

Relations industrielles Industrial Relations



Executives for Government: Central Issues of Federal Personnel Administration, by Paul T. Davis and Ross Pollock, Washington D.C.: The Brookings Institution, 1957, 186 pp. \$1.50.

Émile Gosselin

Volume 14, Number 2, April 1959

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1022330ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1022330ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Département des relations industrielles de l'Université Laval

ISSN

0034-379X (print)

1703-8138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Gosselin, É. (1959). Review of [*Executives for Government: Central Issues of Federal Personnel Administration*, by Paul T. Davis and Ross Pollock, Washington D.C.: The Brookings Institution, 1957, 186 pp. \$1.50.] *Relations industrielles / Industrial Relations*, 14(2), 308–310.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1022330ar>

Tous droits réservés © Département des relations industrielles de l'Université Laval, 1959

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

found that workers form groups in order to resist changes and divide informal means to protect the groups. The problem cannot be solved by just merely training first-line supervisors, by building up nice personalities. When the book uses the word « social system », it is not with a view of expounding a theory of non conflicting interest and of necessarily cooperative interdependence. The word means that the factory is a whole with parts, each of them bearing a relation of interdependence to every other part.

The authors of *Management and the Workers* are charged of ignoring the the extra-plant factors, economic and socio-political, « within which behavioral patterns and relationships are structured... » and this is where the critics score most heavily. The authors relate technology to its effects on the status and prestige scale in the factory but have little, if nothing to say, about technology and the extra-plant environment and their effects on management and management's decisions in all fields. It would have been logical for the authors to climb the factory walls and engage into an extra-plant social investigation. They would have benefitted from a better knowledge of the communities and sub-groups from which the workers were recruited and would certainly have grasped the influence of the plant itself in those areas.

In a final section, the authors discuss some problems in defining the Human Relations approach. He refutes the imputation of some characteristics which are supposedly unique to the school, and he seems to direct the critics' guns toward other schools which enjoy an astonishing freedom from attack, though they seem to be good examples for the study of those very characteristics... « The immunity enjoyed... may result from the restricted reading of the critics... » Describing and explaining the more or less immediate impact which the Hawthorne studies have had, the author devotes the balance of the book to show that the recent developments in the field of human relations in industry have a direct and a real link with *Management and the Worker*.

Hawthorne Revisited gives the impression that *Management and the*

workers had a very large number of critics and few outspoken defenders. Our own feeling is that the subject is discussed too much in terms of school vs school or discipline vs discipline. Those who have been perhaps the most violent critics of the « ideology » have learned much from the studies in terms of approach and methodology. Some of the criticisms are certainly unjustified but on the whole they don't appear as criticisms directed uniquely as *Management and the workers*, or at the initiatives undertaken by the Research group. They rather point to some inescapable flaws in the total design, to the necessary limitations in any project of an exploratory nature. They also constitute a strong warning to searchers that it is a very difficult position for a scientist, and often a misleading one, to assume at various times the **role of the doctrinaire** without giving proper warning to the reader that the remedies proffered do not strictly derive from a rigorous study of all the variables involved in the situation, but from a vision, however realistic, of the society of to-morrow.

EMILE GOSSELEN

Executives for Government: Central Issues of Federal Personnel Administration, by Paul T. Davis and Ross Pollock, Washington D.C.: The Brookings Institution, 1957, 186 pp. \$1.50.

Good government does not mean only the establishment of sound policies through elected representatives. It means helping the Executive to accomplish its fundamental and crucial tasks in the crucial tasks in the legislative and the administrative fields. In order to fulfill those objectives the reform of the Civil Service has become one of the major subject matter in the field of public administration since the beginning of the 20th century. England, Germany, France, Canada and the United States have made a particular effort in order to obtain, develop and retain executives for the central government.

The book under review « *Executives for Government* », draws its experience from the United States and addresses

itself to the functioning of the Executive in that particular country. However a student in the field of public or private administration may readily see the importance of that book for any level of government in a democratic country or for a large or medium scale private organization. Mainly the authors emphasize issues and alternative courses of action and concentrate their efforts on the clarification of the views and the evidence that are pertinent to the evaluation of alternatives. They do not offer the readers ready-made solutions. Rather their primary objection «has been to provide the reader with readily available material for analysis as he makes his personal choice among the alternatives».

The authors assume that at high and full employment levels of activity in a complex, industrial society, shortages of all types of highly skilled or especially qualified manpower are more likely to be the rule than the exception. In such a context there are rising pressures on the available supply of executive, professional, and scientific manpower, and governments at all levels have to compete with private industry in order to obtain and hold a sufficient supply of qualified personnel. They find themselves frequently at a disadvantage in the competition for qualified executives.

