

## **Handcock, Marshall, and Breakwater Books**

Olaf Uwe Janzen

---

Volume 7, numéro 1, spring 1991

URI : [https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/nflds7\\_1re01](https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/nflds7_1re01)

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

---

### Éditeur(s)

Faculty of Arts, Memorial University

### ISSN

1198-8614 (imprimé)

1715-1430 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

---

### Citer ce document

Janzen, O. U. (1991). Handcock, Marshall, and Breakwater Books. *Newfoundland Studies*, 7(1), 65–77.

## REVIEW ARTICLE

# Handcock, Marshall, and Breakwater Books

*So longe as there comes noe women; Origins of English Settlement in Newfoundland.* W. Gordon Handcock. St. John's: Breakwater Books, 1989. 343 p. \$29.95 cloth; \$19.95 paper. *The Beothuk of Newfoundland; A Vanished People.* Ingeborg Marshall. St. John's: Breakwater Books, 1989. 45 p. \$14.95. *Reports and Letters by George Christopher Pulling Relating to the Beothuk Indians of Newfoundland.* Ingeborg Marshall. St. John's: Breakwater Books, 1989. 160 p.

## OLAF UWE JANZEN

IN 1578, A BRISTOL MERCHANT by the name of Anthony Parkhurst wrote a lengthy letter to Richard Hakluyt in which he enthusiastically promoted the colonization of the island of Newfoundland. Parkhurst believed that his scheme would give England control over the fishery and fish trade which, at that time, was dominated by fishermen from other countries like France, Portugal, and Spain. As a merchant-outfitter in the fishery himself, Parkhurst had taken the unusual step of visiting Newfoundland several times; his keen observations and modest experiments in gardening, combined with his conviction that England must occupy the island if it hoped to dominate the fishery, all led him to conclude that the climate, soil, and resources of the island were all conducive to successful and permanent settlement. He assured Hakluyt that "Newfoundland is in a temperate Climate, and not so colde as foolish Mariners doe say ... but up in the land they shall finde it hotter then in England" (Quinn 4:3). Parkhurst supported this observation with reference to his allegedly successful experiments at growing

Wheate, Barlie, Ric, Oates, Beanes, Pease, and seeds of herbes, kernels, Plumstones, nuts, all which prospered as in England. The countrey yeeldeth many good trees of fruit, as Filberds in some places, but in all places Cherie trees, and a kind of Pearetree .... As for Roses, they are as common as brambles here.

Nor was Parkhurst alone in his insistence that Newfoundland could, and should, be settled. Edward Hayes, who accompanied Sir Humphrey Gilbert to Newfoundland in 1583, submitted a detailed account of Newfoundland to William Cecil, Lord Burghley, one of Elizabeth I's senior advisors and a Secretary of State in 1586, in which he extolled the virtues of Newfoundland's climate and resources. Hayes devoted much of his attention to the specific commercial commodities which awaited those who colonized and developed Newfoundland, "such as ... Rosen, Pitche, Tarre, Soape ashes, Deal boordes, Mastes for Shippes, Hempe, Flaxe, Lynnen, Cabells, Cordage, Hydes, Furre" (Quinn 3:131). Thus his appeal was directed more blatantly at the self-interest of potential investors. Nevertheless, Hayes was convinced that year-round settlement was both feasible and potentially profitable for those who sponsored such colonization.

