

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Dannenbaum, Jed. *Drink and Disorder: Temperance Reform in Cincinnati from the Washington Revival to the WCTU*.
Champaign, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1984. Pp. xii, 236.
\$22.50 U.S.

Noel, Thomas J. *The City and the Saloon: Denver, 1858-1916*.
Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982. Pp. xiii, 131.
Illustrated, bibliography, index. \$16.50 U.S.

David R. Johnson

Volume 13, Number 2, October 1984

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1018133ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1018133ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Johnson, D. R. (1984). Review of [Dannenbaum, Jed. *Drink and Disorder: Temperance Reform in Cincinnati from the Washington Revival to the WCTU*. Champaign, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1984. Pp. xii, 236. \$22.50 U.S. / Noel, Thomas J. *The City and the Saloon: Denver, 1858-1916*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982. Pp. xiii, 131. Illustrated, bibliography, index. \$16.50 U.S.] *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 13(2), 180-181.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1018133ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1984

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

Chicago: Continuity and Change in the Decade from 1900 to 1910") see the decline of a specifically German radical working class movement and the concomitant rise of the Socialist Party as the new radical force. The working-class movement was no longer German at its core.

These precise, carefully researched and written essays add to our understanding of infrastructure of urban-ethnic history, while Parot both erects the infrastructure and lays the brick and mortar.

Stanislaus A. Blejwas
Department of History
Central Connecticut State University

Boyer, M. Christine. *Dreaming the Rational City: The Myth of American City Planning*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press, 1983. Pp. xii, 330. Tables. \$27.50 U.S.

Boyer presents a much needed overview of the evolution of urban planning thought in the United States from the 1890s through the 1940s. Less a history of the realities of city planning (Mel Scott, *American City Planning Since 1890* (1971) remains the standard work) than an attempt to understand the planning mentality, *Dreaming* is sharply critical of most planning concepts and concludes that because of the failures of urban planning to date "the formation of a humanistic order to the American city still lies in the future" (p. 290).

In the first two of her study's four sections, Boyer examines the development of planning thought before the First World War. While pointing out the diverse origins of planning thought, she finds that in the early 1900s it was directed at two major, interrelated goals: imposing social discipline upon an unruly urban populace and providing city services needed for private commercial and industrial growth. Both aims, Boyer finds, served the needs of private capital more than those of the rest of society. Thus, the park and playground movement, international expositions, municipal art, and comprehensive city beautiful plans were parts of the same movement, as "side by side with the creation of a disciplinary order and ceremonial harmony . . . improvers gave heed to the creation of an infrastructural framework and a regulatory land order" (p. 7). The failure of these early efforts to solve urban problems led, Boyer shows in the second half of her work, to a transformation in planning thought during the 1920s, 1930s, and 1940s, to "a splintering into zoning ordinances, regional plans, and finally a new alliance between economic programs and state welfare programs" (p. 82). Comprehensive planning died. With the growth of suburbs made possible by the automobile, planners neglected the city core as they sought to create a new blend of urban and rural living. As fears of social disorder lessened with the decrease

in immigration, the cultural and social issues that had so concerned early city improvers were lost sight of, and "physical planning in the American city was reduced to functional metropolitan planning" (p. 196). Finally, during the crises of the Great Depression and the Second World War, Boyer writes, urban planning was subordinated to regional planning projects, (such as the T.V.A.), leading to chaotic urban developments: "skyscrapers on spatial platforms floating above the tangled streets and strangled by city highways, isolated blocks of public housing and civic or cultural centers cordoned off within their own sectors" (p. 207).

Dreaming is an important book. Its subject deserves more attention than it has received, and Boyer is to be commended for trying to relate her observations on planning thought to social and economic trends in the United States. Yet, *Dreaming* is also a frustrating book, for so much more could have been done. Deeply influenced by the work of Michael Foucault, Boyer too often fails to point out casual connections and writes in abstractions, examining planning thought without looking at what was actually being accomplished. Her study would have been much improved by some consideration of the findings of urban planning by such historians as Gunther Barth, Bill Wilson, and Mark Foster. By the same token, Boyer frequently lapses into social science jargon (as in "Disciplinary control proceeded by distributing bodies in space, allocating each individual to a cellular partition, creating a functional space out of this analytical spatial arrangement" [p. 70]) which obscures the meaning of what she is trying to say. Nonetheless, *Dreaming* is a valuable work which should be of interest to scholars concerned with the development of planning thought or the evolution of city planning in America.

Mansel Blackford
Department of History
Ohio State University

Dannenbaum, Jed. *Drink and Disorder: Temperance Reform in Cincinnati from the Washington Revival to the WCTU*. Champaign, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1984. Pp. xii, 236. \$22.50 U.S.

Noel, Thomas J. *The City and the Saloon: Denver, 1858-1916*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982. Pp. xiii, 131. Illustrated, bibliography, index. \$16.50 U.S.

