

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

James, Williams, and James, Evelyn M. *A Sufficient Quantity of Pure and Wholesome Water. The Story of Hamilton's Old Pumphouse*. London: Phelps Publishing Company, 87 Bruce Street, London, Ontario, 1978. Pp. viii, 151 and 40 unnumbered pages of illustrations. \$15.00

Norman R. Ball

Volume 9, Number 3, February 1981

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019305ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019305ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Ball, N. R. (1981). Review of [James, Williams, and James, Evelyn M. *A Sufficient Quantity of Pure and Wholesome Water. The Story of Hamilton's Old Pumphouse*. London: Phelps Publishing Company, 87 Bruce Street, London, Ontario, 1978. Pp. viii, 151 and 40 unnumbered pages of illustrations. \$15.00]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 9(3), 102–104.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1019305ar>

chapter overview of the Hamilton economy is strongest when treating that period. It is prone to error elsewhere, for example, quoting Adam Hope's 1837 prediction of financial disaster and stating "the debacle...was two long decades away" (p. 9). In fact, the collapse came within months. Once more, I suspect the want of grounding in economic history derives from a brilliant acquaintance with one school of Marxism and a secondary interest in economics that is evident in that school. That, not Marxism *per se*, constitutes a flaw. At the other end of the chronology, Palmer asserts in the important chapter on "Reform Thought and the Producer Ideology" that tariff protection had been "abandoned in favour of class interests" (p. 122) by Hamilton's skilled workers toward the-end-of-the-century. To quote Palmer out of context, "it was never quite that simple." Several instances testify to an enduring support for a protective tariff by significant numbers of Hamilton working men. Thousands appeared at a rally for Macdonald and the National Policy in 1891. "The Rolling Mill, Nail Works, and Glass Factory Men turned out in a body with banners." In the 1911 federal election, a Liberal Labour candidate ran against a Conservative protectionist in a straight two candidate contest in Hamilton's working-class east end. The "Lib-Lab" lost his deposit.

This is a bold book set in a particular Marxist tradition. The author frequently evades the empiricism that he claims for his work, but I think that he also runs into difficulty because the Marxist tradition that he embraces is one which downplays important features of working-class experience in

favour of culture alone.

John C. Weaver
Department of History
McMaster University

* * *

James, Williams, and James, Evelyn M. *A Sufficient Quantity of Pure and Wholesome Water. The Story of Hamilton's Old Pumphouse.* London: Phelps Publishing Company, 87 Bruce Street, London, Ontario, 1978. Pp. viii, 151 and 40 unnumbered pages of illustrations. \$15.00.

The Hamilton Pumping Station, born 1860, semi-retired 1910, fully retired 1928, but nonetheless still very much alive and radiating and awesome beauty, is both a work of art and a stunning example of Canadian urban engineering achievement. Regrettably it is virtually unknown and unheralded by all but a relatively small number of people. When William and Evelyn James came to Canada and settled in Hamilton, they met the Pumping Station and noticed that something was missing.

There is no monument to T.C. Keefer, no memorial to John Gartshore, Adam Brown or James McFarlane, nothing to tell our generation of the standards and achievements of early Canadian civil and mechanical engineering.

That is why we made the effort to write the book (p. 112).

A Sufficient Quantity of Pure and Wholesome Water chronicles the way in which a rapidly growing city met the need for a safe, reliable water supply. Dust, fires, and outbreaks of disease

pointed to the need for a proper water supply system. Various improvements and changes, all rendered inadequate by continuing growth, culminated in a design competition and the decision to adopt a plan submitted by the judge, Thomas Coltrin Keefer. Apparently quite unintentionally, the competition proved to be a cheap way of getting expert technical information. The fact that the machinery was made in Dundas rather than imported is a remarkable benchmark in mid-nineteenth century technical capability. The story is taken beyond the opening in 1860 to deal with various changes in the water system which led to the eventual obsolescence of the pump house and equipment which form the basis of the book.

Waterworks, like railways, were one of the nineteenth century symbols of hope and one of the strengths of this book is the way in which the Hamilton Pumphouse is cast in that light. William James is an engineering professor, and his understanding of technical matters adds to the book. It is refreshing to read of pride in mechanical achievement and the role it played in building and maintaining a utilitarian period piece. A related strength is the way in which the authors draw links between the mind of the design engineer and the contributions of skilled tradesmen.

