

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Evenden, L. J., ed. *Vancouver: Western Metropolis*. Western Geographical Series, Volume 16. Victoria: Department of Geography, University of Victoria, 1978. Pp. xxii, 277. Tables, figures, maps, illustrations. \$4.00

Robert A. J. McDonald

Volume 8, Number 1, June 1979

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019396ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019396ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

McDonald, R. A. J. (1979). Review of [Evenden, L. J., ed. *Vancouver: Western Metropolis*. Western Geographical Series, Volume 16. Victoria: Department of Geography, University of Victoria, 1978. Pp. xxii, 277. Tables, figures, maps, illustrations. \$4.00]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 8(1), 131–134. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019396ar>

Evenden, L. J., ed. Vancouver: Western Metropolis. Western Geographical Series, Volume 16. Victoria: Department of Geography, University of Victoria, 1978. Pp. xxii, 277. Tables, figures, maps, illustrations. \$4.00.

The editor of a collection of original essays must exercise sufficient authority over topic selections and writing styles to shape the particular studies being offered into a coherent whole which is thematically integrated and stylistically consistent. One measure of such a book's success, then, is the extent to which the individual writers can maintain high standards of scholarship and creativity while at the same time conforming to and hence contributing to the volume's controlling concept. L. J. Evenden's Vancouver: Western Metropolis, an anthology of fourteen original essays by urban geographers, community planners and one economist which aims to explore "the characteristics which either express or contribute to" Vancouver's metropolitan status, is only partially successful because the required editorial control is not exercised with necessary vigor. The result is a series of essays of very uneven quality.

The heart of the book is to be found in the studies which explore the hinterland-metropolis relationship of Vancouver within the regional context of British Columbia. Roger Hayter's essay on "Forestry in British Columbia: A Resource Basis of Vancouver's Dominance" provides a useful discussion of the relationships in post-Second World War B.C. between the geographic expansion of the lumber industry, the specialization of function within the industry as corporate concentration occurred, the influence of external control on decision-making and research, and the relative importance of Vancouver as a forest industry management centre. C. N. Forward's descriptive account of "The Functional Characteristics of the Geographic Port of Vancouver," well documented with tables and illustrations, emphasizes the evolving spacial distribution of port activities in the Vancouver area and the close relationship between the port and the expanding hinterland resource economy, especially since the early 1950s. K. G. Denike's essay, "Financial Metropolis of the West," examines the function of the financial sector of the Vancouver economy and the resulting degree of financial control which the city has come to exercise within the hinterland economy. While Denike looks at Vancouver's role as a financial metropolis within the recent rather than historical past, historians will find the essay useful for its insights into the relationship between high and low-level capital investment in B.C. and the location of investment decision-making. J. W. Wilson's examination of "Electric Power Development in British Columbia" provides an historical overview of the expansion of electric generating capacity in the province, and attempts to assess the impact of this expansion on the province as a whole. The essay is poorly researched and documented (for the historical period, for example, would Patricia Roy's work on the B.C. Electric Railway Company not have been helpful?), and its conclusions are superficial. Equally dubious is John Bradbury's conclusion that the efforts of the B.C. Minister of Municipal Affairs to promote more stable and permanent resource settlements in the province have failed. In his

essay, "The Instant Towns of British Columbia," Bradbury surveys the corporate structure of the principal company towns which have emerged in B.C. since the early 1960s, and documents adequately the extent to which "international corporate capitalism" has been responsible for the establishment of new resource towns, but provides not a shred of evidence to support his conclusion that problems such as high rates of labour turnover and unbalanced demographic profiles are as characteristic of these new company towns as they were of the old. Evenden's introduction to this article (p. 7) is also very misleading. Mary Barker's "Recreational Hinterlands" examines recreation use by Vancouverites in the 1970s of the land and water environmental base in the city's hinterland area.

For historians the most provocative examination of the hinterland-metropolis theme is to be found in Lawrence McCann's "Urban Growth in a Staple Economy: The Emergence of Vancouver as a Regional Metropolis, 1886-1914," which makes a useful contribution to the study of Vancouver history by establishing for frontier regions the obviously important theoretical link between the emergence of an urban system and the expansion of an extractive economy. This link is provided, McCann says, not by such established theories of metropolitanism as those advanced by N.S.B. Gras or A. R. Pred, but rather by a theoretical model of urban growth in a staple economy. Drawing in particular on the work of Mel Watkins, McCann describes such a model, arguing that in a resource-based economy one infant community, starting with the initial intermediary function of transmitting staple resources out of the peripheral area and required services and goods into it, will as the result of a combination of factors develop subsequent backward, forward and final-demand linkages to the stage where it supersedes all competitors as the mother city of the region. In British Columbia, he argues, Vancouver quickly overcame competition from Victoria and New Westminster to assume this position.

