

Culture



Yvonne ARTERBURN, *The Loom of Interdependence*. Delhi, Hindustan Pub. Corp., 1982, 205 pages, Rs. 60 (cloth)

Eva Friedlander

Volume 4, Number 2, 1984

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1078278ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1078278ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian Anthropology Society / Société Canadienne d'Anthropologie (CASCA), formerly/anciennement Canadian Ethnology Society / Société Canadienne d'Ethnologie

ISSN

0229-009X (print)

2563-710X (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Friedlander, E. (1984). Review of [Yvonne ARTERBURN, *The Loom of Interdependence*. Delhi, Hindustan Pub. Corp., 1982, 205 pages, Rs. 60 (cloth)]. *Culture*, 4(2), 76–78. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1078278ar>

Tous droits réservés © Canadian Anthropology Society / Société Canadienne d'Anthropologie (CASCA), formerly/anciennement Canadian Ethnology Society / Société Canadienne d'Ethnologie, 1984

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

de 700 langues et qui espère ainsi couvrir toutes les langues de la planète d'ici la fin du siècle. Les ethnologues qui, vus d'ailleurs, font souvent figure de cousins des missionnaires en compétition pour les âmes des mêmes «Indiens», risquent fort de devoir partager tous leurs terrains avec un ou plusieurs membres du SIL/WBT. Mieux vaut savoir de qui il s'agit et c'est là que David Stoll nous rend un service inestimable.

Les premiers chapitres expliquent les origines du mouvement, depuis la traduction assez particulière de la Bible par C.I. Scofield et la crainte d'une équation entre christianisme et socialisme qui fit naître leur anti-communisme fanatique, jusqu'aux aventures, dans les années 20, du fondateur de l'organisation parcourant à pied l'Amérique Centrale pour vendre des bibles. Ensuite, Stoll résume les activités du SIL/WBT en Amérique Centrale, au Mexique, en Asie du Sud-Est, aux Philippines, au Pérou, en Colombie et en Équateur.

L'ouvrage a le très grand mérite de couvrir tous les niveaux de l'entreprise: les simples traducteurs essayant de comprendre les complexités sémantiques de langues étrangères et vivant dans des endroits qui leur paraissent perdus dans les bois, les cadres moyens qui doivent négocier les ententes contractuelles avec les autorités nationales et donc s'ajuster constamment aux subtilités de la politique locale, et enfin les cadres supérieurs qui assurent une large part du financement de l'opération, fréquentent le «tout Washington» et entretiennent l'appui d'hommes aussi puissants que H.L. Hunt et Richard Nixon.

Le portrait tracé par Stoll est celui d'une organisation fourbue de paradoxes. Paradoxe de se prétendre une institution scientifique de linguistique (le SIL) à l'étranger et de se dire une organisation missionnaire (le WBT) à domicile, seules façons de gagner accès aux pays étrangers et d'assurer son financement aux USA. Paradoxe de vouloir recruter d'excellents linguistes qui soient d'excellents croyants et des gens disposés à vivre dix ou vingt ans en terrain de mission (le plus souvent, c'est la qualité de la linguistique qui en souffre). Paradoxe enfin, de simples traducteurs honnêtes et sincères au sein d'une organisation dont les grands patrons savent qu'il est essentiel de tenir tous les discours, même les plus contradictoires, afin de plaire toujours à tout le monde.

La question "*Fishers of men or founders of empire?*", nous laisse sous-entendre David Stoll, a été volontairement mal posée: l'un ne va pas sans l'autre. Il est évident que vouloir faire du monde un milieu moins terrifiant en le rendant plus semblable aux USA sera toujours un projet attrayant pour le

conservatisme américain. En répétant que les Indiens ont moins besoin de terres que de bibles et que tous, comme disait Paul aux Romains, doivent respecter les autorités civiles, le SIL/WBT fait très souvent l'affaire des propriétaires terriens, des autorités civiles ou militaires et de tous ceux et celles qui luttent contre les communistes, les «indigénistes», parfois le clergé catholique et presque toujours les organisations amérindiennes. En même temps, les missionnaires-linguistes constituent une cible fragile et leur expulsion du pays peut servir de concession facile à l'opposition, comme au Mexique, ou de réaction contre la politique américaine, comme en décidèrent les généraux brésiliens irrités par l'attitude de Jimmy Carter leur refusant l'énergie atomique, tout en leur mentionnant son intérêt pour les droits humains. Le SIL/WBT a l'ampleur suffisante pour offrir une arme intéressante, mais n'est pas assez puissant pour éviter de faire, dans tous les sens, le jeu de la politique.

