

## Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Colburn, David R. *Racial Change and Community Crisis: St. Augustine, Florida, 1877-1980*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985. Pp. xi, 258. \$30.00 (U.S.)

Trotter, Jr., Joe William. *Black Milwaukee: The Making of an Industrial Proletariat, 1915-45*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1985. Pp. xvii, 302. Tables. \$24.95 (U.S.)

Graham Adams, Jr.

Volume 14, Number 2, October 1985

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1018009ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1018009ar>

[See table of contents](#)

### Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

### ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

### Cite this review

Adams, G. (1985). Review of [Colburn, David R. *Racial Change and Community Crisis: St. Augustine, Florida, 1877-1980*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985. Pp. xi, 258. \$30.00 (U.S.) / Trotter, Jr., Joe William. *Black Milwaukee: The Making of an Industrial Proletariat, 1915-45*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1985. Pp. xvii, 302. Tables. \$24.95 (U.S.)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 14(2), 223-224. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1018009ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1985

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

gious identity. They built a separate society beyond the confines of the Protestant city, and their history is as intriguing as the majority one described in this work.

In addition, inclusion of an article similar to those found in Robert Harney's, *Gathering Place*, would have more accurately portrayed the most significant change in Toronto's society, its evolution from a WASP to an ethnically and racially composite metropolis. Throughout the early decades of the twentieth century Toronto's history reflects a complete lack of tolerance and consensus. And if the city was or is now "forgoing a consensus" why today is there a journal, *Currents: Readings in Race Relations*, published by the Urban Alliance in Race Relations, with articles like, "Confirming Discrimination in the Toronto Labour Market?"

This work, however contains a number of excellent articles, including those by C. Armstrong and H.V. Nelles on public ownership movements, by Gunter Gad and Deryck Holdsworth on the evolution of office buildings and districts as being symbolic of Toronto's position in the business world, by J.M.S. Careless on the semi-centennial of 1884, and by James Lemon on Toronto's position as a North America city. Lemon describes many of the positive features of Toronto and expresses concern about the growing gap between rich and poor. Unfortunately, he stopped short and should have examined the poor from a racial, ethnic and class standpoint which would have defined clearly the widening disparity and lack of urban consensus.

The reader is left with the conclusion that Toronto has not overcome the tensions found in other, major, North American cities. Leaving out evidence to the contrary is no proof of any consensus. Certainly, a closer look at current American social and urban literature might have produced a more believable thesis. In examining a great city like Toronto, it is necessary to view the minority position as well as that of the majority.

Murray W. Nicolson  
History Department  
Wilfrid Laurier University

---

#### Contents

Preface, *Victor L. Russell*; A struggle for authority, *Paul Romney*; Orangemen and the Corporation, *Gregory S. Kealey*; Captain Bob and the Noble Ward, *Barrie Dyster*; Serving Toronto the Good, *Nicholas Rogers*; The first hurrah, *J.M.S. Careless*; Servicing the modern city 1900-30, *Roger E. Riendeau*; The evolution of the board of control, *Patricia Petersen*; The rise of civic populism in Toronto 1870-1920, *Christopher Armstrong* and *H.V. Nelles*; A triumph for public ownership, *Frances Frisken*; Building for city, region, and nation, *Gunter Gad* and *Deryck Holdsworth*; Toronto among North American cities, *James Lemon*.

---

Colburn, David R. *Racial Change and Community Crisis: St. Augustine, Florida, 1877-1980*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985. Pp. xi, 258. \$30.00 (U.S.).

Trotter, Jr., Joe William. *Black Milwaukee: The Making of an Industrial Proletariat, 1915-45*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1985. Pp. xvii, 302. Tables. \$24.95 (U.S.).

Prior to the Civil War almost all Black Americans lived and worked in the rural South. Starting with Reconstruction, however, Black migration into Northern and Southern cities began and by the 1920s the typical Afro-American was as much a city dwelling worker as he was a sharecropper or farmhand. *Black Milwaukee* by Joe William Trotter, Jr. and *Racial Change and Community Crisis, St. Augustine, Florida, 1877-1980* by David R. Colburn, both deal with the Black urban experience in modern America. These two cities exhibited similarities and contrasts; they demonstrated that although most Black Americans nourished similar aspirations the means toward their realization varied considerably according to circumstances.

Milwaukee and St. Augustine differed greatly in their economic bases. At the turn of the century most of Milwaukee's Blacks worked at low paying jobs in the service sector labouring as cooks, porters, waiters, bell boys, domestic servants and washroom attendants. Then industrialization in the form of iron, steel, tanning and brewing changed the city's economy. At first Milwaukee Blacks found themselves frozen out of factory work but the decline of foreign immigration plus heightened demands for manufactured goods allowed Afro-Americans to enter these occupations usually on the lowest rungs of the ladder. Contrary to the classic Marxist pattern, Trotter notes, proletarianization of the Blacks did not represent a loss of the autonomy provided by skilled crafts but rather a step upward from poorly compensated service employment. Unlike Milwaukee historic St. Augustine, oldest city in the United States, remained completely dependant upon the tourist trade from which it derived 85% of its wealth. Since no significant manufacturing industries emerged, both Blacks and Whites continued in service pursuits.