Alas, when colonization attempts were finally undertaken early in the next century, reality proved to be much grimmer than the rosy pictures painted by Parkhurst, Hayes, and other promoters of the idea of colonizing Newfoundland. Time and again, at Cupid's Cove, Aquafort, Renewes, and Ferryland, those who attempted to set up permanent habitation in Newfoundland were defeated by what one such colonizer, Sir George Calvert, lamented as the "sadd face of wynter" which gripped all of Newfoundland between October and May (Cell 296). Europeans had grossly misunderstood the nature of the North American climate generally, and that of Newfoundland in particular. Though sharing the same level of latitude as European countries like England and France, Newfoundland did not share the same moderating influences of ocean currents and wind patterns. The warm temperatures encountered by summer visitors were deceptive; the complex isotherms and chilly ocean currents which define the harsh realities of Newfoundland's icy temperatures throughout the other seasons would not be understood for three centuries (Kupperman 213-17). Exacerbating the difficult climate was the meagreness of Newfoundland's resources on land. The timber and the minerals were there, but would not be commercially exploited until appropriate technologies were developed in later centuries. Agricultural expectations were frustrated by the climate and the thin, acidic soil. As if in compensation for the marginality of the land, there was an abundance of marine resources in the seas surrounding the island. But these had already been profitably exploited for more than a century by the time attempts were made to colonize the land, and efforts at settlement only added to, rather than diminished, the cost of fishing operations. If the fishery could be exploited profitably for only a few months of the year between spring and autumn, what advantage was there in maintaining a year-round presence? From autumn until spring, residents were only a burden. As Cell put it, "settlement could not provide any overwhelming advantage in the exploitation of the fishery. The expenses of collective settlement always exceeded the income gained from

fishing” (58). And so, one by one, the various attempts to colonize Newfoundland were abandoned. Only Ferryland appears to have persisted, in part because the colonists there became completely assimilated into the fishery but also because the colony fell under the control of the Kirke family, whose commercial connections with New England provided the colony with economic linkages that ensured its survival (Pope).

The fate of Ferryland may well be instructive, for Newfoundland’s historiography has long been dominated by a persistent belief that settlement failed because of the unremitting hostility of the West Country interests involved in the migratory fishery. This hypothesis of “retarded settlement” prevailed throughout the nineteenth and much of the twentieth centuries, and has only recently been exposed as a myth (Matthews). Today scholars are more inclined to agree with the statement that “It is highly difficult, perhaps impossible, to identify a specific group of individuals within the [fishing] industry who consistently opposed settlement on the island” (Head 36). There seems little question that people who invested in the fishery and the fish trade were afraid of *unrestricted* growth of a permanent population in Newfoundland; such growth would lead to the introduction of government which, in turn, would subject the fishery to regulations and supervision, something which the fishery had managed to do very nicely — and profitably — without since its inception. But scholars have also begun to recognize that the fishing interests did not object to the appearance of *some* settlement; indeed, they even encouraged it as a means of maintaining and safeguarding facilities, boats, equipment — in short, their investment — in Newfoundland. It was out of the fishery’s increasing need for shore stations and facilities that Newfoundland acquired, and supported, a small permanent population in the seventeenth century. Scholarly studies of communities large and small in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries confirm time and again that commercial and trading patterns were invariably established before permanent communities made their appearance, and in fact were usually responsible for the appearance and growth of such communities (Nemec; Mannion 234-70; Handcock; Janzen). This point is made most forcefully and very thoroughly in Handcock’s *So long as there comes no women: Origins of English Settlement in Newfoundland*.

Several years ago, John Mannion commented on the fact that almost all European immigrants to Newfoundland over the centuries came from just two small areas in southwestern England and southeastern Ireland. Mannion observed that “It is unlikely that any other province or state in contemporary North America drew such an overwhelming proportion of its immigrants from such localized source areas in the European homeland over so substantial a period of time” (7). Now, Handcock has built upon nearly two decades of his own research, as well as that of numerous other geographers, anthropologists, and historians, to present what must surely become the definitive account of

