

*Roots of Entanglement: Essays in the History of
Native-Newcomer Relations* edited by Myra Rutherford, Kerry
Abel, and P. Whitney Lackenbauer

Cody Groat

Volume 111, numéro 1, spring 2019

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1059976ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1059976ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

The Ontario Historical Society

ISSN

0030-2953 (imprimé)

2371-4654 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Groat, C. (2019). Compte rendu de [*Roots of Entanglement: Essays in the History of Native-Newcomer Relations* edited by Myra Rutherford, Kerry Abel, and P. Whitney Lackenbauer]. *Ontario History*, 111(1), 113–115.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1059976ar>

pect is an unfortunate limitation to what is otherwise an excellent effort by the author.

In conclusion, Robin Hilborn's *The Bruce* is a wonderful example of a shared initiative between local First Nations and Metis peoples, an historical society, a county museum and archives, area residents and businesses, and a local historian/author. Together, the partners in this collaborative approach have produced an attractive, informative, and very affordable county history book. This specific sample of collectivity should be considered and then adopted as a template for other communities throughout Ontario to use. When embarking on similar projects which are focused on bringing your own unique her-

itage to local residents, and as well as to a broader audience, you should consider this book very appropriate. It should in the future prove to be a successful model for forthcoming local history publications. And once you have read the book, you can see some of the words put into pictures by viewing a one disc (either DVD or Blu-Ray format) of the three episodes on film. This option is also available for purchase from the Bruce County Historical Society. Enjoy both choices!

John C. Carter
Research Associate, History and Classics
Programme, School of Humanities, Uni-
versity of Tasmania.

Roots of Entanglement

Essays in the History of Na- tive-Newcomer Relations

Edited by Myra Rutherfordale, Kerry
Abel, and P. Whitney Lackenbauer

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2018. 449
pages. \$44.95 paper ISBN 9781487521370,
cloth \$95.00 ISBN 9781487501389, \$44.95
Book. (www.utorontopress.com/ca)

Roots of Entanglement: Essays in the History of Native-Newcomer Relations edited by Myra Rutherfordale, Kerry Abel, and P. Whitney Lackenbauer serves as a response by academics to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's call for a more nuanced understanding of the relationships between Indigenous peoples and those who settled in Canada (1). In re-evaluating these relationships, *Roots of Entanglement* builds off of the scholarship of historian J.R. Miller, who is recognized as an important early figure in the writing of



native-newcomer relations and continues with his efforts to emphasize Indigenous agency in the events that shaped Indig-

enous lives (6).

The book is divided into four parts, covering broad themes such as Indigenous-Crown relations and specific pieces of legislation. In every chapter, an emphasis on the role of individuals is maintained, demonstrating that Indigenous actors had their own motivations, political and economic priorities, and cultural knowledge systems that shaped interactions and decision-making processes (9). These chapters also incorporate cultural analysis, asking how events were perceived at the time, and addressing the impact that this had on subsequent research.

After Part One of this book (the introduction), Part Two focuses on the relationship between Indigenous peoples and the Crown through the experiences of viceregal representatives and civil servants, primarily focusing on events in Ontario. Kerry Abel's chapter on John Graves Simcoe discusses the conflicting factors that impacted his perceptions of Indigenous rights, including his obligations to England and Upper Canada, and his need to assure good diplomatic relations with the United States. While demonstrating the factors that influenced Simcoe's decision-making processes, Abel also discusses factors that influenced interactions between Simcoe and Indigenous leaders such as Joseph Brant. Particularly, she comments on Brant's efforts to secure land promised through the Haldimand Proclamation and the logic behind his later efforts to sell parcels of land, challenging notions that Brant acted solely on his own personal interests (35).