In a complex industrial society, the role of the executive becomes one of supreme importance and is critical to organizational survival and effectiveness. Our large governments present many unique characteristics that make exceptional demands on its top executive. The government has become the largest employer due to the special burdens which it has been obliged to assume. The responsibility for staffing the upper echelons of the executive branch is critical due to the necessity for reconciling political and administrative factors at that level. The difficulty of finding qualified executives increases when the recruitment is already limited by such factors as inadequate compensation, limited prestige, change of governments, etc.

The authors restrict their discussions to four issues: 1) How to provide a sufficient supply of qualified political executives for the executive branch of

the federal government. 2) The relative emphasis to be given to career and program staffing concepts for higher non political posts. 3) Alternative senior services systems. 4) The line to be drawn between political and non political appointments, if such a line is to be drawn.

Dealing with the first issue, the authors favor changes in line with the Hoover Commission proposals but they show no optimism in regard to an expanded supply of qualified political executives, at least in the near future. Discussion of the second and third issues brings the authors to the conclusion that program staffing must be defined primarily in motivational terms. It involves attachment to program objectives rather than attachment to partisan political objectives. On the other hand career service involves attachment to career objectives in the permanent service. Some alternatives are discussed in regard to the third issue. A proposal for an Administrative Service of the United States is first discussed, modeled on the Foreign Service type of career system. A second alternative is the Hoover Commission proposal for a Senior Civil Service. The first alternative would meet the needs for a coherent and integrated system for attaining certain major objectives while the second proposal would build a corps of highly skilled administrators, specially selected, politically neutral, carefully supervised and obligated to serve where and when needed. Systems of career development for executives are also referred to: executive performance appraisal, development programs and evaluation of executive qualifications.

The line to be drawn between political and non-political appointees is discussed according to three alternatives which would mean three different levels of political appointments, if one or another of the three alternatives is adopted. The first line would run generally below the sub-Cabinet positions and above the heads of bureau. Staffs in the offices of heads of departments would be equally divided between political and non-political appointees. A second line would consider as political appointees bureau, division chiefs, assistant-chiefs and heads of regional and district field offices. A third alternative, or third line, would mean the creation

of a buffer zone of semi-political positions between the fully political positions at the top and the upper ranks of the non-political career service.

The authors recognize that none of the four above-mentioned issues can be settled in isolation from some sets of conceptions about the party system and its relation to the conduct of the government, including conceptions about the role of the Chief Executive.

EMILE GOSSELIN

The Evolution of Wage Structure, by L.G. Reynolds and C.H. Taft, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1956, 399 pp.

Le livre se distingue par la clarté de son plan et le succès avec lequel on l'a suivi. Trop souvent les espoirs d'un plan précis sont noyés dans la confusion des chapitres qui suivent. C'est là un reproche que l'on ne peut porter à l'égard des auteurs de ce volume: l'intelligence de la présentation est soutenue tout le long du volume.

On y retrouve deux parties principales. L'une traite de l'évolution de la structure des salaires dans quatre industries américaines; l'autre offre une étude comparative de la détermination et de

la structure des salaires dans cinq pays différents, la France, la Suède, la Grande-Bretagne, le Canada et les Etats-Unis.

L'objectif des auteurs est de déterminer l'influence des unions dans l'évolution de la structure des salaires. C'est là un objectif difficilement réalisable. La structure des salaires change continuellement et la responsabilité de l'union dans ces changements est mêlée à celles des autres facteurs économiques — qui, eux aussi, changent continuellement. Les auteurs ont cru, cependant, qu'en rapprochant de l'union les changements dans la structure des salaires, on pouvait produire certaines conclusions raisonnables.

L'étude n'aboutit pas à une « nouvelle » théorie des salaires: ce n'était pas là l'intention des auteurs. Elle précise, en les quantifiant, les changements qui ont pris place dans les différences de salaires qui existent d'une occupation à l'autre, d'une industrie à l'autre, d'une région à l'autre et ce, au cours des deux dernières décades, dans les pays déjà mentionnés plus haut.

On trouve à la fin du volume une intéressante appréciation des sources statistiques utilisées.

J.S.

PUBLICATIONS RECENTES RECENT PUBLICATIONS

Généralités

« Chronique du langage technique », par Ch. Voraz, *Travail et Méthodes*, Paris, no 129, décembre 1958, pp. 43-46.

« Le marché commun », *Bulletin Social des Industriels*, Bruxelles, Belgique, 30^e année, no 252, décembre 1958, pp. 445-469.

— « Commentaire de Radio-Vatican », pp. 445-446.

— « Les institutions européennes, expression de la solidarité de l'Europe », par W. Hallstein, pp. 447-450.

— « Le comité économique et social: à la lueur des textes », pp. 451-452.

— « Le comité économique et social », par M. Masoin, pp. 453-455.

— « L'examen de conscience du chef d'entreprise face au marché commun », par J. Paridant de Cauwere, pp. 456-463.