## 68 Janzen

English migration to Newfoundland. Hancock set out to “reconstruct and explain the patterns of migration from (mainly) the southwest and southern regions of England to Newfoundland virtually from their inception in the early seventeenth century, and the related process of settlement formation that followed” (9). In this, he succeeds admirably. Using parish records, newspapers, wills, tombstones, and other sources, he identified about 2,200 English immigrants by their place of origin. He then set about trying to discover what he could about their background and the circumstances surrounding their migration to Newfoundland. Why did they leave England for Newfoundland? Why did they end up in particular destinations in Newfoundland? These questions led him through a variety of documents, including those which must seem obvious (such as the Dartmouth muster rolls) as well as those which may not (the Teignmouth register of seamen’s sixpences). Apprentice indentures, parish registers, and other collections all yielded their little bits of information. Some sources were particularly generous in the data they produced; such would include the Lester-Garland Papers held at the Dorset Record Office, which include diaries, journals, account books, correspondence, and other documents of a merchant family of Poole whose investments and commercial activities in Trinity Bay nurtured the community of Trinity. Eventually, Hancock’s research led him into an assessment of population growth and migration changes within Newfoundland, and of course the formation of communities. But in the process of fulfilling these objectives, Hancock gives us much more. Our understanding of how the fishing industry was organized, how its economic linkages, both forward and backward, functioned, how the fishing industry and the fish trade were intertwined but not necessarily identical, are all enhanced by Hancock’s extremely thorough analysis. For anyone wishing to develop a better understanding of the fishing industry and the fish trade as well as of migration and settlement, *So longe as there comes noe women* will be essential reading.

The organization of the book reflects Hancock’s objectives. Thirteen chapters are grouped in five parts. The first of these provides a discussion of the migratory fishery’s organization during the seventeenth century, when permanent settlement began to make its appearance. Particular attention is given to the various kinds of migrant labourers who made their way from the British Isles to Newfoundland and back every year; the seasonal ship fishery, the byeboat fishery, the growing practice of both to employ seasonal Irish labour, all must be explained in order to set the stage for the appearance of growing numbers of “inhabitant boatkeepers.” Special attention is given to the “servants,” contract employees who worked not only within the ship fishery but also the byeboat and inhabitant fisheries. “Servitude,” Hancock insists, “was a prerequisite to becoming a seaman, a fisherman, and, most importantly, a boat master or a planter, and to the making of an immigrant” (28).

The permanence of the residents was never absolute; there was constant movement between the various categories of fishermen. Not only did the numbers of resident fishermen fluctuate substantially but, where the records provide them, so did the names. True permanence, in the sense of a person who came to Newfoundland or was born here and remained for the rest of his or her life, developed only as the number of women within the resident population grew. Women were the "all-essential ingredient for an inhabitant population with a self-perpetuating capacity" (31); hence the significance of the title to Handcock's book. Significantly, Handcock prefers not to measure the size of the permanent population simply by accepting the number of "inhabitants" recorded by the various censuses. Rather, he employs a formula which focuses on the number of women and children; these, he maintains, are a more reliable "index of permanence" than the simple category of "inhabitant" (95-8). Though the stability and growth of a resident population depended on many things, including the security provided when sources of provisions and outlets for trade became more diversified late in the seventeenth century, Handcock's analysis of the development of a gender balance within the permanent population of Newfoundland is one of the important contributions made by his book.

The second part of the book examines the process whereby fishing stations were transformed during the eighteenth century into fishing communities. Of necessity, this required further discussion of developments within the several varieties of fisheries at Newfoundland, as well as of migration patterns. Though men still outnumbered women by more than two to one in 1830, this represented a remarkable departure from the situation in 1677, when women made up only twelve per cent of the permanent population. Inevitably, perhaps, some areas in Newfoundland experienced greater "development" than others, and Handcock sets out to explain why. He measures continuity and permanence by tracing the surnames of those who owned property. Trinity Bay and Conception Bay are revealed as having much greater continuity than peripheral areas such as Bonavista Bay (107). Considerable continuity is also evident in the small harbours near St. John's, such as Petty Harbour, but not St. John's itself. Factors which contribute to growth and development appear to have been soil quality, forest resources, and of course suitability for fishing. As settlements grew, they also became socially and economically more diverse; hierarchies appeared, not only within particular communities but also between communities. Handcock assigns a formative role to the merchants in these processes:

the real and sustained impetus for the emergence of Trinity as a centre of commercial and trade activity came with decisions by a succession of Poole entrepreneurs to make use of the harbour to build stores, warehouses, wharves, dwellings, and other structures and to use the harbour for receiving incoming supply ships, bank fishing ships, and for transshipping cod, oil, salmon, furs, and timber.

