

Highland Heritage: Scottish Americans in the American South.
By Celeste RAY. (Chapel Hill and London, University of North Carolina Press, 2001, 256 p., ISBN 0-8078-4913-8)

Heather Sparling

Volume 23, numéro 2, 2001

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1087943ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1087943ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Association Canadienne d'Ethnologie et de Folklore

ISSN

1481-5974 (imprimé)

1708-0401 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Sparling, H. (2001). Compte rendu de [*Highland Heritage: Scottish Americans in the American South*. By Celeste RAY. (Chapel Hill and London, University of North Carolina Press, 2001, 256 p., ISBN 0-8078-4913-8)]. *Ethnologies*, 23(2), 174–178. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1087943ar>

Rosenberg points out in the chapter "Community", the bluegrass community is reborn at each event.

Fourth, the book gives a great deal of pleasure. I've put this last, but certainly for most readers this will be the book's primary function. Rosenberg's prose is lucid and interesting, and Fleischhauer's photos are rich and delightful. Readership is an interesting question, of course. For better or worse, I assume, fans will be the book's primary audience. At U.S. \$35.00, this is not an expensive hardcover photographic anthology, but will it be in their budgets? Will they care to have this one scribbled over like a high school yearbook?

Fleischhauer's "Afterword" seems to me to offer valuable information to beginner or intermediate photographers, as well as insights into his own experiences. One comment in particular caught my eye: "My increasing use of wide-angle photography marked my growing interest in context". Magazine editors want performance shots, of which there are plenty here; stars sell. But an important aspect of the book's concern is the context in which this intense music is performed, so in addition to the stage and backstage, we get fascinating shots of radio broadcasts from electronics repair shops, performances in tacky bars and cafes, jam sessions in barber shops, gas stations, and, of course, parking lots, as well as kibbitzing, dealing, and camaraderie.

George W. Lyon
Mount Royal College
Calgary, Alberta

Highland Heritage: Scottish Americans in the American South. By Celeste RAY. (Chapel Hill and London, University of North Carolina Press, 2001, 256 p., ISBN 0-8078-4913-8)

Written in a straightforward and compelling style, *Highland Heritage* explores Scottish-American identity and heritage in the Southern United States, focusing on how traditions are created and re-created to suit particular needs. Chapter One, like all of the book's chapters, begins with a snapshot of a contemporary Scottish-American heritage celebration:

Swathed in the tartans of their clans, a procession of men declare their clan's presence and hurl their torches on a central bonfire. Their brief

and moving pronouncements of clan history and reputation, of battles fought and clansmen lost, elicit war cries and applause from the crowd. Well into the night, singing and storytelling relate the legendary demise of these same clans after the 1746 defeat of Charles Edward Stuart's Jacobite Rising. Men and women of all ages softly weep for the poignancy of the moment and for shared memories of that ancestral experience.

My first reaction was incredulity: wasn't this kind of "hokey" for lack of a better term? Ray admits that her peers at the University of Edinburgh often found her research subject laughable: "Several students in the university's Highland Society told me they would never consider going to Highland Games because either they were 'real Highlanders', or they considered games a tourist event 'with no meaning anymore'" (p. 111).

Ray, however, consistently treats Scottish-American culture with respect. She carefully explains that even when demonstrating how a ritual believed to be a centuries old Scottish custom is actually of recent American creation, she does so not to discredit Scottish American heritage culture, but simply to demonstrate the process through which identity constantly changes and is renegotiated. In fact, she is so regular in her assertions that she does not mean to judge Scottish American heritage harshly that the text occasionally becomes a little too apologetic.

The "Preface", as one would expect, outlines Ray's primary theoretical approaches and methodologies. After a brief historical background, she focuses on heritage, the interpretation of history, the flexibility of memory, shared identity, ethnicity and race, and multiculturalism. She concludes by discussing other scholars' work on "invented traditions". Ray continuously explores the invented origins of a number of Scottish American traditions, although she is adamant that their "inventedness" makes them no less worthy of study than more "authentic" traditions:

Later twentieth-century works on tradition have primarily, and somewhat gleefully, deconstructed its contrivance (Hobsbawm and Ranger 1983; Dorst 1989; Hewison 1983). This work instead focuses on the process and uses of fictionalizing history and on community formation through new rituals that are instilled with implied continuity from the past. Rather than invention, I trace the selection and reworking of tradition within the heritage movement ? not to critique the validity or falsity of celebration and heritage lore, but to

emphasize origins as a way of understanding to what the selection of tradition may be a response (p.16).

Ray's movement from simply recognizing that traditions are "invented" towards seeking *why* and *how* traditions are invented is a powerful part of her overall respectful treatment of Scottish Americans.

In terms of her ethnographic methodology, Ray circulated chapter drafts amongst her consultants for feedback. The book's intended audience is as much her consultants as anyone else. I was therefore disappointed that individual consultants didn't have a stronger presence in the text. In fact, I would be very interested to hear more about Ray's relationships with particular consultants. The few times that Ray reveals detailed, personal experiences are engrossing. Such details would also help the reader to better sense where disjunctures are within the community, as well as shared beliefs.