The strengths notwithstanding, *A Sufficient Quantity of Pure and Wholesome Water* is sometimes frustrating. The quality of writing is uneven and some of the parts are not integrated sufficiently. Chapter one flows quite smoothly. In stark contrast the construction story, which has the potential for exciting

narrative and analysis, is little more than a compilation of dated reports. The biographical sketches of Thomas Coltrin Keefer, James McFarlane, John Gartshore and Adam Brown draw attention to important figures who are not widely known. However, the book would have been far richer had much of this information been interwoven into the narrative. The same might be said of some of the material in the appendices. The style of footnoting is inconsistent and in some cases does not allow follow up. The lack of a strong editorial hand is much in evidence. These weaknesses detract from the great amount of basic information which the book brings to light.

Parallel to the achievement in construction and preservation is a history of failure in both Canada, in general, and in Hamilton, in particular, which is only touched lightly by the authors. *A Sufficient Quantity of Pure and Wholesome Water* is a reminder of the rarity of serious work in the history of Canadian technology and engineering. Although Canada has a very large and expensive culture business which is adept at proclaiming its relevance to all facets of our collective identity, the actions of cultural institutions bespeak a view of life and culture which is often very narrow. Our museums, archives, libraries, historic agencies, subsidized media, and, above all else, our universities and other schools do very little to foster either understanding or appreciation of the role of technology and engineering in Canadian history. In this respect Hamilton is a caricature of Canadian cultural priorities. In a city with such a magnificent industrial past and heritage, it is sad to see its cultural

policymakers look upon the history of technology and engineering with what seems to be the disinterest or embarrassment normally reserved for the hidden illegitimate child of an otherwise proper family. At the present time, any residents of Canada's foremost industrial city who wish to visit a museum of science or technology, study the history of technology, or pursue a career in these areas must do as this reviewer has done: leave.

Norman R. Ball
Historian of Engineering
and Technology
Ottawa

* * *

Freeman, Bill, and Hewitt, Marsha. *Their Town: The Mafia, The Media, and the Party Machine*. Toronto: Lorimer, 1979. Pp. 174. Maps, illustrations. \$19.95 and \$8.95 (paperback).

"The water in Hamilton's bay used to be so clear," an oldtimer bragged recently while reminiscing about the city he once knew, "that you could see Rocco Perri." Since Hamilton's king of the bootleggers disappeared one day in 1944, the bay that was once the stomping ground of bootleggers' speedboats has become the murky backwater for one of the great corporate crimes of Canadian history, the Hamilton Dredging Scandal. The *Lunchbucket City* has a thousand stories like these. Marsha Hewitt and Bill Freeman tell some of them. There are stories of crime, corruption, hypocrisy, and deception; incidents in the careers of the power brokers who have made Hamilton *Their Town*.

Hewitt and Freeman tell these stories because they want to

develop an analysis of "the way to which special interest groups come to dominate society." They want to develop their analysis by elaborating on a series of events rather than by elaborating on some general theory. The authors share a vision of a city which involves its citizens, preserves its neighbourhoods, and maintains its natural environment. They also share a theory of how power has been administered to prevent this vision from becoming a reality. They reject a pluralist model of power in which power is held to be widely and evenly distributed throughout society. Instead, they find the elitist model of concentrated and unequally distributed power, a conception made famous by C. Wright Mills, to be useful. The one failing in this elitist model, according to the authors, is its inability to explain how all ranks of society have adopted elite views on most social questions. Thus, the authors are equally intrigued with the interests of powerholders and with the consensus whereby the excluded lose a sense of how their interests conflict with those of the elite.

The authors' approach to the distribution of power in *Their Town* hits the mark quite often. Some chapters such as "Welfare Hamilton Style" deserve to become classics of popular exposé. The chapter contrasts the carelessly generous subsidies and handouts to businessmen during three boom periods in the city's growth with the penny pinching and humiliating dole provided for the city's poor. In this and other chapters, the authors step on the toes of a host of powerful Hamiltonians. The educational and gossip value of material like this had earned the