

Andreas Jacob. 2005. *Grundbegriffe der Musiktheorie Arnold Schönbergs*. 2 vols. Hildesheim: Georg Olms. 1080 p. ISBN 3-487-1295-7 (hardcover)

Murray Dineen

Volume 26, Number 1, 2005

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1013248ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1013248ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités canadiennes

ISSN

1911-0146 (print)

1918-512X (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Dineen, M. (2005). Review of [Andreas Jacob. 2005. *Grundbegriffe der Musiktheorie Arnold Schönbergs*. 2 vols. Hildesheim: Georg Olms. 1080 p. ISBN 3-487-1295-7 (hardcover)]. *Intersections*, 26(1), 152–154.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1013248ar>

University of Toronto in October, 1990 (appendix 3 is a list of participants, and appendix 4 is a symposium program excerpt written by Beckwith).

In Search of Alberto Guerrero is a fascinating account of a heretofore mostly unknown, and at times, unappreciated figure in Canadian music. Beckwith's thorough research and his varied approaches to narrative in writing about music in historical, contemporary, and social contexts, bring alive the multiple stories that surround Alberto Guerrero and make this book a great read. I conclude with Beckwith's own words: "With Guerrero, the piano plugged you into music, music plugged you into all the other arts, and altogether they plugged you into life" (p. 136). For those of us who have had the honour of knowing John Beckwith as a teacher, mentor, colleague and friend, these words will surely have a special resonance.

REFERENCE

Beverley Diamond. 1995. "Narratives in Canadian Music History," in *Taking a Stand: Essays in Honour of John Beckwith*, 273–305. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

GORDON E. SMITH

Andreas Jacob. 2005. *Grundbegriffe der Musiktheorie Arnold Schönbergs*. 2 vols. Hildesheim: Georg Olms. 1080 p. ISBN 3-487-1295-7 (hardcover).

Recent Schoenberg research in Europe has tended toward biography, social setting, reception, and the composer's prose writings, rather than toward the scores and their performances. Situated within that tendency, the writings on Schoenberg's music theories have exerted an important attraction, important in the sense of both size and critical interest. This attraction is not confined merely to Europe; Schoenberg translations have become something of a minor musicological industry in North America. The book in question here, Andreas Jacob's two-volume overview of the theoretical issues at hand in Schoenberg's thought, must be considered the leading edge of theoretical work undertaken on Schoenberg's manuscripts. It will prove requisite for any scholar (from any quarter of the world) with an interest in Schoenberg's theories and their manuscript legacy. Indeed the importance of Schoenberg's thought to modern music theory makes this a "must have" for scholars and institutions with a research interest in twentieth-century theoretical thought in general.

The first volume of the book is entitled "*Darstellung*," "Representation," a word redolent with associations for Schoenberg scholars. *Darstellung* is what Schoenberg promised as he set forth the aims of his text on harmony, in the introductory chapters to the *Harmonielehre* (1911). By the term he meant simply a representation of the essential ideas—a representation of, and thus not the ideas themselves. Other theorists made the mistake of presenting essential ideas as if in their natural form. (One such idea proposed that diatonic tonality was

“natural,” and by inference Schoenberg’s chromatic tonalities were “unnatural.”) Not so Schoenberg, who kept far away from invoking global ideas (such as nature), at least in the introductory chapters of the *Harmonielehre*.

What Jacob himself means by *Darstellung* is equally Schoenbergian—a modest, very close reading of Schoenberg’s texts under the following chapter rubrics (and without appeal to any great ideas such as “nature”): “Schoenberg’s Music Theory as a Topic [*Gegenstand*] for Research,” “Form and *Formenlehre*,” “The Musical Idea [*Gedanke*],” “Musical Logic and the Postulate of Comprehensibility,” “Form-Building Principles and Techniques (I): Motive, Repetition [*Wiederholung*] and Developing Variation,” “Form-Building Principles and Techniques (II): Rhythm and Meter,” “Form-Building Principles and Techniques (III): Tonality and Harmony,” “Representation of Ideas [*Gedankendarstellung*] in Counterpoint,” and “The Significance of Ideas as the Goal of Representation (On Instruction in Instrumentation).” This list enumerates not only Jacob’s concerns but also the main ideas of interest for scholars of Schoenberg’s theories. The discussion is not merely a survey of Schoenberg’s thought, however, for the author impresses his own critical identity upon the topics at hand. In particular, he points out that Schoenberg’s tonal theories—oriented as they are to a literature comprising primarily classical works—are not apologies for his own compositions. These theories stand on their own as an accomplishment, and must be treated as such. Jacob discusses them in lucid and clear prose, in ways that both expert and newcomer will find enlightening.

