

## Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Thorpe, Frederick J. *Remparts lointains; La politique française des travaux publics à Terre-Neuve et à l'île Royale, 1695-1758*. Cahiers d'Histoire de l'Université d'Ottawa, No. 11. Ottawa : Editions de l'Université d'Ottawa, 1980. Pp. 196. Tables, maps, illustrations. \$6.75 (paper)

Bruce W. Fry

Volume 12, Number 1, June 1983

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019006ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019006ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Fry, B. W. (1983). Review of [Thorpe, Frederick J. *Remparts lointains; La politique française des travaux publics à Terre-Neuve et à l'île Royale, 1695-1758*. Cahiers d'Histoire de l'Université d'Ottawa, No. 11. Ottawa : Editions de l'Université d'Ottawa, 1980. Pp. 196. Tables, maps, illustrations. \$6.75 (paper)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 12(1), 90–91. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019006ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1983

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

"Urbanism" deals with the fate of kinship and community in the urban system. McGahan uses a number of inserts which demonstrate parental ties, and the social significance of the neighborhood for life in the city. Here he uses French-Canadian patterns in Montreal for example, and gets extensively into social network analysis. In chapter 10 he discusses the fate of community in the slums and the suburbs. The working class neighborhood in Toronto and "ordered segmentation in Chicago contrast life in the slums very well with the myth and lifestyle of suburbia."

An urban sociology text would not be complete without a short section on planning. McGahan begins with a discussion of political power and participation. Influentials in Banff, Alberta, are illustrated, and the characteristics of aldermen and mayors in five Alberta cities are compared by using inserts. Urban renewal in Africville, Nova Scotia, and relocation of the Lord Selkirk park area in Winnipeg provide further evidence of Canadian planning. He briefly concludes with an appeal for a national urban policy, and need for more research.

As you can tell, I like the volume. That is why I have spent most of this space outlining what the book contains. I have not been very critical because this first attempt at a Canadian urban sociology text is good. The 43 pages of bibliography show that the author has done a thorough job of reviewing, and integrating what Canadian research has been done, with American urban theory and research. There is a good balance between theory, empirical data and illustrations. McGahan has found an amazingly fine spread of urban research from Victoria to St. John's so that students across Canada should be able to identify with their own regional urbanism, and learn from the rest of Canada as well. The volume is very readable; Butterworth's has put its best into it. I plan to adopt it and use it in my classes.

Professor Leo Driedger  
Department of Anthropology and Sociology  
University of British Columbia

---

Thorpe, Frederick J. *Remparts lointains; La politique française des travaux publics à Terre-Neuve et à l'île Royale, 1695-1758*. Cahiers d'Histoire de l'Université d'Ottawa, No. 11. Ottawa: Editions de l'Université d'Ottawa, 1980. Pp. 196. Tables, maps, illustrations. \$6.75 (paper).

"Fish — that's why we're here, and that's why you're here too." Thus succinctly did a former mayor of Louisbourg describe the historical background of settlement in Cape Breton — "we" being today's inhabitants of the small fishing town, and "you" being the Parks Canada

employees undertaking the ambitious reconstruction project of the original fortified French town.

The importance to France of the North American fishing grounds and the lengths various ministers of *la Marine* went to protect fishing interests in the Gulf of St. Lawrence in the period 1663-1763 are brought out clearly and forcefully in Thorpe's dissertation. Equally forcefully, he dismisses theories of grand military design and strategically situated fortifications. Louisbourg is less plausible as the "Guardian of the Gulf" and mighty fortress than as a flourishing commercial port providing the mother country with a commodity more valued than the furs of Canada. That the town and its fortifications took the form they did is explained as the inevitable outcome of involving the French Corps of Engineers, with their marked anti-colonial bias and their system of contracting out.

The author sketches with broad, deft strokes the economic background in France following Louis XIV's reign, as well as the complex system of checks and balances employed by the civil service. The bureaucratic bag and baggage of a centralized government were applied wholesale to the Gulf possessions so that the colony, far more than the rest of New France, looked continually back to Europe for instructions, staff and even basic supplies. One of the most serious shortcomings of the Ile Royale colony was its failure to seek out systematically and to make full use of local resources, or even to draw on those of the other French colonies — an error convincingly explained by Thorpe as due to the sanguine belief of the French government in the short-term nature of the construction work required.

Given the self-perpetuating nature of bureaucracies, the Ile Royale venture became a long-term commitment occupying much of the careers, and indeed life-spans, of engineers, contractors and administrators. The government found itself embarked upon the most ambitious colonial construction program it had ever undertaken, spending more money on the fortifications of Louisbourg than on those of Quebec. Yet these expenses should not be exaggerated: we are shown that the colony's budget never exceeded 2.2 per cent of the ministry's total budget, and was often less than one per cent (Appendix IV).

That such a program would cause conflicts, tensions and frustrations among those charged with carrying it out is readily understandable; Thorpe succeeds in highlighting the difficulties that faced, or arose between, the protagonists so that the gap of two centuries is closed. The squabbles, the cost overruns, the supplies that fail to materialize — all could have been stories from yesterday's newspapers.

