merely contribute to an endeavour such as this: the author's role determines the scope and quality of the final product, and here the result must be judged a major achievement, which even required the author to become her own publisher. The question remains: how can the urban historian make use of it?

Patricia McHugh's *Toronto Architecture* provides an impressive array of information on structures and on their place in the development of the urban fabric. Because of the need to analyse a large and complex organism over a period of time, urban historians often seem to downplay the importance of two crucial elements within the urban scene, people and buildings. Nor have Canadian historians gone very far in exploring the exciting possibilities that creative interaction between urban and architectural historians — natural allies in understanding so many aspects of city life — might engender. Studies such as *Toronto Architecture* go some small distance in refocusing the study of the city on those significant historical documents, the buildings, which often seem so strangely absent from studies of Canadian places.

This is a valuable contribution to a growing list of guides to Canadian cities. It creatively melds an immense quantity of information into a lively and intelligent pastiche, which offers the serious tourist, the armchair urban enthusiast and the scholar interested in individual urban documents a useful and informative review of the city's built heritage. All of this comes in an affordable, reasonably attractive book, and remarkably free from error. This is no mean book for no mean city.

Dana Johnson  
Architectural History Division  
National Historic Parks and Sites Branch  
Ottawa

---

Cruickshank, Tom; Peter John Stokes; and John de Visser. *The Settler's Dream: A Pictorial History of the Older Buildings of Prince Edward County*. Picton: The Corporation of the County of Prince Edward, 1984. Pp. xvi, 454. Illustrations, maps, indices. \$40.00.

*The Settler's Dream* deserves to become one of the standard works historians consult for formal and architectural precedent. The book is based on the Historical Architectural Survey of Prince Edward: a project that encompassed three thousand buildings, about a tenth of them included here. Prince Edward is a peninsular county near the eastern end of Lake Ontario. First settled in 1784, its relative isolation induced a social and economic conservatism to which may be attributed the survival of many of the early buildings and settlement patterns recorded in this book.

In a year to be remembered for the abundance of local and special history publications, *The Settler's Dream* stands out. As a selective inventory of even some of the county's buildings, the material transcends purely local interest on two counts: the inherent interest of the subject, and the quality of the study. Many of the structures in Prince Edward have been recognized as having an exceptional degree of importance and integrity since at least Eric Arthur's Ontario surveys carried out in the 1930s: they are now seen to epitomize the Loyalist legacy. As a straightforward record of this legacy, the book performs a valuable function, but it surpasses the normal limitations of an inventory format through its organization and the breadth of inquiry.

The book consists of seventeen chapters plus glossary, pictorial lexicon, bibliography and indices. Notes are integrated with the text. Five prefatory chapters deal with settlement history, topography, landscape, local building and an introduction to the communities. Eleven principal chapters correspond to a township, part of a township or a town, and may be further subdivided into villages. The community chapters all begin with a brief discussion of the settlement

and development of the subject area, accompanied by a survey map to which are keyed the properties under study. For example, the section on the county seat, Picton, analyses the economic and geographic forces which shaped the town, describes the physical evolution of the town and its principal buildings, and evaluates the impact of modern developments on streetscape quality. Eighty-four individual buildings are then examined in detail, supplemented by enlarged area maps, archival and contemporary photographs, reproductions of design drawings, nineteenth-century engravings, and analytical sketches.

The last chapter takes the form of a short essay called *Opportunities*. The steady underlying theme of heritage conservation is here carried to a natural conclusion with a plan for the revitalization of an important intersection in Picton. The conservation bias is argued largely implicitly even though it provided the impetus for the original study and for this publication. The inclusion of some of the fine buildings which have disappeared promotes the benefits of conservation more strongly than straightforward advocacy. Cruickshank comments oh-so-gently on insensitive alterations carried out in the recent past by county residents, reserving criticism for folly on a larger scale. In an extended study of Roblin's Mill in Ameliasburgh, the author waxes enthusiastic on the original mill building, "without doubt one of the finest industrial buildings in the province" (p. 355) but narrates with distinct regret the dismantling of the mill and its reconstruction in a Toronto "pioneer village," of *different masonry* — in the cause of preservation. For Ameliasburgh, the traditional techniques of heritage conservation "saved" a building, but contributed to the destruction of a town. Without belabouring the point, the need is illuminated for a holistic approach to planning measures in heritage conservation and community redevelopment.

The text has the succinctness and detail that come only of long intimacy with the primary sources: not least the buildings themselves. The author situates a building in a matrix of cultural influences, draws perceptive comparisons across the region, and identifies local characteristics in a clear, readable prose that is well documented and sprinkled with humorous excerpts from historical accounts. The restoration experience of editor Stokes is evident in some of the references to regional manifestations of structure and material across southern Ontario. This is the type of first hand knowledge too often lacking in historical and architectural publishing in Canada.

Cruickshank's background in geography and landscape architecture no doubt account for the unusual attention to plant species, the careful verbal and graphic mapping of site, and the awareness and understanding of the dynamics of architecture and landscape. Especially interesting is the pictorial lexicon, a visual analysis of the architectural vocabulary which should be of particular value to designers and students.

Despite the comprehensive approach, the marked lack of insight into formal and stylistic evolution is disappointing. A glaring lapse is the disregard for the impact of plan on form: the treatment of style as an applied decoration is a disservice to the discipline. Even the references to Orson Squire Fowler, the popularizer of the octagonal building form, ignore the provocative issue of living in an eight-sided house; and not one building plan is among the hundreds of illustrations. The influence of pattern books is not discussed, vernacular and high style are never distinguished, and the origins of trends are inadequately handled. If a high standard of Canadian introductory material could be presupposed, these complaints would be irrelevant, but this is unfortunately not the case.

Happily, production values are high. Thirty-eight colour photographs by John de Visser suffered slightly in the printing, but the black and white illustrations are well reproduced, captioned independently of the text, and are of a useful size. Copious historical views from a variety of sources are juxtaposed with contemporary at the same scale, and a clean layout permits easy correspondence of text and image. There are two excellent indices.

The book was published and distributed by the county authorities with the assistance of the Ontario Heritage Foundation and Wintario as a bicentennial project to honour the United Empire Loyalists and other settlers of the county. It is a solid contribution to the field and an exciting discovery.

A.M. de Fort-Menares,  
Architectural Historian  
Toronto

---

Zukin, Sharon. *Loft Living: Culture and Capital in Urban Change*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982. Pp. 212. \$18.50 (U.S.).

L'ouvrage de Sharon Zukin analyse le phénomène de la reconquête du centre dans un cadre tout à fait singulier : celui de la conversion de bâtiments industriels ou d'entrepôts («lofts») du Lower Manhattan, à New York, à des fins résidentielles. Les déplacés ici ne sont pas des habitants appartenant aux couches sociales inférieures mais de petites entreprises, et les conquérants, apparemment du moins dans un premier temps, sont des artistes qui ont commencé à investir les lieux au début des années soixante à la fois pour des fins de production artistiques et pour y élire domicile. D'abord illégale, cette occupation résidentielle des lieux gagne peu à peu droit de cité pour les professionnels des arts visuels, puis pour tous les artistes et finalement, *de facto*, pour à peu près n'importe quel petit bourgeois prêt à payer le prix de l'identification à un nouveau style de vie claironné