L'impact du livre sera très probablement minime auprès des membres du SIL/WBT convaincus, depuis que Jésus leur a dit, que tous les haïront à cause de Lui et convaincus aussi que toute critique de leur oeuvre est fondamentalement le travail du Diable et de son incarnation moderne, le communisme. Très littéralement, le débat risque fort de n'être jamais suivi puisque David Stoll est sans aucun doute le suppôt de Satan. Pour d'autres, et, peut-être surtout, pour tous les parlants de langues exotiques et tous les ethnologues qui risquent fort de les rencontrer, l'ouvrage me semble essentiel.

Yvonne ARTERBURN, *The Loom of Interdependence*. Delhi, Hindustan Pub. Corp., 1982, 205 pages, Rs. 60 (cloth).

By Eva Friedlander
New York University

The cooperative movement has been an integral part of India's national economic policy; yet with the exception of Baviskar's work on sugar cooperatives in Maharashtra, and Winslow's on cotton cooperatives in the same state, virtually no anthropological research has been carried out on this important subject. Dr. Arterburn's study of silk-weaving cooperatives in the south Indian city of Kanchipuram is, therefore, a welcome addition to the literature. It is also one of the few anthropological monographs coming out of South Asian studies that has direct and immediate policy implications for India's economic development and, implicitly, for other developing countries as well.

The overall issue to which the book addresses

itself is the effect of a planned system of economic growth and the development of the cooperative movement on a group of people for whom the policies have been designed. Here we have a case study of a successful cooperative movement, self-initiated, running smoothly, operating at a profit, and increasing the economic well-being of the weavers. And, thereby, the book counters what has by now become almost conventional wisdom with regard to India, that the principle of hierarchy, underlying Indian social life, is basically antithetical, and therefore an obstacle, to economic development based on democratic and egalitarian principles. Instead, Dr. Arterburn shows convincingly not only that no such hindrance exists, but, in addition, that cooperatives can play a very positive and central role as an instrument of development.

Dr. Arterburn starts with the concrete, the daily lives of the silk weavers, and moves gradually to the broader economic and political context, ferreting out factors that have given shape to the silk weaving cooperatives in Kanchipuram. In the first chapter silk weaving is described as a way of life in which occupational and domestic life are integrally related. Extensive data on the organization of weaving and domestic groups indicates that the productive process determines the high degree of interdependence found within the domestic group and the lack of a set division of labor. There follows, in what constitutes the ethnographic heart of the book, a description of social relations, a comparison of neighborhoods and the principles governing interaction within them. Here, often hidden in a morass of information based on careful and painstaking ethnography, is data that raises basic questions concerning many well worn issues in the anthropology and sociology of India. The relationship between caste and occupation, for example, is thoughtfully presented. Silkweavers come from a variety of castes, only some of which are traditionally associated with weaving. And, the relationship between castes and the domains of life to which caste is relevant and irrelevant are discussed. Variation is found in the extent of conflict and cooperation that exists within neighborhoods, but variation is not based, as one might expect, on caste and kinship, but rather on the kinds of economic ties that exist between households, the length of residence, the type of housing, and socio-economic differences.

This chapter is a real contribution and one only wishes that it spoke more directly to the existing body of theoretical literature to which it clearly has a great deal to offer. As it stands, the reader is left to draw her own conclusions.

A chapter on economic organizations provides a history of the handloom industry and the cooperative movement in Kanchipuram, as well as the present organizational and financial structure of the cooperatives. The government's role in allocating funds to start the cooperatives and in expanding markets has ultimately given weavers more economic options, and greater control of the industry. But Dr. Arterburn's sight is focused not only on the cooperative form of organization. She compares it with other forms of economic organization in which weavers may be and are involved: the dependent or putting out system, independent weaving, and the khadi center. She points out that these forms do not exist independently of each other and explores the positive effect that the cooperative structure has had on the allocative structure of the industry as a whole. Weavers in general have benefitted through increased bargaining power, a heightened pride in their work and craft, and the lessening of social distance between weaver and master weaver.

Finally, success of the cooperatives has led to increased government intervention and control, which in turn has brought greater involvement of the weavers in government. The organization and politics of four cooperative societies, three of them associated with political parties, are compared, especially with regard to the way that politicians use the cooperatives for their own political gains. In spite of the problems politicization has created, Dr. Arterburn suggests that it has also brought about greater political participation and political awareness on the part of the weavers.

