

Culture



N. Ross CRUMRINE and Marjorie HALPIN, *The Power of Symbols: Masks and Masquerade in the Americas*, Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1983. 244 pages, \$40.00 (cloth)

Jeanne Cannizzo

Volume 4, Number 1, 1984

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1078330ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1078330ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian Anthropology Society / Société Canadienne d'Anthropologie (CASCA), formerly/anciennement Canadian Ethnology Society / Société Canadienne d'Ethnologie

ISSN

0229-009X (print)

2563-710X (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Cannizzo, J. (1984). Review of [N. Ross CRUMRINE and Marjorie HALPIN, *The Power of Symbols: Masks and Masquerade in the Americas*, Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1983. 244 pages, \$40.00 (cloth)]. *Culture*, 4(1), 90–92. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1078330ar>

Tous droits réservés © Canadian Anthropology Society / Société Canadienne d'Anthropologie (CASCA), formerly/anciennement Canadian Ethnology Society / Société Canadienne d'Ethnologie, 1984

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

système indien d'occupation du territoire est basé sur la liberté d'accès, la flexibilité d'utilisation, la mobilité des individus et sur la conservation des ressources par une rotation de l'exploitation. Par ailleurs, l'auteur fait une description très fine du processus de décision ou de planification qu'il conçoit comme une sorte de sensibilité à toutes les variables inter-connectées. Bien que la sédentarisation dans les réserves ait modifié les modes d'établissement et de déplacement, le déroulement annuel des activités demeure inchangé depuis cinquante ans. Pendant l'automne, les Indiens dispersés en petits groupes chassent le gros gibier pour faire des provisions de viande séchée. De retour au camp de base, les chasseurs vont au poste de traite acquérir la nourriture et l'équipement nécessaires durant la saison de chasse et de trappage du début de l'hiver. Après la période des Fêtes, la chasse et le trappage continuent. Tôt au printemps, les Indiens retournent sur les territoires pour la chasse au castor. Enfin l'été est la saison où les Indiens se réunissent. Au cours des années 1960, les Indiens de la région ressentent les effets de la sédentarisation. Au cycle annuel des activités de chasse, trappage, pêche et cueillette se sont ajoutés le déblayage de sentiers dans la forêt, le guidage des chasseurs de trophées et le travail salarié sur la réserve. L'évaluation des biens produits dans ces deux sphères d'activité vient souligner encore une fois l'importance de l'économie indienne dans le nord-est de la Colombie-Britannique.

En conclusion, H. Brody propose une réflexion sur l'avenir des nations indiennes de la région. Faut-il croire que la frontière, qui a empiété progressivement sur les territoires des Indiens, finira par disloquer leur économie? L'auteur refuse ce fatalisme, même si une économie domestique ne semble pas faire le poids contre des projets de plusieurs milliards de dollars. Les Indiens ont démontré par leur histoire qu'ils avaient un mode flexible d'occupation du territoire et une capacité d'adaptation inouïe. Ils disent maintenant pour la première fois que leur système est sérieusement menacé.

N. Ross CRUMRINE and Marjorie HALPIN, *The Power of Symbols: Masks and Masquerade in the Americas*, Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1983. 244 pages, \$40.00 (cloth).

By Jeanne Cannizzo
University of Western Ontario

The old Pitt-Rivers Museum in Oxford is one of my favourite places; there for all to see is the later Victorian mind turned inside out. Its view of how the world is put together is in a thousand display cases. For in the Pitt-Rivers, everything is in its place. All the implements of the hunt are together, and within that category, all the bows and arrows, and within that subcategory, all the bows and arrows from Africa, and so on down into the smallest possible division. The room of the masks is wonderfully full; thousands of them hang from picture wire on the dingy walls. The Victorians knew what masks were about:

One who had thoroughly mastered the subject of masks would be possessed of the keys to the greater part of the mystery which locks from us the philosophical, religious and social development of uncivilized or savage man. (William Healey Dall, 1884)