The second volume, entitled “*Quellen*,” “Sources,” renders scholars working on Schoenberg’s theoretical writings a very substantial service in the form of typewritten diplomatic facsimiles of many manuscripts hitherto unavailable except through the albeit helpful auspices of the Schoenberg Center in Vienna. The sources are arranged according to the chapter rubrics of volume 1, since they are invoked in that volume. Jacob states that this is not a critical edition (which will be accomplished elsewhere), but merely the documentation of the sources referred to in his study. While this is correct, Jacob is nonetheless scrupulous in editing the facsimiles.

Contained in the sources volume are some real gems, items that have languished in the collection of the Schoenberg Center in Vienna, part of the large theoretical *Nachlass* of fading notes jotted on disintegrating paper that Schoenberg set aside assiduously over two continents and a half century. Among the notables are two brief Schenker polemics, dated 1923, several entries on “folk” and “folk music,” as well as on art and revolution, and notices on Theodor Adorno (Weisengrund), Otto Klemperer, Igor Stravinsky, Hugo Riemann, Johann Strauss, Adolf Loos, Max Reger, Bach and Brahms, and Joseph Matthias Hauer, which give us insight into Schoenberg’s peopled world.

The sources are all carefully documented, both in individual entries and in comprehensive lists at the beginning and the end of volume 2, according to the catalog numbers of the Schoenberg Center, with other bibliographic data such as dates and provenance (the projects Schoenberg had in mind for them) appended. The bibliography at the end of volume 2 is wide reaching, with many little known entries pertinent to Schoenberg’s theoretical thought.

A number of the sources in Jacob's collection are reproduced elsewhere. In particular, a collection of manuscripts addressing the famous *Gedanke*, or musical idea, is replicated in part in Carpenter and Neff's edition of the well known "Gedanke manuscript" (1995). In Carpenter and Neff, however, some manuscript passages have been omitted. They are restored by Jacob, who resolves some questions of manuscript dating as well. Despite the presence of a few such replications, by far the greatest part of the book makes available writings hitherto unknown and certainly never reproduced.

The book is a publication of Jacob's *Habilitationsschrift*, undertaken under the auspices of the Philosophische Fakultät of the Friedrich-Alexander-Universität, Erlangen, Germany. Jacob is taking up the position of professor at Universität Potsdam in the fall of 2006. His recent work includes an edition of correspondence between Adorno and the music pedagogue Erich Doflein, published by Olms as well.

REFERENCES

- Schoenberg, Arnold. 1911. *Harmonielehre*. Vienna: Universal.
 Schoenberg, Arnold. 1995. *The Musical Idea and the Logic, Technique, and Art of Its Presentation*, eds. P. Carpenter and S. Neff. New York: Columbia University Press.

MURRAY DINEEN

A TRIBUTE TO M. ELIZABETH C. BARTLET (1948–2005)

Jean-Philippe Rameau, *Platée: ballet bouffon en un prologue et trois actes*, ed. M. Elizabeth C. Bartlet, Opera omnia, ser. IV, vol. 10. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2005. XCVIII, 435pp. ISMN: M-006-52787-8 (hardcover).

Although lighter works for the stage (ballets, opéra-ballets, pastorales-héroïques, etc.) far outnumber Jean-Philippe Rameau's serious ones (the tragédies), a truly comic muse was a comparatively infrequent visitor with the composer. In *Platée* (1745, rev. 1749, and subsequently), however, Rameau indulged the muse with unprecedented (and never again matched) enthusiasm. *Platée* is, quite simply, an unrelentingly slapstick and farcical piece of theatre, quite out of step with the composer's typical stage works. It was in its day termed a *ballet bouffon*, a unique category in Rameau's dramatic œuvre. Its comical substance embraces humorous effects in both orchestra and chorus, through colourful pictorial means in its instrumental treatment, and frequent, clearly deliberate upsets to normal accentuation and scansion in its handling of voices. In Act I, scene iv, for example, *Platée* becomes increasingly despondent at being shunned by Cithéron (a King of Greece), and she cries out to him, "Dis donc, Pourquoi? Quoi? Quoi?" ("Say, then, why? What? What?"). She is joined by a quartet of Naiades,