

--> **Voir l'erratum** concernant cet article

Rudy, Jarrett. *The Freedom to Smoke: Tobacco Consumption and Identity*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005. 232 pp.

Daniel J. Robinson

Volume 37, numéro 1, automne 2008

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/019352ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/019352ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Robinson, D. J. (2008). Compte rendu de [Rudy, Jarrett. *The Freedom to Smoke: Tobacco Consumption and Identity*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005. 232 pp.] *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 37(1), 69–70. <https://doi.org/10.7202/019352ar>

Tous droits réservés © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 2008

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

érudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

were unlikely then to get involved in the discussions no matter how they might affect provincial prosperity. It eventually led to the province's most important industry, employing hundreds of thousands with good wages and benefits and contributing billions to provincial coffers over the years. It also solidified the economies of a number of Ontario cities, including Oakville, Oshawa, St. Catharines, St. Thomas and Windsor, and as well as Ste. Thérèse, Quebec. In more recent years some automobile plants, like those in St. Catharines and Ste. Thérèse have closed, but this does not minimize their contribution to local employment over several decades. To this must also be added the activities of the parts manufacturers.

An inevitable charge arises with any discussion of the Autopact, that it was a part of the "sell-out" of Canadian industry to US interests, or at least the continuing integration of the Canadian economy into that of the United States. However, as I have shown in my work, and as Anastakis does here, what was the alternative? Certainly American interests bought companies in Canada, (and Canadians bought in the US), but governments operate within certain limitations and one of those is to provide, as much as possible, a comfortable living for citizens. The Autopact and associated industries helped to accomplish that for many thousands of Canadians. Moreover, the automobile companies already were American-owned and any talk of a Canadian "people's car" in the 1960s was fantasy, as the author demonstrates. What is also clear from the book is that Ottawa played hardball, as Reisman and his team, backed by committed and unwavering politicians, more than got the better of their US counterparts. In the end, even the ultra-nationalist minister of finance, Walter Gordon, he of the 1963 budget's infamous takeover tax, welcomed the agreement for what it provided Canadians.

To be fair, Canada's success was also partly because the Big Three themselves, and especially Ford and Chrysler, were keen on the Canadian plan for a variety of reasons, like lower wage rates and a cheap currency vis-à-vis the US dollar. As the author points out, the role of Henry Ford II was crucial in convincing President Johnson to sign on and then take an active role in defending it in Congress. Why? Perhaps because that was what "the market" was deciding. This could be styled one of the first indications of the globalization that was to sweep the world in years to come—*American* companies chose to be stateless by favouring *Canada* over their own country. "Loyalty" to the United States went out with yesterday's dishwasher. However, there was another, contrary, phenomenon at work as well; the Autopact was an example of government intervention in the marketplace and "State directed production goals were now the order of the day."⁽¹⁴⁵⁾ The results speak for themselves in terms of employment, wages, benefits and general quality of life for those who participated. Might this be a lesson for the 21st century?

This excellent book is a must-read for anyone interested in the context surrounding the Autopact. It hearkens back to a simpler era where the role of government counted and where Canadians were more confident of their own abilities as well as

having a more definite idea as to where they wanted to go and how to get there.

Bruce Muirhead
University of Waterloo

Jarrett, Rudy. *The Freedom to Smoke: Tobacco Consumption and Identity*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005. 232 pp.

For the past forty years, public health and medical science have framed popular understandings of smoking. Addiction, cancer, quitting methods, heart disease, second-hand smoke, and "denormalization" of the tobacco industry have driven research agendas and shaped public policies concerning cigarette smoking, which annually claims 40,000 lives in Canada. While advancing public health interests, the smoking-as-pathology paradigm largely neglects smoking's cultural dimensions, its role in constructing pleasure, power, self-identity, and social ritual.

Jarrett Rudy's history of smoking in Montreal from the 1880s to the 1940s is guided by cultural questions, namely how "liberal ideas structured the ritual of smoking." Cigarette smoking and female smoking acquired increasing respectability during this period, notably so after the Great War, a cultural transformation occurring in response to economic, social, and political changes. The first chapter, the book's strongest, examines the homosocial context of late 19th-century pipe and cigar smoking. Respectable, bourgeois men refrained from smoking when women were present, while labels like prostitute and moral degenerate were affixed to the small numbers of women smokers. Here masculinity, the public sphere, and respectable smoking co-mingled in ways that reinforced the social power of each concept.

The following chapter examines cultural hierarchy and taste, focusing on cigar connoisseurship and the denigration of *le tabac canadien* and its francophone, just-off-the-farm smokers. Cuban cigars represented the apex of wealth, masculinity, and cultural distinction, while the strong-tasting, Quebec-grown pipe tobacco symbolized hayseed interloper and social inferior. (Henri Bourassa, though, employed the clay pipe as a symbol of French Canadian nationalism.) While Rudy uses terms like "ideology of connoisseurship" and "cultural class formation," he does not draw upon germane theoretical works, like those of Pierre Bourdieu on the interplay of cultural taste and political/social power, that would have heightened this chapter's explanatory power.

The final two chapters discuss the rising popularity of cigarette smoking and the increasing participation of women. This is in part a business story and Rudy provides interesting material on industry leader American Tobacco Company of Canada (Imperial Tobacco after 1912) and its restraint-of-trade distribution practices which provided retailers with much higher profits if they carried only ATCC brands. World War One brought new meanings for the cigarette, as it served as creature comfort for

troops in the trenches; charity-run cigarette drives were common and cigarettes soon became a staple of soldier ration kits, such that one veteran later quipped that it was the “bagpipe and the cigarette”—not U.S. intervention—that had won the war. By war’s end, cigarette smoking had shed its formerly effete image, transformed now into a masculine, even patriotic, pastime for advancing numbers of men. Women also took up the habit, gradually effacing the half-century moral stigma attached to female smoking. This was part of a broad social transformation, Rudy argues, a “new language of mass consumption” which ultimately undermined “manly etiquette.” The Suffrage-era quest for greater female participation in civic life coupled with the availability of affordable, mass produced cigarettes meant that women took up smoking in large numbers, in keeping with their burgeoning roles in the bi-gendered public sphere.

There is much to like in this well-researched and highly readable account, which is the best historical account of the topic in Canada. The analytical framework centered on liberalism, however, seemed porous at times. *Le tabac canadien* represented communal values and social conservatism, representing much

more than a counterpoint to urban liberalism. Rudy notes that Quebec women smoked at high rates, but, given his argument, it would seem incongruous that these women were among the last in Canada to acquire the provincial franchise, trailing most of their compatriots by some twenty years. Class, race, and gender are given serious treatment in this volume. Less so are the cultural processes and forms of meaning-making characterizing smoking’s transformation over the years, the sources for which reside more in cultural anthropology or cultural studies than in social history. With the exception of soldier diary entries, we learn little about the pleasures of cigarette smoking; instead, we learn much more about attempts to suppress the activity by social reformers and the occasional politician. While physiologically addictive, we know now, the rapid growth of cigarette smoking suggests a bevy of individual pleasures and social functions, whose past characteristics and manifestations remain largely untraced.

Daniel J. Robinson
University of Western Ontario

ONTARIO HISTORY

34 Parkview Ave.,
Willowdale, Ontario
M2N 3Y2

Since 1899, *Ontario History* has been devoted to the scholarly investigation of the history of the province of Ontario. Articles cover a wide range of subjects such as politics, intellectual history, First Nations, gender history, business, urban themes, agriculture, archaeology, the military, biography, recreation, architecture, religion, and ethnicity.

For information about subscriptions
or submissions go to:

www.ontariohistoricalsociety.ca