This quotation appears on the handsome jacket of *The Power of Symbols*, and again in one of its seventeen essays. The editors and contributors to this volume, which grew out of a symposium at the XLIII International Congress of Americanists, are also, like the Victorians, looking for the keys. But unlike our predecessors in the pursuit of scientific knowledge, we are much less sure that culture is so well articulated that it can be divided up so very neatly or that it will stay on the wall. Thus it is not surprising that, while the authors hoped for the "discussion and development of a general theory of the mask" (p. 2), no such encompassing schema emerges from these pages. That is not to say that there is no unifying theme. "The articles of this volume treat the question of the power of masks and masquerades to transform participants, audience and social situations and/or to become idols or power-objects in themselves" (p. 2). The exploration of this theme is very successful, but the actual treatment of the question varies according to the abilities and theoretical inclinations of the authors, and most noticeably, according to their styles of analysis. Clifford Geertz once complained about ethnographies so full of exotic minutiae they were hard to read and those so full of

sweeping generalizations they were hard to believe. In *The Power of Symbols* we have both, as well as some extremely solid middle ground interpretations. So let us begin.

In his overview, editor Ross Crumrine revives, with some nice modifications, Malinowski's concept of the institution or concrete isolate, linking charter myths, personnel, norms and material apparatus to ritual and symbols. Also in the introduction is Elisabeth Tooker's fine discussion of the history of masquerade studies in anthropology and her basically pessimistic assessment that the diversity of these approaches "reflects the fragmentation of this discipline and [its] consequent disarray" (p. 13).

The case studies which make up the body of the work are divided geographically, into North, Middle and South America. Barnett Richling looks at the nalujut or heathen spirits, who appear on Epiphany, in the Inuit villages of Labrador. However, he suggests that the explanation of their origin lies not only in the machinations of the Moravian Church but also in the older mysteries of Sedna, goddess and keeper of sea mammals. Like the Inuit, the Naskapi have long been missionized. In trying to understand the loyalty of these people to their aboriginal beliefs and their simultaneous dedication to Christianity, Lucy Turner examines trance as a counter-balance to the mask. In an intriguing endnote she suggests that we might have an example here of inversion of form at cultural boundaries.

In his essay on Seneca masks, William Sturtevant clearly and very convincingly builds up his argument that the power of the false faces resides not in their ability to transform the wearer, but in themselves. The individual artifact is the living power. Raymond Fogelson and Amelia Bell, in their rather wide ranging article, look at both the Iroquois false faces and the Cherokee Booger masks; they concentrate on the latter as "an enactment of the basic tensions between culturally defined old men and young men" (p. 49). The final North American selection is Stanley Walens' short, powerful piece on analogic causality and Kwakiutl masks. Masks, he concludes, are the "ultimate metaphor not only of the self but of its ultimate dissolution" (p. 77).

All of the studies in the second section are from Mexico. Nevertheless, the variety of material is significant. Steven Lutes, taking the enjoiner to participant-observation further than most, actually became a Paskola dancer. In this rather charmingly personalized account, he suggests how he came to believe that the Yaqui "approach personal power

by means of a collective tradition" while in other societies "the existence of such things is denied, belittled, or at least left to the individual to figure out" (p. 84). Ross Crumrine's work on the Mayo Parisero, about whom he has written widely, is refreshed here by his revival of Edward Bullough's 1912 concept of 'psychical distance' which is used to compare the very different Mestizo and Mayo use of masks.

In her piece on symbolic representation in Mexican combat plays, Frances Gillmor provides not only descriptions of Los Moros and Los Cristianos, but also of these costumed opponents of Santiago, the Tastoanes who are shown on the cover. The colonial era also gives a clue to the meaning of masks in highland Chiapas. Victoria Bricker describes the masquerades of a Maya community which celebrate the Tzeltal revolt of 1712. I like her call to mine archives wherever possible for diachronic data. The last selection, Janet Brody Esser's paper on masks as agents of social control among the Tarascans, has the textual richness we have come to expect from art historians.

The last of the case studies are from South America. The merging of the llama and the Devil in contemporary carnival masks from Bolivia is the subject of Guillermo Delgado-P.'s essay. This detailed analysis suggests that, in the end, the mask is "a body in which two souls dwell", for "the triumph of the dominant culture was never a complete defeat of the indigenous one" (p. 142). R.T. Zuidema's painstaking reconstruction of the use of masks in Inca solstice and equinoctial rituals is accompanied by some spectacular drawings from early Spanish chronicles.