## 70 *Janzen*

Several areas of social and economic growth developed at Newfoundland, usually identified with one of the larger bays. Thus Placentia, Trinity, and Conception bays were all separate and distinct social and economic regions, each with its own economic linkages with England. The implications for the nineteenth and twentieth centuries were profound. Newfoundland emerged from the eighteenth century as a collection of social and economic fragments, lacking any collective sense on which a political or national culture could be based. Though a strong sense of Newfoundland culture and identity exists today, this is a relatively recent phenomenon by North American standards.

Handcock focuses on the British sources of migration in the third part of his book. Who came, where they came from, why they came, and how they came are questions addressed in these chapters. Handcock challenges the traditional view that most migrants came from coastal communities. His research shows clearly that recruits for the fisheries came from communities deep within the English West Country, responding to the opportunity of seasonal employment in Newfoundland which would bring them back to England for the fall and winter. The recruiting procedures, the role of country fairs, the role which the character of the local economies played in encouraging this seasonal round of employment, all are described and provide a wider appreciation of the degree to which developments in Newfoundland were often governed by conditions thousands of miles away, in England. The analysis continues into the fourth part of the book, in which the role of the merchant and merchant networks is developed. The merchants also played a key role in nurturing settlement in Newfoundland through the system of credit known as the "truck" system. The final part defines the migration channels, the specific pathways followed by migrants. These were shaped not simply by opportunities in Newfoundland but also by the fact that later migrants from a particular community or region would gravitate to those parts of Newfoundland where previous migrants from that community had settled. Throughout, we are constantly reminded that the relationship between the inhabitants and the fisheries was not antipathetic; quite the reverse. The fishery was the mechanism and the reason for settlement in Newfoundland, and "merchants continued to be the main pivots in the migration system" (277). This is not to say that the relationship was not exploitative; it was. A recent economic study revealed that Newfoundland's per capita export earnings in 1770 were "in the probable range of 12-15 pounds sterling" (Shepherd 98). Of all the British North American colonies, this was by far the highest; the next highest figure belonged to South Carolina, whose per capita figures ranged from 3 1/2 to 4 pounds sterling. Those earnings did not remain in Newfoundland but flowed instead back to the British Isles, with the result that virtually no economic development occurred here despite the wealth generated by the cod fishery. Nevertheless, had it not been for the merchants, it is unlikely that there would have been nearly as much settlement in Newfoundland as there was by 1830.