McCann is less convincing at the empirical than he is at the theoretical level, and while a closer examination of the historical evidence does not refute his central hypothesis, it does suggest that his argument may require significant modification. Of particular note is the fact that McCann's staple model of urban growth fails to explain the first phase of significant expansion in Vancouver, between 1886 and 1893. While his analysis correctly recognizes that Victoria remained the principal commercial and financial centre of the province in 1891, controlling the management of coastal resource industries and the export trade in staple communities, the author's explanation of Vancouver's relationship to this Victoria-centered system is ambiguous. We are left to assume, as the model would suggest, that Vancouver's early growth was dependent "upon regional income derived chiefly from the export sector" (p. 27). Such was the case for the most part only insofar as money generated in Victoria and New Westminster (by John Hendry, for example) found its way into the Terminal City. In fact, Vancouver's business community developed very few new ties with the province's staple economy between 1886 and 1893, apart from links with the coast salmon canning industry and limited ties with hydraulic gold mining in the Cariboo and

the land market around Vernon and in the Fraser Valley. Vancouver's early growth owed little to interaction between the city and the peripheral staple economy, and a great deal to the same kind of boom psychology and speculative investment which provided the engine of initial growth in so many western communities during the railroad-building era. The first phase of Vancouver's development as a major urban centre is to be explained more by the speculative capital brought into the local real estate market from England by the Rand family or from the earlier real estate boom town of Brandon, Manitoba, by J. W. Horne, and of course by the solid capital investment of the C.P.R., than by any links between city and hinterland. Even the early city's lumber manufacturing sector expanded after 1886 mainly in response to local rather than export markets.

While the first half of Vancouver: Western Metropolis explores a very specific concept of metropolitanism, that of the external relationship between city and hinterland, the second half works from the more ambiguous and much different assumption that metropolitanism refers to the quality and character of any large urban place. Thus in this part of the book papers are offered on a variety of themes ranging from Robert Collier's discussion of the changing functional character of downtown Vancouver, to L. J. Evenden's assessment of the influence from the 1950s to the 1970s of access routes on the suburban development of Richmond, Delta and Surrey, to S. W. Hamilton's study of "The Land Market in Metropolitan Vancouver," and to examinations of Vancouver housing policy by Ann McAfee, "Citizen's Participation in Local Area Planning" by A. Horsman and P. Raynor, and the Strathcona Rehabilitation Project from 1972 to 1974 by S. T. Wong. The connections between the two sections of the book are not clearly drawn by Evenden in his rather confused introduction (pp. 10-11). Nor has the ambiguous nature of the volume's controlling concept led to the rigorous editing which the book requires. One wonders, for example, if Ann McAfee's rather polemical piece on contemporary Vancouver housing policy belongs in the same book with the well reasoned empirical studies by McCann, Denike, Hayter or Forward. The same can be said of Collier's essay, which adds little to Walter Hardwick's earlier study of Vancouver (1974), and is so badly written that one has to question seriously the editor's policy of avoiding critical comment on the "individuality of style" of the various presentations (p. iv).

The authors of several essays in this collection also reveal an annoying carelessness with historical detail. McCann argues that "By the eve of World War I, the economic base of the province was firmly established in the products of the mines, the fisheries, and forests" (p. 18); whereas in fact the coal mining industry on Vancouver Island had been "firmly established" by the 1860s and the coastal salmon canning industry by the 1870s; he also dates the Canadian Bank of Commerce's entry into Vancouver as 1895; it arrived in 1898. Economist S. W. Hamilton, in arguing that the opening of British Pacific Properties in West Vancouver "marked the beginning of intensive development on the North Shore" (p. 206), overlooks the considerable development in North Vancouver

before the First World War. The lumber industry in the interior which Roger Hayter suggests had originally developed only to "a limited extent" to serve prairie agriculture (p. 97), had in fact expanded in the Kootenays between 1900 and 1914 "primarily" in response to the prairie market; he also notes that "By the 1940s Vancouver was clearly the single most important centre in the forest product industries of British Columbia" (p. 97), a position it had attained some thirty years earlier. The carelessness of R. W. Collier is inexcusable. He has the C.P.R. making a land settlement with the B.C. government "subsequent" to the rail company's location "along the waterfront adjacent to Gastown" (p. 160); surely he means "prior to"! We are also told that Woodward's department store was constructed in 1911 (the first part was completed in 1903) (p. 162); that the Hudson's Bay building was constructed in 1939 (actually begun in 1912) (p. 162); and that Gerry McGeer was Vancouver's mayor "in the late 1930s and early 1940s" (p. 171) (he was mayor from 1935 to 1936). Perhaps foremost among the contributions this volume makes toward the further study of Vancouver is the clear impression it leaves that a solidly researched history of the city would be of invaluable service to historians and social scientists alike in their ongoing examination of the city's development.

Robert A. J. McDonald
Department of History
University of British Columbia

* * *

Bellan, Ruben. Winnipeg, First Century: An Economic History. Winnipeg: Queenston House, 1978. Pp. iv. 270. \$12.95 Cloth, \$5.95 Paper.

When confronted with the observation that Winnipeg is the most written-about city in the country, one historian resident in the city concluded that the reason for the notoriety in print was simple--cities, like politicians, receive significant attention only after they are dead. While not yet buried, recent observations indicate that the city appears to be dying. Once the centre of frenzied economic activity, the real "Queen City of the Prairies" now sports streets which resemble a hag's mouth with numerous buildings vacated or replaced by parking lots interspersed with pawn shops, karate studios and pin-ball machine arcades. Winnipeg's present has been amply confirmed by John Paskievich's empathetic photo study A Place Not Our Own: North End Winnipeg and her doubtful future assessed in David Young's Development Review Plan. The opposite of such a doom-and-gloom image emerges from Ruben Bellan's Winnipeg, First Century, which, while purporting to be a simple historical study of the city's development, leaves the reader with the impression that despite temporary setbacks, the future of the windy city is ever onward and upward.

The table of contents reveals the ambitious nature of Bellan's project. It is to take the reader from the "Origins of the City" in the