

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

White, Randall. *Ontario 1610-1985, A Political and Economic History*. Toronto and London: Dundurn Press, 1985. Pp. 352. 52 illustrations; maps; index. \$34.95 cloth; \$16.95 paper

Bothwell, Robert. *A Short History of Ontario*. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers Ltd., 1986. Pp. x, 222. Illustrations, maps, index. Paper \$13.95

Bruce S. Elliott

Volume 15, Number 3, February 1987

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1018034ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1018034ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Elliott, B. S. (1987). Review of [White, Randall. *Ontario 1610-1985, A Political and Economic History*. Toronto and London: Dundurn Press, 1985. Pp. 352. 52 illustrations; maps; index. \$34.95 cloth; \$16.95 paper / Bothwell, Robert. *A Short History of Ontario*. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers Ltd., 1986. Pp. x, 222. Illustrations, maps, index. Paper \$13.95]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 15(3), 301-302. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1018034ar>

L'ouvrage de Ronald Rudin, est divisé en deux parties à peu près égales. La première, qui couvre la période pré-confédérative, (1759-1867) nous résume la croissance démographique anglo-québécoise. En 1861 celle-ci compte déjà pour 25% de la population du Québec. Le professeur Rudin analyse la contribution des diverses ethnies et confessions religieuses à ce mouvement démographique, et explique l'origine des classes sociales et des particularismes régionaux qui allaient marquer profondément l'évolution de la minorité de langue officielle au Québec. Et il s'attarde de façon particulière au système d'éducation et à la vie politique afin de mettre en lumière les nombreuses divisions qui minaient l'unité des anglo-québécois et les relations qui liaient minorité et majorité. Dans la deuxième partie de l'ouvrage, consacrée à la période post-confédérative (1867 à nos jours) l'auteur se penche sur les mêmes problèmes, mais dans un contexte de mise en minorité accrue des anglo-québécois. Ils se voient peu à peu dépouillés de leur influence à la faveur de forces économiques qui font de Toronto la nouvelle métropole du Canada et qui attirent hors du Québec une importante partie de leurs effectifs. Obligés de s'adapter, ils vont, selon Rudin, opter de plus en plus pour le bilinguisme et se refaire une place au sein de la société québécoise. Mais, dorénavant «minoritaires» dans toute l'acception du terme, et face à de nouvelles règles du jeu, ils devront apprendre à lutter pour la survie de leur langue et de leurs traditions.

Pierre Louis Lapointe
Archiviste régional
Archives nationales du Québec, Hull

Bookchin, Murray. *The Limits of the City*. Second revised edition. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1986. Pp. xi, 194. \$29.95 cloth, \$14.95 paper.

At its core, this is the volume first published in 1973, but it is bracketed in the revised edition with a lengthy new introduction and a final chapter entitled "Theses on Libertarian Municipalism."

The new material draws out more explicitly the operational implications of the original analysis, which charted, within a Marxist framework, the emergence of the bourgeois city. In this new material Bookchin distinguishes more explicitly between "urbanization" and "citification," and between "statecraft" and "politics." And he also brings to bear more pointedly the ecological implications of the malignant nature of contemporary city growth, concerns reflected in more recent work like *Toward an Ecological Society* (1980).

Bookchin's central concern remains "the development of a new, civically oriented, confederal politics." He argues that "libertarian municipalism constitutes the only viable social

and political alternative . . . to the impasse of proletarian socialism . . . and the rampant urbanization that will dissolve all community ties that exist today and replace the traditional forms of social articulation by the sinews of bureaucratization" (p. 25).

John H. Taylor
Department of History
Carleton University

White, Randall. *Ontario 1610-1985, A Political and Economic History*. Toronto and London: Dundurn Press, 1985. Pp. 352. 52 illustrations; maps; index. \$34.95 cloth; \$16.95 paper.

Bothwell, Robert. *A Short History of Ontario*. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers Ltd., 1986. Pp. x, 222. Illustrations, maps, index. Paper \$13.95.

The past few months have seen the appearance of two histories of Ontario, both intended for the popular market, and both of which claim to be the first such book to appear since 1928. The authors of both claim to have written political and economic, rather than social, histories, and both cover the history of the territory which became the province of Ontario from the days of Huronia to the fall from power of the provincial Tories in 1985. Randall White, formerly a provincial government economist, wrote his *History of Ontario* as a general introductory volume to the Ontario Heritage Foundation's projected Local History Series. Robert Bothwell, a political historian at the University of Toronto, was apparently commissioned by Hurtig publishers to write his *A Short History of Ontario*.