Handcock's book is not without a few flaws. He asserts twice (74, 92) that Newfoundland became a colony in 1832 (in my view, the correct date is 1825), and at times it is difficult to ignore the many typographical errors. However, the careful analysis is enhanced by a narrative style which makes the book not only thorough and convincing, but a fascinating story. It is supported by a large number of maps, tables, and figures which complement the analysis very well without getting in the way of the story. Yet as thorough as Handcock's discussion of English migration to Newfoundland is, the story of permanent settlement here is not complete. Irish migration to Newfoundland, which Handcock touches upon frequently but which, as his subtitle makes clear, is not his focus, needs to be given a similar treatment. There also remains a great deal left to learn about how Newfoundland's resident population managed to survive. Remember Parkhurst's enthusiasms and the fate of the early colonies! Life in Newfoundland was profoundly difficult, and those who chose to settle here permanently had to respond to a hard challenge. Handcock makes clear that the ability of people to live here year-round depended on their ability to exploit every available resource and economic opportunity. The cod-fishery may have been the mainstay of the island economy, but it did not function for twelve months of the year. The credit system was not a system of ruthless exploitation, as was once believed, but a valuable mechanism by which the merchant's access to fish became more reliable and the planters secured their survival through the winter. Handcock describes this relationship (137, 232-3) but does little to explain its origins or intricacies. Scholars are only beginning to turn their attention to the truck system, and much work remains to be done before we can understand it fully (Crowley; Ommer). Similarly, while Handcock touches upon the role of New England merchants in the migration history of Newfoundland, he is primarily interested in the way in which New England traders encouraged *out*-migration (29-31). Yet at least one authority on the British American economy before 1789 asserts that "The progressive transformation of Newfoundland from the seasonal base of English West Country fishermen into a colony of settled communities involved the forging of an economic linkage with the mainland colonies" (McCusker and Menard 114). Of at least equal, if not greater, importance in the development of permanent inhabitancy in Newfoundland was the practice of winterhousing. This involved the practice of entire communities abandoning their coastal settlements each fall and dispersing into the shelter of the woods in small family groups. There they lived, close to supplies of game, wood, and other essentials until spring. Handcock recognizes the importance of such opportunities in explaining population growth in Conception and Trinity bays, but his treatment is incidental to his main focus on migration patterns.

The practice of winterhousing has received its most thorough treatment from Philip E.L. Smith, an anthropologist at the University of Montreal.



Anticipating what must seem a logical conclusion, Smith emphasized that winterhousing was not a custom which Europeans adopted in imitation of Newfoundland's aboriginal people, the Beothuk, for there was no contact between the Beothuk and the Europeans before the practice of winterhousing developed. Rather, the practice must have been independently developed. If so, then it was a remarkable demonstration of independent invention, for apart from the winterhousing Europeans, the only other people to develop the ability to survive year-round in Newfoundland were the Beothuk — and they lacked the "safety net" of imported provisions and supplies that the truck system made possible. Two recent works which give us a hint at how difficult survival could be without full utilization of the marine resources, and without integration into an international marketing system that enabled European planters to convert local resources into other necessities, are *Reports and Letters by George Christopher Pulling Relating to the Beothuk Indians of Newfoundland* and *The Beothuk of Newfoundland: A Vanished People*, both by Ingeborg C.L. Marshall.

For years, our best single source of information about the Beothuks has been James P. Howley's *The Beothucks or Red Indians* (1915), available today in an inexpensive reprint edition. Howley's book compiled all that was then known about this now-vanished culture, reprinting documents from the fifteenth to the nineteenth centuries. It was a wonderful book, for the documentation left each reader free to interpret the data and draw independent conclusions about the Beothuk. Sadly, and despite this treasure-trove of information, the story of the Beothuk became encrusted with legends, myths, and falsehoods which, in their simplest form, declared that the Beothuk had been hunted and massacred into extinction by Europeans, all in the name of "sport." While there were undeniably tragic and brutal events, including murder, the ability to separate truth from sensational fiction became increasingly difficult. Only recently have such tales been exposed and denounced (Rowe; Upton). Scholars such as Marshall and Ralph Pastore now focus on the nature of Beothuk culture and how that culture, combined with Newfoundland's insular character and narrow range of resources, limited the ability of the Beothuk to adapt to rapidly changing circumstances as Europeans arrived and settled on the island. Marshall's two books under review contribute to that process.