The question which J. Christopher Crocker seeks to answer is: why do women maintain their polite, collective fiction of ignorance about the actual identity of male maskers? Using frameworks supplied by Victor Turner, Levi-Strauss and Max Gluckman, this elaborate interpretation of Bororo performances is informed by the general thesis that "masking is a public secret that mediates the social experience of death through enabling actors to be what they can never become" (p. 157). The plays and dances of Venezuela are the focus for the final paper from South America, that by Angelina Pollack-Eltz, which demonstrates the complex interweaving of African, Amerindian and Spanish influences to be found in street performances.

A concluding synthesis, while actually not drawing together the diverse offerings of individual contributors, speculates much more generally on the meaning of masks and on the category of human endeavor known as masquerade. Laura Makarius

focuses once again on masks and their association with the violation of taboo, the source of their power. The symbolic richness of the masquerade stems from this "ambivalence and contradiction that result in a situation where the source of power is also the source of danger" (p. 200). Drawing their inspiration from 'biogenetic structuralism', Mark Webber, Christopher Stephen and Charles D. Laughlin, Jr. are interested in the triune brain, first formulated by Paul MacLean. Using the Makah Wolf ritual, they try to show "how symbols may operate both to organize and to transform consciousness and cognition" (p. 204). Last, but rarely least, the other editor Marjorie Halpin, writes on the Mask of tradition. Taking a line from Heidegger, she concludes that the essence of the masquerade lies in the fact that "those who commit their life to the maintenance of the traditional order are given the privilege of breaking it" (p. 226) and that "when they step back into ordinary reality, it is as their own ancestors". Which brings us, at least partially, back to the Victorians and their museum. If *The Power of Symbols* reveals in some ways how much further we have yet to go, how lightly our theories drape the mask, this nonetheless is the essence of our effort and the very nature of the anthropological undertaking. There are a few minor problems: for example, the pagination is off and the system for references and notes can be confusing. Most of the photographs are for illustration only and the elimination of those of low technical quality might have reduced the volume's price. However, the editors and contributors are to be congratulated for putting together this genuinely engaging collection. The University of British Columbia Press should be encouraged to expand its anthropological list. If, like the Pitt-Rivers mask collection, this book reveals our current anthropological turn of mind, then I find ourselves to be every bit as entertaining, interesting and inquisitive as our ancestors.

Nelson GRABURN, *To Pray, Pay and Play: The Cultural Structure of Japanese Domestic Tourism*, Centre des Hautes Études Touristiques, Aix-en-Provence, 1983. 89 pages, FF 50.00 (paper).

By John J. Chew
University of Toronto

To Pray, Pay and Play is a detailed study of the cultural aspects of Japanese domestic tourism. It is written in a non-technical, non-argumentative, textbook style. Although the author is a specialist on tourism in general, and although he states, as his purpose in writing the book, that he hopes it will advance the study of leisure activity in different cultures, he does not attempt to compare Japanese tourism with that of other cultures, but contents himself with a straightforward presentation of the situation in Japan.

He begins with a look at statistics. 110,000,000 Japanese make 150,000,000 trips annually, 4,200,000 of them abroad. Over 40 percent of the tourists are women. People between 20 and 39 make the most trips. 35 percent travel in large groups, 35 percent in small groups, less than 30 percent as families, less than 5 percent as individuals. Nara, with 150,000 people, receives over 4 million tourists annually. Kyoto, with a million, receives 50-60 million. These statistics would be far more interesting if the author had given us some idea of how they compare with those of other countries.

The Japanese Government actively supports tourism through the manipulation of railway, bus, and air fares, and through the construction of roads, hotels, and even "national tourist villages". The most trips by far are made by rail, and there is much romance associated with railway travel.

The timing of Japanese tourism is directly related to Japanese holidays. Workers' holidays and school vacations coincide at New Year's, but seldom otherwise, so that the majority of trips are made by groups of adults or by groups of children (with adult chaperones).

The primary motivation for travel is group relaxation. Sightseeing is secondary. Trips are sponsored by schools, and by government and private companies for their employees. Private companies and governments (national and prefectural) also subsidize resort hotels for their employees. Group travel is generally egalitarian, the purpose being to enhance solidarity. Working relationships are resumed on return to work.