

---

**Renaissance and Reformation**  
**Renaissance et Réforme**



**Filippi, Daniele V., and Michael Noone, eds. Listening to Early Modern Catholicism: Perspectives from Musicology**

Michael O'Connor

---

Volume 41, Number 2, Spring 2018

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1085983ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v41i2.29860>

[See table of contents](#)

---

Publisher(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (print)

2293-7374 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

---

Cite this review

O'Connor, M. (2018). Review of [Filippi, Daniele V., and Michael Noone, eds. *Listening to Early Modern Catholicism: Perspectives from Musicology*]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 41(2), 179–181. <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v41i2.29860>

Ce petit volume restitue cette joie des partages et des livres. Dix illustrations, dans un cahier central, représentent les pages de titre et de texte ainsi que le métier d'imprimeur-libraire ou la ville de Francfort. Une bibliographie finale donne les titres essentiels sur les sources, le texte et la réception de l'*Éloge de la Foire de Francfort* ainsi que sur les études portant sur Henri Estienne et sur la Foire. Compagnon des visiteurs modernes de la Foire, il le sera également pour les visiteurs de textes et de bibliothèques.

HÉLÈNE CAZES

Université de Victoria

**Filippi, Daniele V., and Michael Noone, eds.**

*Listening to Early Modern Catholicism: Perspectives from Musicology.*

Intersections 49. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 2017. Pp. xviii, 332 + 21 ill., 7 audio samples. ISBN 98-9-0043-4922-3 (hardcover) €118.

It is not uncommon to hear the claim that, as the sixteenth century progressed, Catholicism became increasingly defined by discipline, surveillance, and uniformity. *Listening to Early Modern Catholicism* is an absorbing collection that, among other things, patiently undermines the cliché. The case studies and topical overviews show a remarkable degree of diversity, adaptability, and autonomy. Music appears as a peculiar register of social and religious life, reflecting the ways early modern Catholics sought to define their values, to inhabit space, to relate to others, to discover who they were in this life, and to embrace their transit to the next.

Two introductory chapters, by John W. O'Malley and Robert L. Kendrick, provide the context for the rest of the book: O'Malley continues to promote the virtues of "Early Modern Catholicism" as a designator for the field—something which remains needful as long as "Counter-Reformation" continues its lazy dominance; and Kendrick provides a very helpful, if somewhat dense, overview of music's resonance within interdisciplinary early modern studies. Subsequent chapters discuss musical life in Italian convents (Colleen Reardon), inculturation practices in the New World (Egberto Bermúdez), processions in Germany (Alexander J. Fisher), wills and testaments in Barcelona (Tess Knighton), rural schools in France (Xavier Bisaro), and, most frequently, post-Tridentine Rome

(Jane A. Bernstein, Noel O'Regan, Anne Piéjus, Margaret Murata). Religious orders, male and female, recur throughout (especially Jesuits, Franciscans, and Oratorians), as do confraternities. In many cases, distinct musical genres and types (lauda, litany, plainchant, oratorio, polyphony, etc.), are placed within a broader interdisciplinary framework that draws on and invites dialogue beyond musicology. Each chapter helpfully discusses the state of the question and lists key works in the literature. Musical examples are taken from “high” and “low” cultures and across a generous geographical spread (though I missed coverage of the sounds of English recusant Catholicism). One of the virtues of this book is the serious and deserved attention it gives to musicking that would never be found on a concert program or commercial recording because it is aesthetically insubstantial (not “works” in the conventional sense) and/or too devotionally explicit—such as various rhythmicized versions of plainchant in one or more voice-parts (*cantus fractus*), or harmonized singing improvised over a basic repeated musical skeleton (*falsobordone*), or catechetical/doctrinal songs for children and new converts.

Throughout the book, there is an attempt to present musical material in a way that does not intimidate non-musicians (a constant and probably unsolvable conundrum for publications of this kind), with a minimum of technical language, occasional references to illustrative recordings, and a dedicated online collection of audio samples. One hopes this mini-trove is just the beginning; I particularly look forward to hearing the doctrinal and devotional songs referenced in Daniele V. Filippi's chapter on music and catechetical practices.

The book's title focuses on *listening*, as does the back cover: “How did Catholicism sound in the early modern period? What kinds of sonic cultures developed within the diverse and dynamic matrix of early modern Catholicism?” However, the subtitle, “Perspectives from Musicology,” makes clear that the chief concern is with music and musical practices; beyond the briefest of asides about theatre, preaching, the murmur of praying priests, or the hubbub of an urban procession, there is very little direct attention to the non-musical sounds of early modern Catholicism. Nevertheless, it is to be hoped that this volume encourages historians and theologians of the period to listen more readily to musical practices as primary sources, alongside the more frequently consulted visual and literary arts.

Listening, after all, cannot be pursued in isolation. Musical listening is often enhanced by musical looking; even in the most non-literate oral cultures, eye-contact is vital (with the leader, or fellow performers, or other worshippers). Likewise with scholarship. This book gives us plenty of examples of how *looking* opens up fresh understandings of early modern music: studying the printed page and appreciating the diversity of approaches among Roman boutique printers, in contrast to the more generic and inflexible Venetians (Jane A. Bernstein), or acknowledging the always-incomplete nature of a score—how much is *not* notated—and thereby registering what is accomplished by performers (Ignazio Macchiarella), or contemplating the Marian statue from Cadiz, violated by Protestant English soldiers, now self-consciously celebrated with solemn music by the Catholic English seminarians in Valladolid, keen to show their integration into Spanish life (Andrew Cichy). Separated by half a millennium, and ever without the benefit of contemporary recordings, we have access to the sound world of early modern Catholicism chiefly through the portal of visual evidence.

This volume does fine service in naming a lacuna in early modern studies, making a substantial contribution to filling it, all the while encouraging dialogue among a variety of scholarly disciplines, and gathering essential resources.

MICHAEL O'CONNOR

St. Michael's College, University of Toronto

**Gibbons, Daniel R.**

***Conflicts of Devotion: Liturgical Poetics in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century England.***

Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2017. Pp. x, 331. ISBN 978-0-268-10134-3 (hardcover) US\$60.

Daniel R. Gibbons's *Conflicts of Devotion: Liturgical Poetics in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century England* is a valuable addition to the work being done on the intersection of literature and religion in early modern literary studies. The book's approach, in contrast to the somewhat indistinct title, is specific and illuminating. Gibbons examines the poetic responses of five English writers—Edmund Spenser, Robert Southwell, John Donne, George Herbert, and Richard