The Beothuk were a hunter-gathering people, few in number (Upton estimated a maximum population of 2,000, a figure which was probably generous and which few would challenge except to revise the figure downward), and dependent for survival on an annual cycle of movement which took them to many parts of the island in search of seasonally-available plants and game. The limited variety of food resources inland meant that access to coastal marine food resources was essential for Beothuk well-being. Thus when Europeans appeared and the Beothuk chose to withdraw from the coast, they were also undermining their food-gathering cycle. As Europeans spread, the

Beothuk continued to retreat inland, further reducing their range and unwittingly weakening their ability to survive. Though they lingered as a culture until the early nineteenth century, they probably already lacked the numbers by the mid- to late eighteenth century to sustain that culture. Had the Beothuk developed an economic role which would have encouraged the Europeans to view them with something more than indifference, perhaps the Beothuk might have survived. But insofar as a furring "industry" developed, it was prosecuted by the Europeans, often as part of their winterhousing routine; unlike elsewhere in North America, the Beothuk were economically irrelevant to Europeans in Newfoundland. Tuberculosis and malnutrition and, yes, some cases of fatal encounters with Europeans, ultimately decided their fate.

Of Marshall's two books, *A Vanished People* was written for a young readership; it is really a children's book, with simple language and lots of pictures. Yet older readers can profit from the book as well, for it conveys to the general public as no scholarly work can the marvellous diversity and sophistication of Beothuk material and spiritual culture that enabled them to survive in Newfoundland. The book provides some background on Newfoundland's aboriginal history before the Beothuk, it explains their relation to other North American native peoples, and it proceeds to describe, with rich illustrations, what everyday Beothuk life might have been like. Marshall is an anthropologist who brings years of research and a familiarity with the archaeological evidence to bear on this process. If there is a disappointment, it is that the book is little different than its forerunner, *The Red Ochre People* (1977). Readers who already have a copy of this earlier book should be cautioned against buying the new publication; there is not enough difference between the two to justify the purchase.

*Reports and Letters* is a different kind of book altogether. Pulling was a junior naval officer who, in the peacetime world of 1792, was "on the beach", on half-pay and without a command. He was therefore looking for ways and means to attract a patron, a job, and ideally both. A few years earlier, in 1785, he had served briefly in Newfoundland where he first learned about the elusive Beothuk Indians. He would also have known that the government was sufficiently concerned by the sporadic violence between resident fishermen and the Beothuk to have expressed a desire to establish peaceful relations with the Indians. He had therefore submitted a proposal in 1786 to send a naval vessel to the mouth of the Exploits River, with himself in command and with the civil powers of the governor's surrogate to restore order there. However, this initiative received no encouragement. By 1792, he was employed on a merchant ship belonging to Benjamin Lester, a merchant of Poole with extensive commercial dealings and establishments in Trinity, and whose investments to the north would have been made more secure through the establishment of better relations there with the Beothuk. Pulling conducted extensive surveys of

the residents at Greenspond, Fogo, and the Bay of Exploits. This testimony was compiled into a Preliminary Report which he submitted to Chief Justice John Reeves and which found its way into the hands of Governor Waldegrave and eventually into the papers of Lord Liverpool, President at that time of the Council for Trade and Plantation. A final report later came before a Parliamentary Committee in 1793 which was investigating the state of trade at Newfoundland. Both reports are reprinted here, and their similarities and differences noted. They contain a great many accounts of encounters between the resident fishermen and the Beothuk, including a number that were brutal and violent. The book should therefore be viewed as a complementary piece to the extensive documentation contained in Howley's book, and as such makes available to scholars as well as to the general public a valuable source of information on late eighteenth century Newfoundland and the state of Beothuk-European relations.