The next chapter in this collection, by Donald B. Smith, examines the tenure of Lord Bury as the superintendent general of Indian Affairs and his interactions with the Reverend Peter Jones (Mississauga) (49). Bury was appointed to his role due to social connections in England and

came to Canada with little understanding of Indigenous life. Jones, on the other hand, had an intimate understanding of the Indigenous experience and had often fought against injustices brought about by the Department of Indian Affairs. The two met in 1855 when Jones asked for the right to serve as a western superintendent. It was his belief that a Native working within the system would have a better understanding of the problems that Indigenous people faced (80). Through the life of Peter Jones, Smith successfully demonstrates how Indigenous people understood the colonial system and were actively trying to challenge it based upon their own needs.

The final chapter in Part Two, by Brendan Frederick R. Edwards, discusses the experiences of post-Confederation Governor General Lord Tweedsmuir (John Buchan). Tweedsmuir, a prolific supporter of a Commonwealth identity, also advocated for a strong Canadian nationalism which he felt should be "rooted in Canada's multiplicity of origins," which included Canada's Indigenous past (103). Edwards references Tweedsmuir's novels in the hopes of understanding how he perceived Indigenous peoples, including two novels that he wrote while serving as Governor General. Both works have Indigenous characters who are central to the development of Canadian communities, exceptional when compared to other works of fiction from this time (101).

The next chapter to discuss the experiences of Indigenous peoples in Ontario is in Part Four, which focuses on legislation. A chapter by Frank J. Tough looks at the Ontario Game and Fisheries Act and how this act was enforced in Robinson Treaty territories from 1892 to 1931. This chapter is based on the conflicting jurisdictional roles of provincial and federal governments, specifically relating to the

control of lands and resources and treaty rights promised to Indigenous groups. The dictates of the Ontario Game and Fisheries Act denied Indigenous groups the ability to hunt commercially (only allowing subsistence hunting), failing to consider that commercial hunting had long been a vital part of Indigenous economic systems. While challenged in legal cases, the Ontario Courts were often compliant with the limitations brought about by provincial legislation, which led to a “de facto refashioning” of federal responsibility regarding treaty rights (278).

The conclusion by Alan C. Cairns expresses how the rise of a politicized academic field relating to Indigenous history will often mean that a book “may not be evaluated solely or primarily on its merits as a piece of academic research but in a number of cases it will additionally be viewed through a political lens” (404). As an academic work, *Roots of Entanglement* provides several valuable case studies that show how Indigenous citizens worked within colonial systems to achieve their own objectives, often on their own terms. Cairns is correct that as a work of Indigenous history, other factors should be considered besides content. Therefore, it is

worth noting that this book primarily interprets history through the lives of Euro-Canadian citizens and how they viewed or interacted with Indigenous groups, as opposed to focusing on the perspectives of Indigenous citizens (as told by Indigenous scholars). A stronger balance between these two approaches would provide interesting counterpoints.

Lastly, Cairns includes a problematic statement that implies Euro-Canadian scholars are inherently in a difficult position when writing on Native-newcomer relations due to the rise of identity politics that will find fault in most interpretations (404). Cairns further states that “although the evidence is fragmentary, it appears that there are tacit understandings that Indigenous scholars will not criticize each other,” a generalization that, even if based on ‘fragmentary evidence,’ is highly doubtful (418). Cairns concludes this book with a statement by J.R. Miller that says a balance needs to be met to neither underemphasize Indigenous agency or overemphasize Indigenous victimhood. This collection achieves that goal.

Cody Groat, PhD Candidate
Wilfrid Laurier University

One Hundred Years of Struggle *The History of Women and the Vote in Canada*

By Joan Sangster

Vancouver: UBC Press, 2018. 328 pages. \$22.95 paper ISBN: 9780774835343,
\$27.95 hardcover ISBN: 9780774835336, \$27.95 ePub ISBN: 9780774835367,
\$27.95 PDF ISBN: 9780774835350. (www.ubcpress.ca)

As a historian with a strong feminist education, I thought I already knew a lot about the history of suffrage. Joan Sangster’s engaging text, however, illustrates how much is missing from the

canonized history of women’s suffrage in Canada and disrupts some of the myths that many historians will have learned from older studies. Sangster opens her work with an introduction that highlights