In population and in social organization the two cities diverged markedly. Afro-Americans in St. Augustine constituted 23.2% of the population. Subordinate to Whites they lived in a world of separate schools, separate washrooms, separate drinking fountains, separate hospital facilities and separate churches — all sanctioned by law and by custom. In contrast, as late as 1945 Milwaukee's Blacks comprised only 1.6% of the population. Unlike St. Augustine, Milwaukee did not legalize segregation but informal "gentlemen's agreements" whereby White owners agreed not to sell to Blacks except in designated areas helped to create Black belts in the city. Some Afro-Americans encouraged this segregation including ministers who wanted full congregations,

politicians who cultivated Black constituencies plus lawyers and businessmen who catered to an exclusively Black clientele. Nevertheless Milwaukee never developed a huge Black ghetto so characteristic of many American urban centres. In 1930 even in the two wards with the heaviest Black population density, Blacks represented only 22.2% and 13% of the total.

In matters of race relations St. Augustine boasted of its long tradition of harmonious accommodation. Blacks had to accept *de jure* segregation but since both peoples earned their living from tourism they consciously strove to foster a spirit of cordiality and cooperation for the sake of their mutual economic interests. St. Augustine escaped the violence which plagued much of the South in the late 19th Century and the city remained calm through the 1930s. Observers, Black and White, regarded race relations in St. Augustine as superior to those of most Southern cities.

*Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka* in 1954 shattered the peace of St. Augustine. By ordering the desegregation of schools and by implication the integration of all other public facilities, this decision overturned the entire legal basis of the Southern social system. In Florida and in St. Augustine moderates soon vainly struggled to stem the rising anti-integration tide. In St. Augustine, White Citizens' Councils joined with the John Birch Society and office holding political allies to thwart the effects of the *Brown* judgement in every way possible. In response militant members of the Black middle class, appealing especially to Afro-American youth, intensified their fight to break down racial barriers. When local efforts proved inadequate St. Augustine's Black leadership invited Martin Luther King and his Southern Christian Leadership Conference (SCLC) to enter the fray. King mobilized his "nonviolent army" and the once tranquil Southern metropolis became the scene of marches, protests, sit-ins, wade-ins and demonstrations. This provoked an acceleration of violence which included the use of dogs, clubs, cattle prods and mass jailings. According to Colburn, King held only a passing interest in St. Augustine but he wanted to use the agitation as a weapon to pressure Congress into approving the 1964 Civil Rights Act. Once this legislation passed, King and SCLC quickly pulled out much to the anger of the local leadership. At the time many citizens of St. Augustine believed that race relations had worsened but in the long run Afro-Americans gained desegregated schools, equal access to public facilities, voting rights and the election of Blacks to office. Despite these advances, Colburn declares, Blacks still lived at a standard far below that of most Whites.

In Milwaukee racial tensions mounted during the Depression years when Afro-Americans suffered severe economic setbacks and were also pushed further into dilapidated ghettos. Yet when a series of race riots erupted in several cities across the country in the forties Milwaukee stayed free of turbulence. Establishment of the Milwaukee Race Rela-

tions Council and of the C10 backed Milwaukee Interracial Labor Relations Council helped to bridge the communications gap. Trotter's study ends in 1945 preventing a complete comparison with Colburn's analysis of St. Augustine during the more recent years.

Trotter has based his study on impressive research buttressed by statistical analyses and illustrative tables. Since he deals almost exclusively with socio-economic trends, forces, and movements his work pays little attention to the human personality. Colburn, for example, clearly shows the tremendous importance of the charismatic leadership of Martin Luther King which affected both the fate of St. Augustine and that of the civil rights movement nationally. In a sense, neither city can be considered as typical. Milwaukee with its tiny percentage of Blacks did not follow the same pattern as urban centres with far larger Black communities. St. Augustine, whose economy rested wholly on tourism, does not invite comparison with the more representative industrial centres. Both books, nevertheless, advance our knowledge and illuminate our understanding of the highly complex issues involved in urban race relations in America.

Graham Adams, Jr.  
Department of History  
Mount Allison University

---

Goldfield, David R. *Cotton Fields and Skyscrapers: Southern City and Region, 1607-1980*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1982. Pp. xiv, 232. Illustrations, maps, bibliographical essay. \$20.00 (U.S.).

David Goldfield's survey of urban development in the American South attacks head-on the common view of cities in this region as "islands" in an agrarian sea. He proposes instead that southern cities are distinctive precisely because they have been shaped by the South. The three features that distinguish the South historically from other regions of the United States — its rural culture and life-style, biracial society, and colonial economy — have also set southern cities off from other American cities. The impress of the region is visible physically and spatially — in the rural quality of urban landscaping and architecture — and temporally, the past weighing on the present.

Until the Great Depression, Goldfield argues, the marketing of staple products was the main economic activity of southern towns and cities. Staple agriculture accounts for the urbanization that did occur, but also its limits. In the colonial Chesapeake, where tobacco marketing did not require intermediaries, towns contained at most several hundred residents. At the other extreme, the rice, slave and lumber trades made Charleston the major southern colonial