What is missing is detail on what was built: only by looking at the builders' plans and by scanning the *Etats du Roi* in Appendix III do we have any idea of the scope of the undertaking. The author's foreward notes that only a part of his original doctoral thesis is published here. Thus the concluding chapter refers to the poor design of the citadel barracks and of the Royal Battery, but any discussion of these structures has to be found in the unpublished section. A reader unfamiliar with the history of the Ile Royale colony may desire more orientation, but otherwise the reduced version makes for lively reading with no frustration at what may remain on the cutting-room floor.

It is a pity that the clarity of the text is not matched by the quality of the illustrations which are, in a word, poor. The wonderfully detailed original plans of the fortifications and buildings were painstakingly coloured to distinguish work accomplished from work projected and also to indicate different building materials. While much of the effect is obviously lost in reproducing these in half-tones, there is no excuse for the muddy grey, out-of-focus prints offered here. Similarly, the on-site photographs of the modern reconstruction of Louisbourg give the appearance of coming from a family album of World War I vintage. The publisher has obviously sold its author short in this regard.

As a final comment on the publication, an irony of history should be noted. Ile Royale was a French colony with a fortified town comparable to Quebec, and of comparable value to the French court. Yet unlike Quebec, it failed to remain a center of French tradition in North America; Cape Breton today is predominantly Scottish in population and culture. The present-day reconstruction and interpretation of Louisbourg thus take place in an anglophone milieu, and much of what has been researched and written about the place is in English. Thorpe's doctoral thesis was originally submitted in English. The version presented here, in keeping with the subject-matter, is in French. Ideally, one would hope that those interested in Canadian history would experience no difficulties in reading this edition, but such is sadly not the case. To reach a wider audience amongst North American historians and the many lovers of history who visit Louisbourg each summer, an English version would be a welcome complement.

Bruce W. Fry  
Head, Research Publications  
Archaeological Research Division  
Parks Canada

---

Senior, Elinor Kyte. *British Regulars in Montreal, An Imperial Garrison, 1832-1854*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's

University Press, 1981. Pp. xiii, 288. appendices, maps, illustrations. \$29.95.

Elinor Senior s'est donné comme mission de dévoiler l'impact «non militaire» d'une garnison impériale sur une ville coloniale, Montréal. Le choix de la période de l'étude est établi en fonction de cette problématique; la garnison atteint son apogée au niveau des effectifs entre 1832 et 1854. Montréal devient le chief-lieu de l'armée britannique au Canada à partir de 1836. L'auteur divise son étude en quatre parties mais elle traite essentiellement trois thèmes soit l'aide militaire au pouvoir civil, les aspects culturels et les aspects financiers de la garnison. La première partie se veut une mise en situation où l'auteur établit la prééminence militaire de Montréal pendant cette période et situe les troupes dans leurs cantonnements dans la ville. Mais cette première partie s'intègre rapidement au thème de la seconde, c'est-à-dire l'aide militaire au pouvoir civil. En effet ce thème prédomine puisque l'auteur y consacre plus de la moitié des pages de l'étude.

Pour ceux qui s'intéressent à l'histoire urbaine, certains aspects retiennent l'attention mais le style anecdotique, parfois dramatique et encombré de citations intégrées aux phrases, rend la lecture fastidieuse. Le rôle de l'armée dans la formation de la force policière de Montréal est longuement explicité. Par contre il faut dire que Senior s'attarde considérablement à décrire les incidents violents et à expliquer les conflits politiques de l'époque. En cela elle poursuit simplement l'histoire politique et événementielle traditionnelle. L'auteur démontre aussi l'interaction entre les officiers et l'élite montréalaise dans la vie mondaine et culturelle de l'époque. L'auteur semble avoir une bonne connaissance des personnes impliquées, de leurs relations sociales et de leurs intérêts politiques et économiques. Dans sa partie consacrée aux aspects financiers, son analyse des activités du commissaire général Randolph Routh et de son influence sur les pratiques bancaires locales est intéressante. Par ailleurs Senior fait un effort pour chiffrer l'impact économique de la garnison et démontrer les répercussions de la paie et des achats militaires, mais ici l'analyse demeure assez superficielle. Enfin l'auteur nous apporte force détails sur l'organisation de l'armée à Montréal et sur la vie quotidienne des officiers.

Ceci dit, certains problèmes d'approche et d'interprétation historique doivent être soulevés. Senior, dans son introduction, propose d'analyser l'impact «non militaire» de la garnison. On comprend mal comment une garnison puisse avoir un impact non militaire. Le concept militaire réfère à la force armée, à son organisation et à ses activités. Même s'il n'est pas guerrier, l'impact d'une garnison sur un milieu civil ne peut être autre que militaire. On comprend mieux la pensée de l'auteur en poursuivant la lecture. Même si elle décrit longuement des incidents violents, son discours prend un peu la forme d'une apologie