In Chapter One, "Highlandism and Scottish Identity", Ray explains how romanticized Highland culture, originally distinct from Lowland and Scots-Irish culture, came to represent "Scottishness" for everyone of Scottish descent. "Scottish Heritage and Revival in North Carolina", the next chapter, describes significant Scottish heritage events, such as the Kirkin' o' the Tartan (a ritual blessing of clan tartan originating in the States), St. Andrew's Society dinners, and the Grandfather Mountain Highland Games. Ray demonstrates how traditions once distinct in Scotland have become blended in Scottish-American heritage revivals in North Carolina. For example, Highlanders and Lowlanders once had opposing religious beliefs and fought on opposing sides during the Jacobite rebellion of 1745-6, but aspects of both Highland and Lowland culture have become blended in Scottish heritage celebrations in the US.

The North Carolinian understanding of kinship in Scottish-American heritage celebrations underlies much of Ray's book and is the particular focus of the third chapter, "Kith and Clan in the Scottish-American Community". Ray explains that Scottish heritage groups are imagined communities defined by a belief in biological relations amongst everyone belonging to a particular clan (generally identified by a common last name). Ray also touches on gender imbalances found in Scottish-American heritage celebrations: men hold the most important positions within clan societies, have the more elaborate attire, and

compete in the more significant events. Women are restricted to competing in rather patronizing events such as “tossing the broomstick”.

The subject of Chapter Four is “Scottish Highland Games and Gatherings”, which are a “temporary face-to-face expression of an imagined community in America” (p. 117). Games events are described, including how they have been revised and how new events have been added (always with the patina of “tradition” and “authenticity”).

The importance of place is the subject of Chapter Five, “Heritage Pilgrimage and a Sense for Scottish Places”, in which Ray explains the importance of trips to Scotland, heritage centres, clan lands, and choice of locale for American Highland Games. Travel to Scotland is as much about time as about space: “it is not the Scottish culture of today that heritage tourists come to experience, but the culture of their ancestors” (p. 132). Place names are as important as surnames and clan membership; place names are significant to clan lore, heritage lore, and the naming of new heritage sites in America.

“Warrior Scots”, Chapter Six, depicts the militaristic theme constantly present in Scottish American heritage events. Battles are re-enacted; men collect, display, and wear weapons; and visits to significant battle sites are the heart of any pilgrimage to Scotland. Parallels are drawn between the Civil War and the Jacobite Rebellions. In fact, Ray suggests that Southern Americans find Highland Scottish heritage so appealing since both their Southern and Scottish identities are rooted in defeat (the Civil War and the Battle of Culloden, respectively), a connection she fleshes out in Chapter Seven, “Scottish Heritage, Southern Style”. The unsavoury aspects of both Highland chiefs and Southern plantation owners are erased in favour of a more appealing picture of the noble warrior and southern gentleman.

Ray’s text isn’t revolutionary in terms of anthropological theory, and I was left wanting an explicit definition of “heritage” versus “tradition” or “culture”. However, her development of “invented tradition” theory, her accessible writing style (and its ethnographic implications), her exploration of the significance of place, the connections she makes between the secular and the sacred, and her emphasis on transnational influences are all compelling reasons to read her book. Although *Highland Heritage* will clearly appeal most to those studying Scottish culture (whether North American or British), Ray’s text has a broader appeal through its struggle to grapple with invented

traditions, kinship relations, tourism, and community. If none of those themes has any particular appeal, it's still worth reading due to its narrativic skill and fascinating subject.

Heather Sparling
York University
Toronto, Ontario

From Chantre to Djak: Cantorial Traditions in Canada. By Robert B. KLYMASZ (ed.), (Ottawa, Canadian Museum of Civilization, 2000, viii + 185 p.; Mercury Series, Canadian Centre for Folk Culture Series Paper 73, ISBN 0-6600-17834-6)

This collection of essays attempts to answer, in various fashions, two interrelated yet distinct questions: what is the role and significance of music in worship, and what is the relationship between the singer, the song, and the act of singing? The former is a theological question (in the loosest sense of the word): the latter is a question present in any discussion of performance. In a study of cantorial traditions, the two are combined and, ultimately, inseparable.

Within the traditions represented in the collection "Ukrainian Orthodox, Ukrainian Catholic, Roman Catholic, Anglican, and Orthodox, Conservative, and Reformed Judaism", the cantor holds an ambiguous position within his (it is overwhelmingly, although not exhaustively, a male tradition) faith community. A cantor is not liturgically necessary: rather, he is *prima inter pares* of a congregation or, using the Hebrew formulation, the *shli'akh tzibur*, the "messenger of the gathering". He is a congregant, not a celebrant.

Both Claudette Berthiaume-Zavada, in her ethnomusicological analysis of the cantor Iwan Semenovich Kozachok, "Au-delà de la tradition: Rôle et fonction d'un chantre dans la survie d'une église à Montréal", and Joseph Roll, in his autobiographical essay "Becoming a Cantor", write of the extensive training available for cantors in both the Ukrainian Catholic and Ukrainian Orthodox churches. But Roll's essay points at a further facet beyond training: that the cantor, as representative of the congregation and not of the liturgical offices, straddles the line between the two: "A cantor is a visible sign coming from a parish of its affiliation, attachment, and participation in a larger ecclesiastical community. The communal expression of liturgy, music,