It seems a shame, therefore, to note as well that the value of the book is so badly undermined by Marshall's attempts to tell us something about Pulling and to place his activities in some kind of context. Marshall's skills as an anthropologist do not serve her well as an historian. Statements such as "Pulling was sent to sea as an able seaman — a standard route into the officers' ranks in the eighteenth century" (9) and "[Pulling] was captain of *Sea Fencibles* at Bristol in 1807 and 1809" (11) reveal a profound unfamiliarity with the eighteenth century world of the Royal Navy. The rank of midshipman was the first step in the process of becoming an officer; the *Sea Fencibles* was not a ship, as the wording of Marshall's statement implies, but a unit of the marines whose command usually went to sea officers as a form of patronage or reward. This unfamiliarity with the world of the eighteenth century Royal Navy and, indeed, of eighteenth century society generally, leads Marshall to some questionable interpretations concerning Pulling's service in Newfoundland. This service began in 1786 when the frigate *Thisbe* on which he was serving visited Newfoundland. There Pulling first heard about the Beothuk, and particularly about the friction between the Beothuk and the resident fishermen in Notre Dame Bay. Within a year, Pulling had submitted a proposal that he be placed in command of a small vessel and be given the civil powers of a governor's surrogate to restore order in the region. Marshall regards this as evidence that Pulling had become "concerned for the survival of the Indians," and that his proposal eventually "bore fruit" in 1792 when he "was commissioned to make a proper investigation of relations between settlers and Indians in Newfoundland" (10). This thread of continuity is extremely tenuous and entirely circumstantial. There is no evidence that Pulling's 1786 proposal had any impact on government. Instead, it seems obvious that here was a young and ambitious officer, looking for any opportunity which could lead to promotion from midshipman to lieutenant. He was looking for a command, not

justice for the Indians. For Pulling, the Beothuk were a means to an end, not an end in themselves. Nor should Pulling be condemned for this; that was how the eighteenth century world of the naval officer worked.

As for Marshall's contention that Pulling was directed back to Newfoundland in 1792 by an agency of the government, this is an even weaker interpretation of the evidence. Towards this end, Marshall insists, Pulling was "Granted leave on half pay" and "joined the merchant service in Newfoundland" (10). Marshall supports her claim that Pulling "was requested to enquire into relations between the resident population and the Indians" (19) by reference to Pulling's service record, which she duplicates in an appendix (44), yet that record makes no mention of any such commission. Marshall then lamely adds that, while the official warrant for this commission has not been found (because it does not exist!), "it is assumed that it was issued by the Admiralty" because Pulling's conclusions took the form of a report and because it was not uncommon for officers to be asked to undertake "intelligence" tasks of this kind. True, this was not an uncommon practice in that day and age. But the Admiralty would have appointed a serving officer for so delicate a mission, not a junior lieutenant on half pay! In fact, being on half pay was an all-too-common fate for junior officers in peacetime, when the Royal Navy had no need for their services. Pulling's situation was therefore the rule, not the exception, and his entry into merchant service suggests how desperate he was for employment. Even more so than his 1786 proposal, Pulling's Preliminary Report to Chief Justice Reeves in 1792 was entirely the product of his own initiative and ambition, not the end result of a commission from the government. While Marshall's *Reports and Letters* have their value as a primary source which complements those found in Howley's book, the student of eighteenth century Newfoundland history should steer clear of Marshall's explanation of how these documents came to be compiled. Finally, I cannot help but question the decision to include both a photoduplicate of the original documents and Marshall's transcriptions. This adds unnecessarily to the bulk of the book and to its cost to the buyer. Surely the transcriptions alone would have sufficed.

In the final analysis, all three offerings from Breakwater Press have something to offer to those of us who are anxious to understand better the conditions and limitations governing the ability and desire of people to live permanently year-round in Newfoundland. Yet the books are highly uneven in their originality and scholarship. Handcock's study is undoubtedly the best of the lot, and promises to become a mainstay of courses on Newfoundland history and historical geography for years to come. Marshall's books both have value in a limited way, but fail to measure up to the promise of their author's expertise. *The Beothuk of Newfoundland* adds little that is new to our perception of that vanished culture, while the collection of Pulling manuscripts is weakened by a

## 76 Janzen

questionable treatment of the circumstances surrounding the appearance of the original *Reports and Letters*. Both of Marshall's books would have benefitted had they been subjected to rigorous scrutiny by informed readers before publication. Though the publisher is to be commended for its efforts to expand the horizons of our understanding of Newfoundland history, Breakwater Press has yet to convince me that it has hit upon a formula for producing works on that history that are of a consistent high quality.