The book, then, traces not only the impact of planned economic development on the economic life of the weavers, but on their attitudes, and the social and political aspects of their lives. The cooperatives have helped to increase a sense of contribution to economic development, they have served to extend personal ties and social horizons, fostered sharing and friendship based on skill, and had a levelling effect on social relations. In addition weavers have gained administrative expertise and political awareness. In short the entire fabric of their lives has undergone a positive transformation.

Unlike so many works dealing with economic development, this book takes a bottom up approach. In doing so it adds to our understanding of why and how the cooperative form of organization has come to be the success it has.

It is to be hoped that this important book will be widely read and used by scholars and practitioners in the fields of South Asian studies, urban anthropology, economic development and political economy. And, it should be added, that for those interest-

ed in the weaving process itself and the income from weaving, detailed appendices are provided. It is not, however, a book for the casual reader. Extensive detailed description requires perhaps too careful reading for some very important points to emerge. One only wishes that these had been highlighted and made more salient for the less committed reader and thereby also more accessible to a broader audience. Notwithstanding this drawback, it is a book which, if one does read it, rewards one with nuggets of information that are thought provoking and offers a distinctly different view of Indian society and the potential for social change than one is likely to find elsewhere.

Ruth M. STONE, *Let the Inside Be Sweet. The Interpretation of Music Event among the Kpelle of Liberia*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1982, 180 pages, US \$20.00 (cloth).

By Chet Creider
University of Western Ontario

The author's aim in this book is to bridge the gap between the perspectives of the 'sound-ethnomusicologist' and the 'behaviour-ethnomusicologist', i.e., between the work of scholars primarily interested in musical structure as abstracted from the cultural matrix in which it exists and the work of scholars interested primarily in the social conditions in which music takes form. The music of the Kpelle of Liberia seems to provide an ideal context for such an effort. The music is formally richly structured, yet a good case can be made for the claim that social factors are intimately involved with the formulation of the music.

Stone puts forth the concept of the musical event as an analytical unit that is at an appropriate level to permit a research endeavour encompassing both perspectives. The effort seems successful, and at the very least it has been clearly demonstrated that it is possible for a single scholar to acquire the necessary sociological and musicological skills to carry out a combined research effort.

The most interesting parts of Stone's work, however, lie not in the area of methodological innovation, but in the specifics of the analysis of Kpelle music. She argues that Kpelle music is conceptualized by the Kpelle in terms of a framework which treats time not as any of the familiar lineal, cyclical or spiral processions, but as a 'three-dimensional spatial construction'. The 'inside' of

the book's title refers to musical performance, and in addition to numerous usages attesting to the treatment of time as a closed interval (i.e., as unidimensional), there are usages involving terms meaning 'over', 'underneath', etc. Kpelle time and music is characterizable not in terms of a linear progression but as consisting of 'moments' or 'presents' (in the temporal sense) which may then be filled and expanded. This leads naturally to an aesthetic based on density of texture (suggesting comparison with the work of the ethnomusicologist Judith Becker on Javanese music).

There are only a few negative aspects to the presentation made in the book. Some of the argumentation is weak, e.g., Stone claims that the Kpelle consider their musical instruments as surrogate participants since they use body part names for parts of instruments. This is somewhat analogous to considering a river to be animal-like because it has a mouth. Many African languages make extensive use of body part terms in a variety of non-body contexts, but although the metaphors are available for resuscitation, I feel that in most cases they are dead. Thus, calling a window in a house an 'eye', does not give a house a face. The writing in the book does not often match the interest generated by the book's ideas. It is too often turgid, academic prose: 'the performer plans and creates music performance which is audited and experienced by other performers and event participants' (p. 7). A good editor would have enormously improved the pleasure given by reading the book. Finally, on the positive side, it should be noted that in a context (African ethnography) in which vernacular material is presented by most anthropologists in hopelessly primitive and inadequate transcriptions, all Kpelle utterances are given in a fully phonemic (including tone-marking) orthography.

Renaud SANTERRE, Céline MERCIER-TREMBLAY et le Centre National d'Éducation de Yaoundé, *La quête du savoir; Essais pour une anthropologie de l'éducation camerounaise*, Montréal, Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1982, 889 pages, bibliographie, \$ 30.

Par Joan Ryan
Université de Calgary*

Ce volume impressionnant comprend 25 con-

* traduction française de Chantal Collard