

Renaissance and Reformation Renaissance et Réforme



Tessa Storey. Carnal Commerce in Counter-Reformation Rome

Jennifer Maria Desilva

Volume 33, Number 2, Spring 2010

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1106589ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v33i2.15303>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (print)

2293-7374 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Desilva, J. (2010). Review of [Tessa Storey. Carnal Commerce in Counter-Reformation Rome]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 33(2), 148–151. <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v33i2.15303>

ethnographic expertise gained in North America (as in China) proved invaluable. Thomas M. Cohen's discussion of the Society's approach to its own rapidly changing ethnic diversity provides valuable insight into the ways a highly Eurocentric order assimilated the fruits of its experience.

The final two sections deal with the Society's broader impact on early modern and modern cultures. Gauvin Alexander Bailey's discussion of Jesuit architecture in the New World explores the various tensions explicit in cultural accommodation, from the importation of European stone for Latin American churches to the adoption of vernacular themes and motifs in Jesuit mission outposts. Louis Caruana's essay on the Jesuits' valiant but doomed struggle to preserve the remnants of Aristotelian cosmology provides insights into the benefits that intellectual flexibility confers even when engaged in regressive obedience to outdated models. In the final section, Jonathan Wright concludes that the suppression of the order in 1773 was in part due to "extraordinary bad luck" before displaying the rather more conventional evidence that politics—in which the Jesuits had always been particularly well-entrenched—also played a prominent role. Gerald McKevitt traces the trajectory of Jesuit schools as they struggle to preserve the Society's particular charism in an increasingly secular and secularizing United States, and Mary Ann Hinsdale provides an illuminating discussion of the Jesuit contribution to post-Vatican II theological discourse. The final entry, by Thomas Worcester, depicts the order as it stands today, from its geographical dispersion to the tensions confronting Jesuits as they prepare to greet the end of their fifth century of service.

This volume gives us an authoritative and reliable tour of the Jesuits and their remarkably varied history. It is highly recommended both as a general overview and as a jumping off point for more specialized investigations.

SEYMOUR BAKER HOUSE, *Mount Angel Seminary*

Tessa Storey.

Carnal Commerce in Counter-Reformation Rome.

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008. Pp. xvi, 296.

This new volume is a concise, widely researched, and interesting historical study. The discussion is wide-ranging, incorporating a varied source base,

as well as dealing with such important foundational questions as prostitutes' agency, the gendering of space, honour, the success of top-down reform, and the relations between prostitutes, clients, and the local community. In order to contextualize the Roman experience, Storey juxtaposes early modern opinions and modern scholarly judgments on the practice of prostitution in Rome, with studies of prostitution in other Catholic states (Bologna, Paris, Montpellier) and other confessional areas (Augsburg, Amsterdam). While this volume owes a significant debt to the work of Renata Ago and Elizabeth Cohen, as the footnotes show, it stands on its own as a great work of Counter-Reformation social history. Storey investigates the daily lives and material culture of ordinary prostitutes (and implicitly their clients) in Rome, from Pope Pius V's mostly failed campaign to marginalize and expel prostitutes in 1566 to roughly 1650 when the culture of elite urban sociability began to change. The first four chapters explore prostitution from the external (non-prostitute) perspective, while the remaining five chapters examine the identity, economic situation, expectations, and life experiences of the prostitute from her own perspective through wills and predominantly courtroom transcripts.

Storey's facility with a variety of sources is matched by her depth of research. The first chapter focuses on the descriptive and moralizing literature published in Italy between 1566 and 1650. Initially, these broadsheets, proto-cartoons, and pamphlets construct a discourse of fear concerning the life-pattern of prostitutes and the attraction that it might have at points for young women, who might turn to it to gain wealth or from vanity. Later this type of literature targeted the prostitute's would-be client, emphasizing the dangers of venereal disease, socially destructive habits, and eventually destitution.