Professors Dannenbaum and Noel approach the subject of alcohol from very different perspectives and time periods, but both provide valuable insights into the importance of liquor in nineteenth century America. Dannenbaum focuses on temperance reformers in the two decades before the Civil War. He is concerned with the grass roots appeal of the temperance movement in Cincinnati, its structure, tactics, goals,

membership, and public impact. In contrast, Noel examines the reformers' arch enemy, the saloon, one of the most important, and most neglected subjects in urban history. He is interested in such questions as the ownership and patronage of saloons, their number and locations, the services they offered their clientele, and their political, economic, and social influence.

Dannenbaum provides his readers with an insightful and fascinating analysis. He posits three stages to temperance reform in Cincinnati. During the 1840s temperance was primarily a social movement which relied upon fraternal organizations, especially the Sons of Temperance, to accomplish its goals. Moral suasion lost its effectiveness by the end of the decade, as concern over rising social disorder and a belief that alcoholic consumption could only be controlled by regulating the manufacturers began to dominate temperance reform. In order to deal with these new concerns, the reformers plunged into local and state politics, a move which created as many problems for them as it solved. Following the chaotic controversies inherent in political activism, temperance reform after the War entered its third and last stage, "female dominated confrontational temperance." This conceptual framework enables Dannenbaum to make some perceptive observations about the role of fraternal organizations in antebellum urban life; his analysis of the complex interactions between temperance reform, nativism and politics is generally superb; and his discussion of confrontational temperance permits him to demonstrate the continuities between ante and postbellum reform and to make several intriguing remarks about the emerging importance of women in reform movements.

Professor Noel amply demonstrates the saloon's crucial role in Denver. He documents its importance as a community centre for the city's immigrant neighbourhoods, provides an interesting analysis of the saloon as a small business, illustrates how a growing antipathy toward the saloon influenced suburban development and local politics, and chronicles the interrelationship between saloonkeepers, criminals, and politicians. The chapters on saloonkeepers and on suburban antipathy toward saloons are especially well done. Noel's analysis reveals the tenuous conditions in which saloonkeepers struggled to make a living, and how the emergence of brewing syndicates doomed their independent existence. (Noel's analysis of these issues should be supplemented by Perry Duis' excellent book, *The Saloon*.) His discussion of the way suburban promoters used middle class antagonism toward saloons as a selling point for their subdivisions is the only analysis of this interesting strategy we currently have in print.

Neither book is without flaws. Dannenbaum is at his best describing developments in Cincinnati. When he ventures into state politics his impressive analytical skills sometimes falter, as when he attempts to explain Ohio's failure to adopt a prohibition law by curiously referring to Michigan's suc-

cessful referendum. Noel, however, has even more problems with political matters. He relies on a simplistic view of urban politics as a drama of reformers in conflict with bosses in assessing the role of saloonkeepers in city affairs. This point of view leads him to accept the reformers' assertions that underworld figures such as Ed Chase, in partnership with mayor Robert Speer, dominated Denver in the early twentieth century. While such assertions probably made good press at the time, they also obscure the complexity of urban politics and create false impressions as to the ways a wide range of competing interest groups jostled for influence in local politics. Also, Noel's decision to discuss the rise of brewery syndicates and crime problems associated with saloons in the same chapter seems odd, especially in the absence of any analytical framework which would give credence to such a juxtaposition. Finally, Noel frequently prefers description to analysis, especially in such crucial matters as the reasons for the decline of the saloon prior to the onset of national prohibition.

In sum, Dannenbaum provides an especially important analysis of temperance reform at midcentury which ought to become required reading on the subject. Noel's study suffers from some conceptual difficulties, but he has provided us with a useful and interesting look at one of the most important urban institutions in the nineteenth century.

David R. Johnson
University of Texas at San Antonio

Duis, Perry R. *The Saloon: Public Drinking In Chicago and Boston, 1880-1920*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1983. Pp. 303. Illustrations, figures.

Evidently booze is a fascinating topic. In the last two decades the consumption of alcohol and its impact on society has become one of the most popular themes in American social history. Historians have examined the role liquor has played in national and state politics, local and city government, working class culture and moral and religious reform movements. While much of this attention has concentrated on the progressive and prohibition years, other eras and aspects have been scrutinized. I.R. Tyrell's solid study of American temperance thought before 1860 is exemplary of the growing historical interest in the social role of alcohol consumption. Perry Duis's *The Saloon: Public Drinking In Chicago and Boston, 1880-1920*, a careful analysis of public drinking in Chicago and Boston between 1880 and 1920, constitutes an equally important contribution.

The Saloon, broad in scope and analysis, is a unique and ambitious study in many ways. Rather than limiting his research to one locale, Duis examines public drinking in two large centres for the forty-year period preceding prohibition.