Bothwell's book is about a hundred pages shorter than White's, but it is in many ways the more satisfactory of the two. The major problem with White's book is that it makes for tedious reading. Though this may come as no surprise to generations of school children and western Canadians, it is hardly a forgivable lapse in a book addressed to a general audience. White's book is not, be it said, poorly written, though his competent prose cannot compete with Bothwell's pleasant, breezy style. More important, White's prose bogs down in detail in the sense that he attempts to include every major event of political significance, and this proves his undoing. Bothwell notes that the political issues of the early 1800s were transitory, and skips to the War of 1812; White would have been well advised to have taken a similar course in numerous places. He could also have departed from chronology a little more and have drawn together certain themes so he could deal with them in a meaningful way in one place. Urbanization, for example, turns up in a number of places (though not in the index), but one tires of reading how the

proportion of the population living in cities increased in this era, too. The result of White's inclusiveness is a proliferation of passages in which each succeeding short paragraph, at times every sentence, deals with a different major issue. The reader's head begins to swim with facts, unrelieved by colour. Even a figure as colourful as William Lyon Mackenzie becomes simply a label for the radical fringe of Upper Canadian reform, a sort of left-wing Robert Responsible Government. White at times seems to deliberately avoid a good story. We hear nothing of Mackenzie's highly personal slurs on the character of the "Family Compact" or of the consequent relocation of his press to the bottom of Lake Ontario, and there is nary a mention of Laura Secord, perhaps the only figure in the Upper Canadian period some readers will remember. Bothwell demythologizes Mackenzie and yet presents him as a fiery, colourful personality. White's politicians remain match-stick figures in the presence of Bothwell's vividly critical portraits of Hepburn and Drew. The pragmatic Mowat, indeed, is White's representative Ontario Politician, with whom his successors are constantly compared. White is politically cautious, too, though he does venture to pronounce the province's liquor licensing regulations "draconian" (p. 221).

Historical explanation also suffers from White's chronicling technique. Depressions and financial crises are simply events which have political consequences; they have no causes of their own. Bothwell structures his book to a far greater extent to facilitate promoting the reader's understanding of why things happened. His explanations are often briefer than White's, but they tend to hit home with greater emphasis because of his admirable economy of words, apt turns of phrase, and better sense of organization.

White's is also a curious book with which to kick off a local history series, as it pays little more than lip service to regionalism. Indeed, he uses the word "regional" as equivalent to "provincial." He recognizes the distinct political cultures of eastern Ontario and the south-western peninsula, but these distinctions become, predictably, less important as one leaves Upper Canada in the past. Bothwell, too, cites this "serviceable generalization" but he at least notes that it becomes "clearer and truer" when "reduced to a township-to-township basis" (p. 99). One would expect the introductory volume to a series of local histories to place greater emphasis upon regional variation, the elucidation of which is arguably one of the strongest reasons for doing local history at all. If the authors of future volumes in the OHF series commit themselves to writing good local histories, we can hope that a radically different history of Ontario can be written at a later date. The first book in the series attempts nothing so revisionist, but instead aims to provide the local historian with a handy reference to the provincial background against which to view sub-regional variations on major themes. For this the book is scarcely adequate. Any local historian exploring a theme will immediately need more information than White's book provides, and the decision to

exclude endnotes suggesting further reading, while according with the customary wisdom that references toll the death-knell for general sales, leaves the reader nothing to fall back on. The bibliography is no substitute for this — consisting as it does almost entirely of books — since much of the best work on Ontario's history is to be found in periodical literature.

It is, nonetheless, nice to see that Ontario has been judged worthy of two provincial histories after so many years. Some will see poetic justice in the fact that one of the commissions originated in Alberta. Much work remains to be done before the history of Ontario can be rewritten to reflect an understanding of the province's internal diversity, but in the meantime the uninitiated can find a pleasant introduction in Bothwell's *A Short History of Ontario*. The serious local historian will still prefer to have the better volumes of the Centenary Series near to hand.

Bruce S. Elliott
Department of History
Queen's University

Constructing Feminist Histories of Immigrant Women

Burnett, Jean, ed. *Looking Into My Sister's Eyes: An Exploration in Women's History*. Toronto: The Multicultural History Society of Ontario, 1986. Pp. ix, 242. \$10.00.

A large body of literature on the process of overseas migration to Canada and the construction of urban ethnic enclaves in Canadian cities has obscured the role and experiences of migrant women. One basis for the preoccupation within migrant and ethnic studies with the male experience resides in the great numerical imbalances of men over women in migration and during the lengthy periods of sojourning fostered by early Canadian industrialization. The invisibility of women has additionally been abetted by the stereotypical assumptions regarding the passive and non-productive roles of female migrants underlying historical and sociological ethnic studies.

Looking Into My Sister's Eyes is the first collection of articles which deals exclusively with the experiences of immigrant women in the processes of migration and settlement in Canada. While not achieving (nor claiming to strive for) a feminist *volte-face* in ethnic and migration studies, this pioneering book succeeds in filling in many of the silences on the social history of immigrant and "ethnic" women in Ontario.