While Storey does not hazard a guess as to the effectiveness of this literature, in the second chapter she provides a sound introduction to the city of Rome's economic and social character, explaining the continued demand for approximately eight hundred to a thousand prostitutes. The city teemed with relatively wealthy students, merchants, and clergy, many of who were unable to marry, while simultaneously there was a general scarcity of work for women, which at the best of times paid low wages. For some women prostitution was a lucrative solution; for others it was the only solution. Storey's third chapter elaborates this description with a discussion of the ecclesiastical authority's efforts to evict the more notorious (and wealthy) courtesans, and ghettoize the remaining prostitutes. The papal initiative was blocked by the secular civic

authority (*Popolo Romano*), revealing not only the contemporary understanding of the practical benefit of the profession, but also the power struggle that resulted in protracted negotiation rather than absolute control of the city.

Although the preceding two chapters show that there was substantial effort made at elite levels to establish social disciplinary measures, the fourth chapter reveals the shortfall of resources and community will. Storey uses courtroom documents from the *Tribunale Criminale del Governatore* to show how the city police (*birri*) participated in this campaign against prostitution. With only 80-odd policemen on nightly rounds across the city, only prostitutes who flagrantly flouted the law, could be easily arrested, or disturbed the peace with noise and violence attracted notice. Storey argues that prostitutes were widely tolerated by their neighbours as long as they observed the community ethos and projected an image of honesty. Storey concludes that there was no wholesale reform of social attitudes towards prostitution at either the elite or lower levels of Roman society, regardless of papal initiatives or fearful literary reminders.

The fifth and sixth chapters extensively mine courtroom documents to reconstruct the life-stories of their subjects. Storey's central questions in these chapters focus on expressions of collective identity amongst prostitutes, and discuss economic need and demographic patterns. While some evidence confirms the stereotypes promulgated in moralizing literature, for instance concerning relations between prostitutes and their mothers, overall these chapters reveal that the traditional early modern concept of womanhood has faint connection to the prostitutes' own articulated identities.

In the seventh chapter Storey examines the practical issues of prostitution: training, procurement, fees, and relations with clients. While contemporary stereotypes demonized the great wealth believed to result from prostitution, this chapter reveals the wide spectrum of financial security that Roman prostitutes experienced. More important than the money was the delicate management of clients, who ensured that a prostitute would maintain an honourable reputation, even while committing sin.

The ninth chapter draws on Storey's work on possessions and the domestic interior. While the chapter explores the importance of the prostitute's apartments and describes typical furnishings, the greater argument is about gendered spaces. This discussion is linked to contemporary fears of emasculation through protracted times spent in feminized space and, more generally, the

moral destruction of male reason through interaction with prostitutes. Storey concludes that the character of space was negotiated by the process of gifting (and selling) furniture, the activities that it hosted, and the varied interests of prostitutes (co-ed entertaining, sex, prayer), but was not overtly erotic or feminine.

Helpfully, Storey provides a clear guide to her sources. Many historians have been challenged by the intricate world of judicial documentation and the process of early modern justice itself. But with clarity and excellent footnotes Storey traces a sure path through the Roman archives. Anyone new to the world of early modern policing or the judicial system will find the information provided in the Introduction helpful. Moreover, throughout the volume Storey takes care to discuss the phraseology used by her subjects. Analyzing the particular language that prostitutes employed to describe their work, their identities, and their relationships with clients makes the situation and personalities more immediate and compelling. Finally, an extensive bibliography rounds out the volume.

The scholarly world needs more studies like *Carnal Commerce* that present so wide a panorama but digest the historical experience so clearly and concisely.

JENNIFER MARIA DESILVA, *Eastern Connecticut State University*

Randall C. Zachman.

Image and Word in the Theology of John Calvin.

Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 2007. Pp. v, 548.

Among Reformation historians and theologians it is commonly assumed that John Calvin's commitment to the essential invisibility of God had him deny that God could be represented in any kind of image. Randall C. Zachman has made some important qualifications to this assumption. He argues that Calvin insisted throughout his theological career that the invisible God does become partially visible in what he called the "living icons or images of God." For Calvin the self-manifestation of God, which occurs in a vast array of mirrors, signs, symbols, and living images, could be witnessed both in the works of God in the universe and in the works of God in Israel and the Christian Church. Calvin scholars such as T. H. L. Parker, Edward Dowey, B. A. Gerrish, and Thomas