### References

- Cell, Gillian, ed. *Newfoundland Discovered: English Attempts at Colonization, 1610-1630*. London: The Hakluyt Society, 1982.
- Crowley, John E. "Empire versus Truck: The Official Interpretation of Debt and Labour in the Eighteenth-Century Newfoundland Fishery." *Canadian Historical Review* 70, 3 (1989): 311-36.
- Handcock, W. Gordon. "English Migration to Newfoundland." In J. Mannion, ed., *The Peopling of Newfoundland*, which see. 15-48.
- Head, C. Grant. *Eighteenth Century Newfoundland; A Geographer's Perspective*. Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1976.
- Howley, James P. *The Beothucks or Red Indians: The Aboriginal Inhabitants of Newfoundland*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1915; rpt. Toronto: Coles Publishing Co., 1974.
- Janzen, Olaf. "'Une Grande Liaison': French Fishermen from Ile Royale on the Coast of Southwestern Newfoundland, 1714-1766 — A Preliminary Survey." *Newfoundland Studies* 3, 2 (1987): 183-200.
- Kupperman, Karen Ordahl. "Fear of Hot Climates in the Anglo-American Colonial Experience." *William & Mary Quarterly*, 3rd ser. 41, 2 (1984): 213-40.
- Mannion, John, ed. *The Peopling of Newfoundland*. St. John's: Memorial Univ. of Nfld., Institute of Social and Economic Research, 1977.
- Marshall, Ingeborg. "Disease as a Factor in the Demise of the Beothuck Indians." *Culture* 1, 1 (1981): 71-7.
- . "Beothuck and Micmac: Re-examining Relationships." *Acadiensis* 17, 2 (1988): 52-82.
- Matthews, Keith. "Historical Fence Building: A Critique of the Historiography of Newfoundland." *Newfoundland Quarterly* 74, 3 (1973): 21-30.
- McCusker, John J., and Russell R. Menard. *The Economy of British America, 1607-1789*. Chapel Hill: Univ. of North Carolina Press, 1985.
- Nemec, Thomas F. "Trepassey, 1505-1840 A.D.: An Ethnohistorical Reconstruction of Anglo-Irish Outport Society." *Newfoundland Quarterly* 69, 3 (1973): 17-28.
- Ommer, Rosemary, ed. *Merchant Credit and Labour Strategies in Historical Perspective*. Fredericton: Acadiensis Press, 1990.
- Pastore, Ralph. "Fishermen, furriers and Beothuks: the economy of extinction." *Man in the Northeast* 33: 47-62.
- . "The Collapse of the Beothuk World." *Acadiensis* 19, 1 (1989): 52-71.
- Pope, Peter. "The Kirke family and their connections: History and archaeology of Ferryland (1630-1680)." Address to the Newfoundland Historical Society, January 17, 1990.
- Quinn, David B., ed. *New American World; A Documentary History of North America to 1612*. 5 vols. New York, Arno Press, 1979.
- Rowe, Frederick. *Extinction — The Beothuks of Newfoundland*. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1977.

## *Handcock and Marshall 77*

- Shepherd, James F. "Staples and Eighteenth-Century Canadian Development: The Case of Newfoundland." In Roger L. Ransom, Richard Sutch, and Gary M. Walton, eds., *Explorations in the New Economic History: Essays in Honor of Douglass C. North*. New York: Academic Press, 1982.
- Smith, Philip E. L. "In Winter Quarters." *Newfoundland Studies* 3, 1(1987): 1-36.
- . "Transhumant Europeans Overseas: The Newfoundland Case." *Current Anthropology* 28, 2 (1987): 241-50.
- Upton, Leslie F. S. "The Extermination of the Beothucks of Newfoundland." *Canadian Historical Review* 58, 2 (1977): 133-53.
- . "The Beothucks: Questions and Answers." *Acadiensis* 7, 2 (1978): 150-55.